...(Interruptions)....Shri Jibon Roy, you cannot raise that matter in the House. I can look at it. The Chairman has not permitted it because a matter regarding reporting is not raised on the floor of the House. I will look into it. *...(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JIBON ROY(West Bengal) : The word *has been used against the Opposition. Is it permissible or not permissible? *...(Interruptions)*....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not permissible. I was not in the Chair, otherwise I would have given my comments immediately. Now, you have brought it to my notice. I will look into it and I will remove it. Is it okay?

Now, we will take up the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address. I request Dr. L.M. Singhvi to move the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address.

MOTION OF THANKS ON PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS

DR. L.M. SINGHVI (Rajasthan): Sir, I beg to move:

That an Address be presented to the President in the following terms:-

> "That the Members of the Rajya Sabha assembled in this Session are deeply grateful to the President for the Address which he has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on February 17, 2003."

उपसभापति महोदया, May I say what an honour and a privilege and it is to move the Motion of Thanks to the President of India for his Address. The Joint Session of the two Houses of Parliament is a defining annual Parliamentary event, which marks the commencement of the First Session of each year. It is rooted in centuries of colourful evolution in the Westminster,

---

* Not recorded.

but, the occasion is also provided for in Article 87 of the Constitution of India.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. L.M. Singhvi, I would like you to come to the front bench, if it does not disturb you, because, it is an important speech. You are initiating the debate. *(Interruptions)* Time is no problem. Don't worry about the time. *(Interruptions)*

श्री सुरेश पचौरी (मध्य प्रदेश): वह तो आगे की सीट मिल ही जानी थी, क्योंकि मंत्री बन जाना था ।

DR. L.M. SINGHVI: Madam, it is a great privilege and a heart warning honour to move the Motion of Thanks to the President of India for his Address. The Joint Session of the two Houses of Parliament is a definining annual parliamentary event, which marks the commencement of the First Session of each year, so very colourfully. It is rooted in centuries of colourful evolution in the Westminster. But, the occasion is provided for in Article 87 of the Constitution of India, which enjoins on the President to address both Houses of Parliament, assembled together, and inform the Parliament of the causes of its summons. Article 87(2) provides that the Parliament shall discuss the matters referred to in the President's Address, and perhaps, taken strictly, it entitles us only to discuss what is referred to in the Address of the President. But, in practice, we appear to be quite oblivious of that limitation, as the various amendments to the Motion of Thanks, year after year, testify. Now, we do discuss the Motion of Thanks, and when we discuss it, what is mentioned in the Address, is discussed; all that is not mentioned in the Address, is discussed; and what should have been mentioned, is also discussed. We may discuss intentions, as well as omissions and commissions. What makes these discussions, therefore, is a seamless web, generality of the nature of our discussions, which provides a sprawling playground of issues and matters.

The Joint Session of the two Houses of Parliament, Madam, is conventionally the only occasion when the President is in Parliament. The President's Address is a substantive document this year, and it is, I think, a happy balancesheet as well as a promising blueprint. Every paragraph of it is pregnant with ideas, with achievements, and with promises. It reflects an inclusive and an integrated approach, a vision and mission of India, and we ought to forge a broad-based national movement. Let us demonstrate that

the Parliament is not a mere talking shop, and a debating club, but that the Parliament is the national forum of our conscience and our consensus.

While I welcome the wide and comprehensive range of issues and proposals covered in the Address, I would like to suggest to the Presiding Officers, to the Leader of the House and to the Leader of the Opposition that the occasion should, perhaps, be redesigned. I am confident that we can count on our Presiding Officers and the leaders of the parties to work out a solution so as to avoid prolonged tedium, which detracts us from the solemnity of the occasion, and which causes some discomfort.

From the opening and closing paragraphs in the Address, Madam, there are 77 substantive paragraphs, each one of which is a nugget of precious metal, if I may change the metaphor, each one of them is pregnant with a promise. The President's tribute to Kalpana Chawla and her six fellow astronauts touched our hearts. Kalpana's indomitable courage and determination was an Indian diasporian accomplishment, which made us proud, and which made us hold our heads high, a triumph of Indian grit and gusto, a triumph of strength and endurance. True to her name, Kalpana was, as the Address puts it, a citizen of the Milky Way, and she will remain always enshrined in our memory as a source of inspiration and pride for all *Bharatvanshis* and *Bharatvasis*, a term which has been happily used by the President in his Address, and a term which I had the privilege to coin 40 years ago. The Prime Minister graciously announced that the *Metsat* series of satellites would be named after Kalpana Chawla as Mother India's affectionate homage to her, and I welcome that announcement as a matter of national celebration of the saga of her life. I am also glad the President's Address makes a mention of the Government's consistent efforts to nurture a close relationship with the overseas global Indian family, which Kalpana Chawla made proud.

The *Pravasi Bharatiya Divas* and the Conference as well as the *Samman* will long be remembered, but I hope the Government will take follow-up steps to implement some 160 recommendations which the High Level Committee, of which I had the honour to be the Chairman, had made in respect of every walk of life and almost every aspect and endeavour which touches our lives.

I welcome the Government's decision to introduce necessary legislations for dual citizenship in this session, about which there has been a bit of mis-information in the media and even among the well-informed. The High Level Committee had, in fact, recommended it after a thorough analysis of the constitutional and legal provisions, and after ascertaining the public opinion in the overseas Indian community. Our recommendation for dual citizenship arose from an insistent demand from the PIOs and NRIs in some of the countries, where the system of dual citizenship prevails and is accepted. Therefore, the foundation of our recommendation was reciprocity and the pattern of demand from the people concerned. I think it would be impermissible to provide dual citizenship to Indian citizens who are already Indian citizens, and who do not have any prospect of gaining any other citizenship, as for instance, in the Gulf region. But let us await a fuller discussion when the draft legislation comes to us, and when we have a chance to consider that draft legislation.

There are many who do not like the word 'diaspora' because it was used originally with reference to the dispersal of the Jewish people. The Jews, among gentiles, or non-Jews was what was the reference point in ancient times for the diaspora. But that word is no longer confined to the Jewish reference point. Now, we have an Irish diaspora, a Polish diaspora, a Greek diaspora, a Chinese diaspora and we have many other kinds of diasporas, which originate from one country and spread out to many others. The idea is only to acknowledge our own people, in different ways in which they would like to be acknowledged and it is that which is important, Madam, and it is that which will, I think, build bridges between the people of the Indian diaspora and the people who live in India. I have often said that the sun never sets on the Indian diaspora, spreading as it does on the one side in the Pacific to the other side in the Atlantic. And, wherever they have gone, they have shaped the fortunes of those countries -- prior to the British colonial period and later. But they also shaped the cultural future of many other countries when they went there in the ancient past. Let us understand that the world in which we live is a multi-cultural world. Let us understand that in this multi-cultural world, the Indian Diaspora has a contribution to make. Let us also understand that the Indian Diaspora will help not only to globalise India, but to Indianise the globe. And, I hope that this happens in terms which will fulfil our vision. The Address tells us that the Tenth Plan is not merely a resources plan, but a 'Reforms Plan.' I am glad that we have this perspective specifically underlined. We must

understand that the physical resources are important. But, the mindset of reforms is even more important, and it is these reforms, which we must carry out purposefully, meaningfully, compassionately and with an understanding of all sections of the people who may be affected. We may expect now a substantial measure of reforms in Civil Services, Judiciary, education and, above all, in governance. And, I think, it is important that these reforms, which are financial and non-fiscal, are brought in tandem with each other, rather than in isolation, because the reform process cannot be an island in itself. An isolated reform measure fails to achieve that multiplying effect which is essential in a revolving society like ours. I think, it is important also to remember what has gone wrong with our reforms, and what will happen now with the promise of reforms at all levels of governance, the Central, the State, the Panchayati Raj and the urban local self-Government. That statement itself is music to my ears, Madam, and to the ears of all of us. But, it remains to be implemented purposefully. I am sure, we all join hands in making certain that this reform process is implemented in a purposeful manner with the vision which has been presented in the President's Address. The process has to be embarked upon swiftly; the process has to be embarked upon purposefully, and reform measures have to take place in tandem with each other, and not in isolation. We can otherwise never fulfil the Vision-2020, of which the hon. President speaks with such passion in the President's Address, which may have been prepared by the Government, but which was so beautifully eternalised by the President, that it resoluted his own ideas and his own commitments. Too little, too late and working by fits and starts, will not do. That has been our national failure. Far too open, our Vision falls into the rut of bureaucratic stethoscope, and what is worse is, we become indescribably fond of the stethoscope and the red-tape. Madam, the bane of our system has been, if I may say so, that we fight our own good and sound ideas. The battlefield of implementation becomes the ground where we defeat our own ideas very often. That is the caution and failure that we must remember. For, the two mantras of effective implementation with people's participation and effective communication for people's participation are vital. If we wish to win the battle for our vision ...*(Interruptions)*....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The interpretation in Hindi is very poor. I would like the interpreter to interpret it properly, because he is not doing his job correctly. So, your speech in Hindi is not being welcomed.

उपसभापति : ट्रांसलेशन करेक्ट होना चाहिए । आप इतना अच्छा बोल रहे हैं, उसका अनुवाद भी करेक्ट होना चाहिए न । बोलिए ।

DR. L.M. SINGHVI: Madam, I would have preferred to speak in Hindi. But, we have two speakers, and the other one will also speak in Hindi.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Never mind, you speak in Hindi. ट्रांसलेशन करेक्ट होना चाहिए । आप इतना अच्छा बोल रहे हैं, उसका अनुवाद भी करेक्ट होना चाहिए न । बोलिए ।

श्री बालकवि बैरागी (मध्य प्रदेश) : मैडम,...

उपसभापति : अब आप इसमें कुछ चर्चा न करें, सिंघवी जी को डिस्टर्ब न करें, इनके थेन आफ थॉट्स टूट जाएंगे । बोलिए सिंघवी जी ।

श्री बालकवि बैरागी : इस अभिभाषण के हिन्दी अनुवाद में शुरू के दिन से ही परेशानी पैदा हो रही है, क्या करें ?

DR. L.M. SINGHVI: Civil Service reforms and police reforms, as well as judicial and educational reforms, have been in the air and on the anvil for many decades. But it is, for the first time, that there seems to be a renewed resolve to put these reforms through. Take, for instance, judicial reforms. There is a paragraph devoted to it in the President's Address. If I may say so, this has been a cry in the wilderness for almost 40 years of our national life. How can we allow institutions to erode by inertia or by inaction? That is why all the allocations that can be made for these reforms, all the allocations that can be made to give the judicial system a human face and an expeditious disposal, a system which answers to the needs and responds to the challenges of our time, is something that we have a promise for in this Address.

If I may say so, I remember what the late Rajiv Gandhi once told me. He said, "My single window has, unfortunately, become the 14th window, in addition to the 13th that is already existing". We need to reform this mindset of creating more and more windows. We need to change all this and, I am sure, under the dynamic leadership of our Leader of the House, our Prime Minister and our Deputy Prime Minister, with the solid support of the nation behind them for reform process for the common man,

we will make a headway, which we have not made for many years. We have been long on promises and short on delivery. That is why the promise in the Address comes as a breath of fresh air. I think it is this fresh air which we need in the nation. We need a new sense of commitment and a new resurrection and renaissance of those values which animated the Constitution and the founding of our Republic. There is, therefore, a greening of our hopes in this Address and those hopes must be fulfilled, and those expectations must be met.

Madam, the Golden Jubilee Year of our Parliament may be the Spring season, I hope, of major national reforms based on consultation and consensus. Let us not miss the bus again, for time and tide wait for none. The other day, we heard the debate on disinvestment. Without taking any sides, I think, there has come a point where we should evolve a consensus, where we should come to a synthesis. With 900 Parliamentary questions and 15 debates, why is it that we are not able to come to a reasonable consensus in pursuance of the national goals? That is where, I think, we must do something about the dialectics of the Parliamentary process because Parliamentary process is meant to arrive at an agreed national consensus.

If I may say so, Madam, 40 years ago, as a Member of the Lok Sabha--these are some of the experiences that I recount, in all humility, to say that things would go wrong in our reform process, if we are not vigilant--I had proposed the Lok Pal and Lokayukta institutions and also coined those words. When I spoke of those institutions as the ombudsman, the then Prime Minister asked me, "From which zoo have you brought this animal?" I said, "Sir, it comes from the Scandinavian example". He said, "You must find a good Indian description for it and I am all for it". In fact, he went on record to say that he would support the idea. But 40 years have taken a toll on the original vision of the institution. For 40 years we have been trying to come to grips with the idea of redressal of public grievances, which after all is fundamental to the soul of our democracy, and for 40 years we have not been able to arrive at a consensual legislative conclusion. I regret to say that the Lokayukta institution, which was implemented in some of the States, has lost the vision of the idea, has been bogged down in very legalistic way of operating and partly because we choose always Judges who spent life time in dealing with grievances in a different style. They adjudicate grievances. We need a solution of the

grievances and the institution of Lokayukta was designed, I can say this with total sincerity, to redress public grievances in the way in which they are redressed in some of the countries where the institution has functioned very successfully.

I would like to say that the institutions have to be implemented with a certain sense of loyalty to the idea, with a sense of integrity, if I may say so. And if that is not done, then we are only going through the parade of creating institutions and then letting them die. That is important because for a nation like us, we have to build institutions and we have to sustain the culture of those institutions. That culture is the shared vision of our founding fathers and of all of us who are committed to our democratic system. We cannot afford to put these institutions into strait-jackets. They must grow. They must evolve. They must answer the dynamics of challenges in our national life and, if they do not do it, then this judiciary or this Parliament or this executive, to that extent, becomes less relevant than it was designed to be.

Madam, I had the privilege of preparing the first draft of Panchayati Raj institutions from the time of 1958-59 with Mr. Balwant Rai Mehta, then with Shri Jai Prakash Narayan and then the Chairman of the National Committee for Panchayati Raj Revitalisation. We fought for almost 35-40 years to give the constitutional status to Panchayati Raj institutions. We succeeded finally. But I think that has also not met all the objectives that were envisioned and encapsulated in that constitutional legislation found in two chapters of our Constitution.

I think it is important, Madam, that we understand what went wrong. We must rectify, we must see to it that the whole legislation is made to work. There are States in which Panchayati Raj elections do not take place. There are States which do not listen to the mandate of the Constitution. There are States in which the mandate is distorted. There are States in which the State Government is not willing to part with its power of overseeing the Panchayati Raj, the very architecture of our Constitution.

If it is to be based on democracy at all levels including the grassroot, we must do something about it; and to do something about it, we need once again to launch or re-launch the movement for grassroot democracy. That was begun recently by our Prime Minister Shri Atal Behari

Vajpayee when Mr. Venkaiah Naidu was the Minister of Rural Development. But it must be carried to a fruitful conclusion and it will not succeed unless we build a movement in support of those institutions, unless we are able to provide training to those who have to man those institutions, unless we provide the necessary wherewithal and resources for democratic development of our countryside and of our towns. Where are we obstructed? Where are we embattled? How are we embattled? Who is obstructing the processes of dynamic democracy? I think this is something very important. I remember Shri Jai Prakash Narayan and Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia telling me, time and again, that it is only then that the catalyst of democracy will touch our lives, when we are able to rejuvenate the sense of democracy at the grassroots.

But we must do it together and we must do it fast. Reforms do not come easy. There is resistance to change. There is a fear of the unknown and the danger of half-baked ideas which often take comfort in a change for the sake of change. It think it is important for us to understand that a change for the sake of change is nothing but a window dressing, a democratic window dressing, but quite a futile window dressing. Washington Irving said in the 19th Century -- these are very colourful words -- "I have found in travelling in a stage coach that it is often a comfort to shift one's position and be bruised in a new place". I think that is not the purpose of reform, to go on going from one reform to the other without consolidating the idea underlying the reform, without understanding that reform has to serve a social purpose. I think that kind of comfort is no comfort at all. We go from one legislation to another groping for an ideal solution and accept a half-baked idea, but on the other hand, it is necessary that if the reform procedures are to be put in place, we should make institutions work, we should see that institutions do not go to seed, we should see that ideas do not rot. We should see that the nation does not become a burial ground for good ideas. That is the task entrusted not only to the Government, not only to the Opposition, but to the people as a whole. I think it is this which is important if we are able to grasp the opportunities that are before us.

To dampen our spirit, there are many intellectual pretensions of cynics who would want to say that they have read nothing but the bitter lessons of the past. A cynic would say, "I have read nothing but the lessons of the bitter past and I am prematurely disappointed in the future."

I do not think we can afford that kind of cynicism. We need to recapture that sense of optimism. We need to recapture that sense of solidarity and we need a new renaissance, a new reformed mindset which I would call a triple C, namely, a contextually conducive climate. Unless we create that contextually conducive climate, we cannot reach the high ground of achievement that we have set for ourselves. How do we do it? How did the people of the Indian diaspora who went to different countries of the world in very adverse circumstances prosper? How did they achieve the heights of human achievement? Because there was a contextually conducive climate. And it is that climate which will attract investments. It is that climate which will bring about a new era in economic, political and other reforms.

I think it is that climate which is far more important. This Parliament has to be the spherehead, the source, the fountainhead of that contextually conducive climate. For all our differences, we are one in the solidarity of national development and reconstruction. The Address tells us of the PURA Vision 2020. I like the acronym Pura because in Hindi it means freedom in its fullness, fullness of that vision. That PURA Vision means Providing Urban Amenities in Rural Areas. I can add that it also means not taking away that setting which makes the ecology more harmonious in our urban areas because ecology and environment is generally the first victim and we must safeguard our future because urbanisation is taking place at a pace which is mind-boggling.

It may be that in 20 years' time, two-thirds of India, which is rural today, will be semi-urban or urban. There is a vast migration, demographic movement of people. We must understand that if this happens in a chaotic and unplanned manner, it can undermine our future. I think it is also important that the four critical connectivities - physical in terms of roads, transport services and quality power, electronic connectivity in knowledge and market connectivity, I would like to address, I would like to add cultural connectivity within the nation, and civilisational connectivity in respect of other nations of the world and this is important because the Government can blueprint then a holistic vision of India, 2020, a new Panchsheel, if I may say so, unlike the Panchsheel which failed, or was aborted. But I think our faith remains in the idea of these principles and these principles must be reiterated in a new way for our national development through those four connectivities and the connectivity of a cultural kind within the nation,

acceptance of diversities within the nation and affirmation of the unity in those diversities within the nation. I hope the Government will enable and facilitate a purposeful discussion with regard to the Tenth Plan and Vision, 2020 in the House, as has been recommended by the President in his Address and that we will have an opportunity, then, to reflect on the various routes for mapping out our path to the destination of that connectivity and development.

Madam, elections represent a democratic triumph of our national ethos, but there has always been divisive and negative radioactive fallout in the process, often slanderous, libellous, mean and mischievous, as in Madhya Pradesh recently. Rather than allowing a youthful misdemeanour and a criminal, culpable invective against our Prime Minister, let the national parties accept important suggestion of declaring themselves in favour of a Constitutional Amendment to ban cow slaughter. That is what they want. Let the Opposition support the ban on the export of beef, which has already been imposed by the Government. Let us not be so divisive on matters of this nature, for this destroys the true secular fabric of our nation. That is what undermines the harmony, which has to be the first mantram of our national development. We must create a national consensus on an issue which was so dear to Mahatma Gandhi and Vinoba Bhave and which is a matter of deep sensibility to many sections of the people in India. But, let us not use it in the way in which it has been used by attacking our Prime Minister, by vilifying him, let us not use these things for dividing the nation, let us apply the healing touch. This is what we want. This is what we can have. The Parliament can enact a Constitutional Amendment and that will be the answer to all these problems. But we must look beyond the electoral strategies in a way that elections do not damage our sense of unity and togetherness.

Madam, I welcome the ideas of Shri N.N.Vohra as our interlocutor in Jammu and Kashmir. I hope that he will help to break the ice and the deadlock created by fanatics and fuelled from across the border. I foresee that the rulers, as well as the mushroom growth of terrorist and fundamentalist organisations in Pakistan, have many tricks up their long sleeves. We are faced with a very slippery customer. We are faced with blatant violations of diplomatic norms which are as much a part of Pakistan's policy, as are the proxy war and the heady mix of religious fanaticism and terrorism. General Musharraf's Kargil adventure is fresh in

our memory. But, then Pakistan is also a nuclear power and we have to be careful because we are peace loving.

We are not a trigger happy nation. And we have to see that international pressure plays its due role which ought to be played by it. The U.S. cannot pretend to be fighting the war of terrorism everywhere else in the world and ignoring the very breeding ground of terrorism of which Osama's Afghanistan was only one of the many illegitimate offsprings from Pakistan. For us in India, the acid test of U.S. *bona fides* is how it deals with Pakistan, its ISI terrorism and its proxy war.

Paragraph 62 of the Address, speaks of our undiluted commitment to SAARC as an engine for economic integration and equitable development in the region, but we need to understand that SAARC is permanently shelved because of one recalcitrant member who refuses to abide by its economic agenda and who will not eschew its tactics of terrorism, prevarication and the hysteria of hatred. SAARC is fast becoming an empty shell and therefore, we must consider alternatives. Madam, may I suggest, in all humility that we should try and think of a very loose confederation or association of a few of the more friendly SAARC nations preserving their full sovereignty and creating greater collaborative togetherness. It is an ideal which the opinion-makers in India, Nepal, Bhutan, Sri Lanka and possibly Bangladesh should consider, in the first instance, with a constructive mindset. It may be that Pakistan will find it beneficial to join that confederation, in the long run. But we must go ahead, with or without Pakistan, creating an association of our neighbouring countries which works and not make all these investments in what is becoming increasingly a non-starter, because of the intransigence and the obstinacy of Pakistan. I am glad that Dubai has extradited some of the wanted criminals. I congratulate the Government for its success in that respect. As one, who negotiated the path breaking Extradition Treaty with United Kingdom, may I submit that, side by side, with bilateral Extradition Treaties, we must now launch an initiative for an effective international extradition regime in the global war against terrorism. And I think it is this international regime of extradition which will help us a long way to fight terrorism in the way in which it is spreading its tentacles. We need to resolve our problems with Bangladesh. There is a huge illegal influx of Bangladeshis into India. The number is estimated to be staggering, going back to the permissive ways of Government after Government, in the old State of Assam and growing now-

a-days by the hour. It is a virtual demographic invasion. What compounds it, is ISI and the home grown Bangladeshi fanatics. The hon. Chief Minister of West Bengal has spoken out loud and clear and so has our Deputy Prime Minister. But it is a massive problem which can only be solved if all of us join together in solving it and do not allow communal or any other politics to play ducks and drakes with our national policy. We welcome the concerted efforts of the Government to rebuild peace in the North-East and pray for the success of these efforts. There are grave disparities in the development of different parts of India. Those disparities will accentuate the digital divide, the debt trap and the backwardness. Reform-linked incentives to the State Governments may not necessarily resolve the problem. We must bring the States which are lagging behind into the mainstream of development. I appeal to our distinguished Leader of the House, who is also the Finance Minister of the country, to bestow particular thought on this issue of regional disparities which threatens the future of Indian federalism. I think we must resolve this problem swiftly and in an imaginative way. If we ignore it today, the wages of our neglect would be very serious indeed.

The Centre has launched many remarkable national initiatives. They will hopefully take our country and our people forward, from poverty and privation to a reasonable status of human dignity. Swajal Dhara, Sampoorna Grameen Rozgar Yogna, the Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana and the great National Highways Development Project as well as the linking of the railways, the railway, shipping and civil aviation reforms and the incredible growth of the telecom services in India, which, I think, is extraordinarily important, provide the most eloquent manifestations of the vision which the Address unfolds. We hope that housing construction and power generation plans will give further momentum to our plans for progress. We hope that ecology will be safeguarded because ecology is the *dharma* of the Indian heritage; ecology is the ethos of India and we cannot afford to endanger Planet Earth and Mother India by ecological neglect.

I would like to conclude by invoking that great hymn of togetherness, for it is in togetherness that democracy fulfils itself; it is in the grand inquest of the nation, which this Parliament represents, that democracy fulfils itself and ultimately, therefore, it is togetherness which we should strive for, pray for and invoke. That beautiful hymn is: "संगच्छध्वम् संवदध्वम् सं वो मनांसि जानताम्", and another hymn, which is related to it, is: "सह

ना वदतु सह नौ भुनक्तु सह वीर्यं करवावहै", and then, it ends with: "तेजस्विनाम् अधीतमस्तु मा विद्विषावहै" - without malice, without rancour, without differences which divide, let us strive for that togetherness in the reconstruction of our patriotism and in re-consecrating ourselves to the cause of national reconstruction, as envisioned in the Address, which I commend to the House for approval and for accolade.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I now call upon Shri Satish Pradhan to second the Motion.

श्री सतीश प्रधान (महाराष्ट्र) : धन्यवाद उपसभापति महोदया । 17 फरवरी को दोनों सदनों के ज्वाइंट सेशन में आदरणीय राष्ट्रपति जी ने जो वक्तव्य दिया, उनको आभार प्रदर्शित करने हेतु जो प्रस्ताव सिंघवी जी लाए हैं, मैं उसका अनुमोदन करने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूं ।

महोदया, मैं इसका समर्थन इसलिए कर रहा हूं कि हमारे राष्ट्रपति जी दुनिया के सबसे जाने-माने शास्त्रज्ञ भी हैं और उन्होंने अपने वक्तव्य में सबसे पहले होनहार महिला कल्पना चावला को याद किया जिस पर देश को गर्व है । इससे भारतवर्ष की सभी महिलाओं को और भविष्य में शास्त्रज्ञ बनने वाली सभी लड़कियों को प्रेरणा और आगे बढ़ने की हिम्मत मिलेगी और वे भारत का नाम ऊंचा करने में कामयाब होंगी, ऐसा मुझे विश्वास है।

महोदया, इस अभिभाषण में जो मुद्दे आए हैं, उनके बारे में मैं कुछ कहना चाहूंगा । जैसा कि इसमें डिस-इन्वेस्टमेंट निर्दिष्ट होने के कारण चर्चा की गई है। मेरा खुद का ऐसा मत है कि इंडस्ट्री चलाना, उद्योग-धन्धे चलाना सरकार का काम नहीं होना चाहिए। सरकार का काम है उसके लिए आवश्यक वातावरण का निर्माण करना, लोगों को उद्योग चलाने के लिए प्रोत्साहित करना। इसके लिए आवश्यक है उनको पूरे प्रावधान निर्मित करके देना, यह सरकार का काम होना चाहिए। सरकार को गवर्न करना है, सरकार को सरकार चलानी है। रोजगार उपलब्ध करवाकर देने का काम सरकार को करना है। लेकिन रोजगार उपलब्ध करवाने लिए खुद इंडस्ट्री चलाने की आवश्यकता नहीं है। इंडस्ट्रियलिस्ट को उसके लिए आवश्यक वातावरण का निर्माण करके दोगे तो वह अच्छे ढंग से इंडस्ट्री चला सकेगा और आवश्यक वातावरण का निर्माण हो सकेगा। इसीलिए हमारी पार्टी शिव सेना ने, डिस-इन्वेस्टमेंट पर सरकार का साथ देने का निर्णय किया है। लेकिन वहां उसमें एक बात अवश्य कही है। हमारा आग्रह पहले भी था और आज भी है और आगे भी रहेगा। यह बात यह है कि आप जो डिस-इन्वेस्टमेंट कर रहे हैं तो साथ ही जो इंडस्ट्रीज हैं, चाहे वे प्राइवेट सैक्टर में हैं या पब्लिक सैक्टर में हैं, दोनों जगह पर बहुत सारे लोगों के रोजगार बंद किए जा रहे हैं। उनको वीआरएस दिया जा रहा है या और कुछ सीआरएस दिए जा रहे हैं। इसके मुताबिक उनको नौकरी से हटाया जा रहा है। इसकी वजह से बहुत बड़ी समस्या पैदा हो रही है। इस विषय पर गौर से देखने और सोचने की आवश्यकता है। अगर इस विषय पर राजनीतिक दृष्टिकोण से नहीं देखा गया तो इससे लोगों को इस समस्या से छुटकारा नहीं मिलेगा। अतः लोगों को इससे छुटकारा मिले, यह देखने की आवश्यकता है । इस वजह से सोशल सिक्योरिटी हर आदमी को मिलनी चाहिए। आज इससे

उसको बाहर रखा जा रहा है। आज सबसे बड़ी आवश्यकता है सोशल सिक्योरिटी के निर्माण करने की। आज यह बड़ी समस्या पैदा हो गई है। मुझे मालूम है कि बहुत सारे लोगों ने वीआरएस लिया है। ऐसे बहुत सारे लोगो के बच्चे आज पढ़ने के लिए स्कूल नहीं जा सकते हैं। अगर जाते हैं तो उनको एडमिशन नहीं मिलता है क्योंकि वे पढ़ने के लिए फीस नहीं दे सकते हैं। जब वे नौकरी करते थे तो उनके फैमिली मैम्बर को हैल्थ, आरोग्य की सुविधा मिलती थी। इम्पलायर की हैसियत से उनको सब सुविधाएं मिलती थी। आज उनके वहां जाने पर उनको आपत्ति हो रही है। ऐसा नहीं होना चाहिए। उनको सिक्योरिटी मिलने की आवश्यकता है। उनको वीआरएस का जो पैसा मिला, उसमें से कुछ को उन्होने घर लेने में इन्वेस्ट कर दिया। आज बहुत सारे लोगों को दिन में, घर में रहने मे बहुत मुश्किल होती है। यह ऐसी परिस्थिति है जिसके लिए लोगों को सोशल सिक्योरिटी निर्मित करवाकर देने की आवश्यकता है। मुझे मालूम है और मैं इसके लिए सरकार को धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूं और महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी के अभिभाषण पर मैं उनको भी धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूं कि इस सरकार ने एक अच्छा निर्णय अभी-अभी किया है कि वीआरएस लेने वाले लोगों को भी उसने सोशल सिक्योरिटी देने के बारे मे कुछ निर्णय किया है। सरकार ने एक और निर्णय लिया है। मैं उसके लिए भी धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूं। यह निर्णय है, बहुत सालों से लोगो की डिमांड थी...। इसकी आवश्यकता थी । वह आवश्यकता यह थी कि हमारे यहां काम करने के लिए नौकर रखे जाते हैं, खेती में काम करने के लिए किसान मजदूर रखा जाता है, ये मजदूर असंगठित मजदूर हैं । होटल में काम करने के लिए भी रखे जाते हैं । छोटे-छोटे होटल में जो लोग काम करते हैं वे असंगठित हैं । संगठित नहीं हैं । इनके लिए कुछ करने की आवश्यकता थी । वे सभी लोग संगठित नहीं हैं, इसके लिए यूनियन नहीं बना सकते, अपनी कोई मांग नही कर सकते । उनको सुरक्षा भी नहीं मिलती थी । सुरक्षा देने के विषय में भी मुझे एक विश्वसनीय जानकारी मिली है । मैं इसका उल्लेख करना चाहता हूं। सरकार ने इस पर कानून बनाकर इन सभी असंगठित कामगारों, कर्मचारियों को सुरक्षा प्रदान करने का जो निर्णय लिया है, उसके लिए मैं आपका अभिनन्दन करता हूं । मैं यह भी कहना चाहता हूं कि यह डिमांड बहुत पुरानी थी । इसे आप पूरा कर रहे हैं इसके लिए भी मैं आनन्दित हूं ।

एक और विषय के बारे में कहना चाहता हूं कि हमारे यहां क्रीड़ा मंत्री ने, क्रीड़ा मंत्रालय में एक बहुत अच्छा निर्णय लिया है । इसकी भी बहुत सालों से लोगों की डिमांड थी । यह विशेषकर खिलाड़ियो की डिमांड थी । उनका आग्रह था कि हमारे लिए जो क्रीड़ा साहित्य की आवश्यकता रहती है वह क्रीड़ा साहित्य इम्पोर्ट करना पड़ता है । जब इम्पोर्ट करके लाते हैं तो उस पर कस्टम ड्यूटी, यहां की कीमत, सबका हिसाब देने के बाद हमारे यहां का खिलाड़ी उसे खरीद नहीं सकता था । उसकी बहुत ज्यादा कीमत होती थी । मैं उदाहरण के लिए एक चीज बताऊंगा । टेबल टेनिस क्षेत्र मे मैं काम करता हूं । टेबल टेनिस में मैंने देखा कि उसका रबड़ यहां नही बनता । हम विदेशों से रबड़ लाते हैं । विदेश से रबड़ इम्पोर्ट करने के बाद जब यह खिलाड़ी के हाथ मे पहुंचाते थे तो साढ़े छह सौ, सात सौ, आठ सौ, हजार रुपए तक उसकी कीमत जाती थी । आपके मंत्रालय ने यह एक बहुत बड़ा निर्णय लिया है कि किसी भी खिलाड़ी के हाथ मे यह रबड़ ढाई सौ रुपये से ज्यादा नही पड़ेगी । इसी किस्म का अलग-अलग क्रीड़ा साहित्य है । इन सभी के बारे मे क्रीड़ा मंत्रालय ने एक बहुत अच्छा निर्णय लेकर सभी खिलाड़ियो की मदद की । मैं इसके लिए आपको धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूं । सरकार ने यह अच्छा

काम किया है । एक बढ़िया काम किया है । इसके लिए मैं आपका अभिनन्दन करना चाहता हूं । आदरणीय राष्ट्रपति जी ने अपने भाषण में क्रिकेट के बारे में भी बताया था । यह खेल है । जब खेलने के लिए मैदान में आते हैं तो दो टीमों में से एक टीम हारने वाली होती है । जिस ढंग से हारे मैं उससे सहमत नहीं हूं । लेकिन इसका मतलब यह नहीं हो सकता कि किसी खिलाड़ी के घर पर हमला हो । जो खेल नहीं रहे हैं घरवालों के लिए उनको भी बुलाना मुश्किल हो जाए, इस ढंग का बर्ताव नहीं होना चाहिए । मुझे याद आता है, परसो जो हुआ है यह कोई पहली बार नहीं हुआ है । कलकत्ता या कर्नाटक में जो घटना घटी वह कोई पहली बार नहीं घटी है । इससे पहले हम वेस्ट इंडीज में अजीत वाडेकर के नेतृत्व में जीतकर आए थे । तब सभी लोगों ने हमारे सभी खिलाड़ियों को सिर पर बिठाया था । डांस किया था, नाच किया था । जब इंग्लैण्ड में अजीत वाडेकर के नेतृत्व में हम हारकर आए तब उस समय मुंबई और अन्य जगह भी, जहां सब खिलाड़ियों के घर हैं, अजीत वाडेकर के घर पर भी हमला करने के लिए लोग गए थे । मुझे इस बात का अभिमान है कि अजीत वाडेकर के घर पर हमला करने के लिए लोग जा रहे हैं, ऐसा सुनते ही शिवसेना प्रमुख बाला साहेब ठाकरे ने शिव सैनिकों को कहा कि किसी भी हालत में, किसी भी खिलाड़ी के घर पर कोई नहीं जाना चाहिए । उसके लिए आवश्यक सुरक्षा व्यवस्था करने का बंदोबस्त करो । सब शिव सैनिक अजीत वाडेकर के घर के पास जाकर खड़े हो गए थे। सुनील गावस्कर के घर भी कोई नहीं जा सका था ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Would you like to finish it just now, or, would like to continue after lunch? *(Interruptions)*

श्री सतीश प्रधान : जैसा आप कहें । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, the House is adjourned for lunch for one hour.

The House, then, adjourned for lunch at one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at two minutes past two of the clock, THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

उपसभापति : गौतम जी, आज तो आपका श्री-गणेश हो गया हाऊस में ।

कृषि एवं ग्रामीण उद्योग मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम) : जी, मैडम ।

उपसभापति : चलिए, सतीश प्रधान जी, आप बोलिए ।

श्री सतीश प्रधान : उपसभापति महोदया, मैं क्रीडा मंत्रालय के बारे में अपनी बात कर रहा था । इस संबंध में विशेषकर के मुझे दो बातें और बताने की आवश्यकता होगी । एक तो प्रधान मंत्री जी ने बहुत बड़ा अच्छा निर्णय किया, जिसकी आवश्यकता भी थी । एशियन गेम्स में हमारे बच्चों ने बहुत अच्छा प्रदर्शन किया और अपने देश के लिए गौरव भी प्राप्त करके लाए ।

उसके बाद हमारे प्रधान मंत्री जी ने यह निर्णय किया और स्पोर्टस कौंसिल की पुनर्स्थापना की, जो क्रीड़ा क्षेत्र के बहुत सारे लोगों की बहुत दिनों से मांग थी । यह जो एक अत्यावश्यक कदम उठाया गया, इसके लिए मैं उनका अभिनन्दन करता हूँ, आभार प्रदर्शित करता हूँ ।

महोदया, इसी के साथ-साथ मैं एक और विषय भी इस माननीय सदन मे रखना चाहूंगा । आज अफ्रीका मे क्रिकेट मैच चल रहा है । वर्ल्ड कप होने की वजह से जगह-जगह इसकी चर्चा हो रही है । बीच मे कुछ सटोरियों के खिलाफ कार्यवाही भी की गई थी । इस मैच पर सट्टा बहुत बड़ी मात्रा मे होता है । यह सट्टा नहीं होना चाहिए, इसको बंद होना चाहिए । इसके खिलाफ कदम भी उठाए गए हैं, उठाए जा रहे हैं । अगर आज के दिन भी कोई अखबार उठाकर देखिए, तो पता चलता है कि सट्टा बेटिंग के लिए कही न कही रेड की गई है, अरेस्ट भी हुई है । इसी के साथ अखबारो के माध्यम से यह भी पढ़ने को मिलता है कि बेटिंग रेट क्या है, किसके खिलाफ कौनसा रेट होगा, मैच होगा तो उसका रेट किस किस्म का और क्या होगा । यह सब ब्यौरा दूरदर्शन पर, टीवी पर और अखबारों के माध्यम से प्रदर्शित किया जा रहा है। मतलब एक जगह पर कार्रवाई हो रही है और दूसरी जगह पर यह सब खुलेआम प्रदर्शित किया जा रहा है । यह आपत्तिजनक है और सरकार को इस विषय पर गंभीरता से विचार करके कदम उठाने चाहिए, यह मैं कहना चाहता हूं ।

मैं एक और विषय पर सरकार का अभिनंदन करना चाहता हूं, इसीलिए मैं सरकार का समर्थन करने के लिए खड़ा हूं । बहुत से पे-चैनल्स वाले लोगो को त्रस्त कर रहे थे और जैसे जी मे आता था, उसी ढंग से दाम बढ़ा देते थे तथा लोगो को पीड़ित करते थे । सुषमा जी, आपने बहुत बड़ा काम किया और पे-चैनल्स को सीधे रास्ते पर लाने के लिए आपने सैट-टाप बाक्स की व्यवस्था करने का कानून बनाया । मैं आपसे प्रार्थना करूंगा, मैंने जब उस वक्त बात की थी तब भी कहा था कि हमारे यहां पे-चैनल्स वाले पे-चैनल पर ऐडवरटाइज़मेंट भी दिखाते हैं, जबकि दुनियाभर मे कही भी पे-चैनल्स पर ऐडवरटाइज़मेंट नही दिखाई जाती । इसलिए पे-चैनल्स पर यहां भी ऐडवरटाइज़मेंट बंद करने के लिए कुछ कार्रवाई की जानी चाहिए और साथ ही साथ उस सैट-टाप बाक्स को जल्दी से जल्दी इम्प्लिमेंट किए जाने की आवश्यकता है तभी असल मे लोगों को राहत मिलेगी ।

हम भारतीय संसद का स्वर्ण महोत्सव वर्ष मना रहे हैं और एक बहुत अच्छा कदम हमारे यहां उठाया गया कि हमारे स्पीकर साहब ने यहां पर स्वर्ण महोत्सव जागृति परिषद आयोजित की थी, जिसमे 150 से ज्यादा देशों के प्रतिनिधि उपस्थित हुए । एक यशस्वी परिषद यहां आयोजित हुई । इसका भी उल्लेख यदि राष्ट्रपति महोदय के अभिभाषण मे होता तो ज्यादा अच्छा होता क्योंकि यह एक ऐतिहासिक घटना है, जिसके उल्लेख की आवश्यकता थी ।

मैडम, मैं सरकार के एक और अच्छे कदम का उल्लेख करना चाहूंगा जिसकी बहुत सालो से आवश्यकता थी लेकिन यह कदम उठाया नही गया था, अब क्यो नहीं उठाया गया था यह तो मुझे मालूम नहो । किसानो को सुरक्षा के लिए हर साल बाहर से, बाजार से जो कर्जा उठाना पड़ता है, उसके लिए उसे मदद की आवश्यकता थी, यह कर्जा आसान होना चाहिए था, जिसके लिए सरकार ने एक अच्छा कदम उठाया है और किसान क्रेडिट कार्ड की आपने किसानो

के लिए व्यवस्था करा दी है, जिसका उन पर बहुत अच्छा असर पड़ा है । हमारे यहां करोड़ों लोग किसान हैं, उनको कर्ज़ में जो राहत की आवश्यकता थी, आपने यह कदम उठाकर उनको जो राहत दी है, उसके लिए मैं आपका आभार प्रदर्शित करना चाहता हूं, धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूं ।

इसके साथ ही साथ हमारे प्रधान मंत्री जी ने एक और बहुत अच्छा कदम उठाया है। मेरे ख्याल से सभी पंचायतों के सभी प्रतिनिधियों को पहली बार बुलाया गया है और उनके साथ चर्चा की गई और उस समय उन सभी लोगों ने प्रधान मंत्री जी से मांग की कि आपने यह एक अच्छा कदम उठाया है लेकिन हम लोगों को, ग्राम पंचायत लैवल तक जितने पदाधिकारी हैं, उनको आर्थिक दृष्टि से कोई अधिकार नहीं हैं या ऐग्ज़िक्यूटिव पावर्स उनके पास कुछ भी नहीं हैं और सभी विषयों के लिए उनको अधिकारियों पर निर्भर रहना पड़ता है। इसलिए पंचायत लैवल के पदाधिकारियों को भी कुछ अधिकार होने चाहिए । यह मांग होते ही, क्योंकि उनके पास दूसरा कोई चारा नहीं होता, प्रधान मंत्री जी ने "स्वजल धारा" स्कीम इंट्रोड्यूस की और इसके इंट्रोड्यूस होते ही 17,000 से ऊपर ग्राम पंचायत तक के लोगों की अर्ज़ी आ गई कि हमें इस योजना में सम्मिलित होना है । इस योजना में 90 प्रतिशत तक केन्द्र सरकार मदद देने वाली है, 10 प्रतिशत लोकल बाडी के माध्यम से उसको इकट्ठा करना है । इसके साथ ही साथ दूसरी एक और योजना लागू कर दी गई "बंजर भूमि या वेस्ट लैंड डेवलपमेंट अभियान" । फिर "हरियाली योजना" हो गई, जिसमें 95 प्रतिशत केन्द्र से 5 परसैंट लोकल बाडी से है । हमारे यहां बारिश जगह-जगह ठीक ढंग से नहीं होती । इस "हरियाली योजना" के बाद से बारिश भी अच्छी आ सकेगी...। लोगों को जिस अकाल का सामना करना पड़ रहा है, इससे उसका कुछ समाधान हो सकेगा । इसके लिए जो योजना बनाई गई है, यह काफी अच्छी है। संपूर्ण ग्रामीण रोजगार योजना भी इसी उद्देश्य से बनाई गई है । इसके लिए सरकार का अभिनंदन करने की आवश्यकता है क्योंकि ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों में और विशेषकर अकालग्रस्त परिस्थिति के समय सभी लोगों को रोजगार उपलब्ध होना मुश्किल हो जाता है ।

महोदया, हमारे पास 50 प्रतिशत सरप्लस धान है । उसके लिए 10,000 करोड़ रुपए का प्रावधान किया गया है । हर राज्य में इसका ठीक ढंग से उपयोग करने की आवश्यकता है । हम विकास की ओर बढ़ रहे हैं, सालों से यह हो रहा है लेकिन कई रास्ते ऐसे थे जो दुर्गम थे। कई ऐसे रास्ते मुझे मालूम हैं जहां स्वतंत्रता से पूर्व डामर लगाया होगा, तार लगाया होगा, उसके बाद वह कभी नहीं लगा लेकिन इस ओर हमारी सरकार ने ध्यान दिया और उसके लिए राष्ट्रीय महामार्ग विकास योजना बनाई गई और उसके लिए 65,000 करोड़ रुपए का आवंटन किया गया। इसके तहत राष्ट्रीय महामार्गों को चारों तरफ फैलाने का प्रस्ताव किया गया और उनका विकास किया गया । आज जब हम हिंदुस्तान में कहीं भी घूमते हैं, जब हम कमेटी के माध्यम से घूमते हैं, मैं ट्रांसपोर्ट ऐंड टूरिज्म कमेटी में हूं, मैं इस कमेटी के सदस्य की हैसियत से जगह-जगह पर घूमा हूं और मैंने पाया है कि हर जगह बहुत अच्छा काम चल रहा है । ऐसा नहीं है कि यह योजना सिर्फ कागज पर है । इस योजना पर ठीक ढंग से अमल हो रहा है, बहुत जोर-शोर से हो रहा है, यह हम देख रहे हैं ।

महोदया, गोल्डन ट्रायंगल के द्वारा ईस्ट, वैस्ट, नॉर्थ और साऊथ के लोगों को नजदीक लाने की योजना है । जैसे रेल के माध्यम से हम पूरे नॉर्थ, ईस्ट, वैस्ट, साऊथ, सभी जगह घूम सकते हैं और सभी लोगों को इकट्ठा ला सकते हैं । इसलिए भारत अपना है, ऐसा लोगो को लग रहा है लेकिन सबसे महत्वपूर्ण बात यह है कि अगर ट्रांसपोर्टेशन की व्यवस्था ठीक हो तो हमारा विकास होगा और किसानों के द्वारा उत्पादित पैदावार या इंडस्ट्रीज के द्वारा बनाया हुआ माल जल्दी से देश के दूसरे कोने तक पहुंच सकेगा और अच्छी सड़कें होने की वजह से हमारा डीजल बचेगा, पेट्रोल बचेगा । इसके कारण हमें जो तेल के आयात पर खर्च करना पड़ता है, वह खर्चा बच सकेगा और हमारी जो आर्थिक परिस्थिति है वह सुधरेगी और हम आर्थिक दृष्टि से ज्यादा मजबूत बनेंगे । सरकार ने यह कदम उठाया है, इसके लिए सरकार का अभिनंदन करने की आवश्यकता है ।

महोदया, मैं यह बताना चाहता हूं कि सरकार ने हर गांव को जोड़ने की योजना बनाई है । ग्राम सड़क योजना के अंतर्गत देश का एक भी गांव ऐसा नही रहेगा जो दूसरे गांव के साथ जुड़ा हुआ न हो । आज भी देहात में बहुत सारे ऐरियाज़ में ऐसे गांव हैं, जहां जाने के लिए रास्ता तक नहीं है । लोगो को चलते ही जाना पड़ता है । इस आपदा से लोगों को बाहर निकालने के लिए सरकार ने यह कदम उठाया है और उसके लिए 7,000 करोड़ रुपए का बंदोबस्त करके यह काम जगह-जगह पर चल रहा है । इसलिए यह बहुत अच्छा है । महोदया, मैं म्युनिसिपल ऐरिया से आता हूं । मैं वहां देखता हूं कि सब जगह से लोग वहां आकर रहना चाहते हैं और जब वहां रहने की बात आती है तो घरों की मुश्किल होती है । इस कारण से बहुत बड़ी मात्रा मे झुग्गी और झोपड़-पट्टियां जगह-जगह बनी हैं। ये झुग्गी और झोपड़-पट्टियां नहीं होनी चाहिए । उनका सुधार होना चाहिए, विकास होना चाहिए और लोगो को रहने के लिए अच्छे मकान मिलने चाहिए । इस पर भी सरकार ने विचार किया है । हमारे देश में ऐसे करीब 18 प्रतिशत नागरिक शहरों मे रहते हैं जिनके पास मकान नहीं हैं। इस परिस्थिति से उनको बाहर निकालने के लिए सरकार ने वाल्मीकि-अम्बेडकर योजना बनाई है और ग्रामीण लोगों के विकास के लिए अलग से योजना बनाई है । इन सभी लोगो के लिए व्यवस्था सरकार ने कर दी है और यह बहुत अच्छा काम हो गया है ।

महोदया, आज टेलीफोन सभी को चाहिए । पहले ऐसी परिस्थिति थी कि टेलीफोन मुझे मिलना चाहिए, इसके लिए मैं कितना ही खर्चा करने के लिए तैयार हूं । बहुत सारे लोग इसके लिए एजेंसी का काम किया करते थे और अधिकारियों से मिल-जुलकर अपने लिए टेलीफोन की व्यवस्था करवा लिया करते थे लेकिन अब सरकार ने इसमें इतना परिवर्तन कर दिया है कि गांव-गांव में टेलीफोन पहुंचना शुरू हो गया है और कई गांवों में टेलीफोन पहुंच भी गया है । यदि आज हमें दुनिया के सामने सबके साथ खड़ा होना है और कंपीटीशन में खड़ा होना है तो उसके लिए टेलीफोन की व्यवस्था और अच्छी होनी चाहिए और सामान्य नागरिकों को उसका फायदा मिलना चाहिए । इसके लिए भी सरकार ने काम किया है और मोबाइल टेलीफोन की संख्या 14 लाख से एक करोड़ तक पहुंच गई है । इतनी बड़ी मात्रा में सरकार ने यह सुविधा प्रदान की है । इस बात के लिए सरकार का अभिनंदन करने की आवश्यकता है और सरकार से यह कहने की आवश्यकता है कि आपने बहुत अच्छा काम किया है । आगे बढ़ो और काम करो, यह कहने की आवश्यकता है ।

महोदया, मुझे यह भी कहना है कि शुरू में जब मोबाइल टेलीफोन आया था तो 16 रुपए प्रति मिनट का रेट था, अब वह 40 पैसे प्रति मिनट हो गया है । इसके लिए भी सरकार बधाई की पात्र है ।

महोदया, एक महत्वपूर्ण बात यह है कि इस देश में आतंकवादियों ने बहुत हंगामा मचाकर रखा है । अगर हम आतंकवाद की जड़ में जाकर देखें तो इस देश में बहुत बड़ी मात्रा में पाकिस्तान की तरफ से, बंगलादेश की तरफ से घुसपैठ हो रही है और ये लोग जहां चाहे वहां जा रहे हैं । चाहे ये हमारे नॉर्थ-ईस्ट के स्टेट्स हो या मुंबई या दिल्ली जैसे शहर हो, बेड़ागांव या ठाणे जैसे शहर हो, ये लोग गांव-गांव में जाकर बैठे हैं और वहां से ये आतंकवाद फैलाते हैं । इसको रोकने की आवश्यकता है । इसीलिए मैं यहां शिवसेना प्रमुख ठाकरे जी का उल्लेख करना चाहता हूं । मुंबई में जब शिव सेना और भारतीय जनता पार्टी का राज्य था तो वहां के मुख्य मंत्री ठाकरे जी ने इन सब घुसपैठियों को खदेड़कर बाहर निकालने की कोशिश की थी । तो हमारे ऊपर आरोप लगा कि हम सब लोग बंगाली लोगों को मुम्बई से बाहर निकाल रहे हैं। इस सदन में भी लोगो ने हमारे ऊपर आरोप लगाया था। हम बंगाली लोगो के खिलाफ नही हैं। लेकिन हम यह अवश्य कहते हैं कि जो बंगलादेशी इस देश में घुसपैठ करके आए हैं उनको बाहर निकालने की आवश्यकता है। आज पश्चिमी बंगाल के मुख्य मंत्री भी यह कहते हैं कि इन घुसपैठियो को रोकने की आवश्यकता है। जो पहले शिव सेना प्रमुख जी ने कहा था वही आज पश्चिमी बंगाल के मुख्य मंत्री कह रहे हैं। क्योंकि जब घर में आग लगनी शुरू हो जाती है तब वह आग अन्य लोगों तक भी पहुंचती है, यह मैं बताना चाहता हूं। यह काम भी हमारी सरकार ने हाथ में लिया है और उसके ऊपर डटकर खड़े हुए हैं। हमारे उप प्रधान मंत्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी जी ने परसों इस विषय पर बहुत जमकर बात की और इसकी वजह से वहां जो लोग घुस रहे थे वे रुक सके। लेकिन मैं आपसे प्रार्थना करुंगा कि इस विषय में तेजी लाने की जरूरत है। अगर हम इसमें तेजी नहीं लाएंगे तो बड़ी मुश्किल होगी।

मैं यह भी बताना चाहता हूं कि अभी हाल में सिनेमा हॉल में राष्ट्रीय गीत बजना शुरू हो गया है। उसकी आवश्यकता भी है। मैं उसका पूरा समर्थन करने वाला हूं। जहां जब भी राष्ट्रीय गीत होता हो तो हमें उठ कर खड़े होना चाहिए तथा राष्ट्रीय गीत का मान रखना चाहिए। यह भी हमारा फर्ज बनता है। लेकिन एक बड़ी दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण घटना है कि परसो एक कार्यक्रम में पश्चिम बंगाल के मुख्य मंत्री राष्ट्रीय गीत के समय खड़े नही हुए। यह क्या है मैं समझ नही पाया। ऐसी स्थिति मैंने कभी नही देखी। अगर लीडर्स लोग भी इस तरह का बर्ताव करेंगे तो हम जनता से क्या उम्मीद कर सकते हैं। इसलिए इस विषय पर गौर से विचार करने की आवश्यकता है। मैं अपने सभी सांसद भाईयों से प्रार्थना करुंगा कि आप यह विषय हंसी मजाक में न ले और गंभीरतापूर्वक इस विषय को मुख्य मंत्री जी को बताइए। ऐसी घटना आगे न घटे यह भी देखने की आवश्यकता है।

आजकल एक और विषय चल रहा है जिसके उल्लेख करने की आवश्यकता है। वह अयोध्या का मसला है जो बहुत दिनो से चलता आ रहा है। इस विषय को जल्द ही समाप्त करना चाहिए तथा इस पर राजनीति से ऊपर उठकर विचार करना चाहिए। अगर इस पर कोई भी राजनीति करता है तो ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं दो मिनट में खत्म कर रहा हूं।

प्रो0 रामगोपाल यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) : जब चुनाव निकल जाएंगे तो अपने आप खत्म हो जाएगा।

श्री सतीश प्रधान : जरा गंभीरतापूर्वक सोचिए इस विषय पर। अगर हम कहेंगे कि मंदिर चाहिए मुस्लिम कहेंगे मस्जिद चाहिए तो इस तरह से हल निकलने वाला नहीं है। अगर हमको इसका हल निकालना है तो यहां राष्ट्रीय स्मारक बनाएं तथा मंदिर दूसरी जगह बगल में बनाओ। अगर यह व्यवस्था मंजूर होती है तो ब्रिटिशो के खिलाफ जो पहली लड़ाई छिड़ी थी वह लड़ाई मंगल पांडे ने शुरू की थी। इसलिए वहां पर मंगल पांडे का स्मारक बनाओ, यह हमारा प्रस्ताव है। तो आप लोग गौर से इस विषय पर विचार कीजिएगा।

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : आप सरकार से हट कर बोल रहे हैं। क्या आपने बात कर ली है?

श्री सतीश प्रधान : मैं पार्टी का सुझाव दे रहा हूं, शिव सेना का यह प्रस्ताव है।

मैडम्, कश्मीर में और नौर्थ-ईस्ट में रेल पहुंच रही है। यदि कश्मीर में या नौर्थ-ईस्ट मे रेलवे जाती है तो यह बहुत अभिनंदनीय बात है तथा यह बहुत अच्छा कदम उठाया है क्योंकि हम सभी इस देश के वासी हैं और हम नेग्लेक्टेड अलग से नहीं पड़े हैं। वे भी हमारे भाई हैं और उनके यहां भी रेलवे जाने की आवश्यकता है। इसका बहुत अच्छा नतीजा होगा।

मैडम्, आखिरी पोइंट और है जो बिजली के बारे में है। बिजली में हम 2012 तक स्वयंपूर्ण हो जाएंगे ऐसी भी योजना सरकार ने बनाई है। उस पर काम शुरू है और इसके लिए सरकार का अभिनंदन करना चाहिए। सरकार की ओर से हमारे राष्ट्रपति जी ने संयुक्त अधिवेशन के समय जो भाषण किया और यह सब विचार आपके सामने रखे, सरकार की कार्रवाई सामने रखी उसके लिए उनको धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूं और मैं अपने सभी सांसद भाईयों से विनती करता हूं कि आप सभी लोग यह प्रस्ताव पारित करें। धन्यवाद।

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : केवल भाईयो से प्रार्थना की आपने, बहनों से नही की।...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सतीश प्रधान : नही-नहीं, सबको कहा है।

उपसभापति : अगर आपको बहनो का इतना ही ख्याल होता तो आप महिलाओं के आरक्षण बिल के बारे में अपने भाषण में कुछ बोल सकते थे।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Motion that has been moved and seconded is, that an Address be presented to the President in the following terms:-

"That the Members of the Rajya Sabha assembled in this Session are deeply grateful to the President for the Address which he has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on February 17, 2003."

Now, I have to inform all the Members that there are 494 amendments to the Motion, which may be moved at this stage. I will call the names of Members who have given these amendments. Dr. Abrar Ahmed.

DR. ABRAR AHMED (Rajasthan): Madam, I move:

1. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of the Government to check the continuing atrocities on minorities, dalits and other weaker sections of the society."

2. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention about communal tension and caste confrontations in the country and steps taken by Government to curb them."

3. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the protection of minorities, their development and safety of different religious places."

4. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not condemn the actions of some fundamentalist organisations responsible for disturbing communal harmony."

5. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that Address fails to mention that the Government is not sincere about empowerment of women."

6. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not categorically state that the Constitution Amendment Bill, 1999 seeking reservation of not less than one third of the seats for women in the Lok Sabha and in the Legislative assemblies of States will be considered and passed in the current budget session itself."

7. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to take stern steps against communalisation of education and culture of the country and distortion of history."

8. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need to provide adequate funds for immediate elimination of child labour in hazardous industries."

9. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of the Government to improve the plight of the farmers."

10. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's failure to provide adequate aid to drought hit State of Rajasthan."

11. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the increasing population at alarming rate, proper employment opportunities and proper health services for the poor in the country."

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Prof. Saif-Ud-Din Soz.

PROF. SAIF-UD-DIN SOZ (Jammu and Kashmir): Madam, I move:

12. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention that the Government should respond to the genuine aspirations of the people of J&K State who braved all odds, but participated in the recent elections to the J&K Assembly."

13. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's initiative to devise special scheme for employment of educated unemployed youth of J&K State."

14. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention as to when the railway line from Jammu to Udhampur will be completed on which work has been going on for more than 25 years."

15. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about special allocation of funds for development of horticulture in J&K State."

16. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the funds earmarked exclusively for development activities out of the Rs. 6000 crores earmarked by Prime Minister for security and development."

17. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about corruption in the judiciary.

18. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not indicate a sense of urgency' to remove slums and provide equitable treatment to the people."

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Amendment Nos. 19 to 94, Dr. T. Subbarami Reddy, not here. Amendment Nos. 95 to 135, Shri Ram Jethmalani, not here. Amendment Nos. 95 to 135 are also standing in the name of Shri Kapil Sibal. He may move them.

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL (Bihar): Madam, I move:-

95. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the implementation of any scheme to create employment in the agricultural sector."

96. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the period to finally execute the scheme of development to check the migration from the rural areas."

97. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the scheme for increasing the number of skilled workers in the country."

98. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the scheme to increase the industrial produce with a view to enhancing 6 percent contribution of the animal husbandry industry to gross domestic product."

99. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the scheme to promote the cottage industry sector in the food processing industry."

100. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any time-bound scheme for the literacy of the illiterate adults."

101. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about providing free education to the people living below the poverty line by making an elaborate arrangement of vocational education in the country."

102. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the time-bound scheme to construct a hospital within a radius of every 5 kilometres to provide free medical treatment to the people living below the poverty line."

103. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the scheme for digging and cleaning of the rivers with a view to increasing their capacity of water reserve."

104. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about time-bound scheme for achieving the target of water conservation."

105. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the determination of completing the irrigation projects within the specified time."

106. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about taking concrete steps for making the administration effective and accountable."

107. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about effective steps to be taken to prevent the various causes endangering the internal security."

108. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the aggressive concrete action to be taken to plug the sources of terrorists with a view to eliminate cross border terrorism."

109 That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the measures to be taken to curb ill-effects on industries as a result of industrial policy for effecting economic reforms."

110. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the time-bound scheme to enhance self-reliance in the petroleum sector."

111. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the declaration of any policy to contain the prices of sources of power."

112. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the measures to be taken under the power-sector reforms to bring improvement in the projects generating power below their installed capacity."

113. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the implementation of time-bound scheme for the utilization of hydro-electric capacity available in the country."

114. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the declaration of time-bound scheme for the development of slums in the urban areas.

115. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the declaration of a separate industrial policy for the development of cottage and small scale industries."

116. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about a special development scheme separately for the identification and development of backward States of the country."

117. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about a time-bound scheme for making barren land of the country cultivable."

118. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be added namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the scheme of expansion of education system for providing education to all the children in the age group of 6-14."

119. That at the *end* of the Motion,, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the scheme of treatment of contaminated water for making the rivers of the country pollution-free."

120. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the target for the development of the conventional industries of the country."

121. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the scheme to make the public sector sick industries profitable."

122. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the measures to be taken for bridging the wide gap in the

prices at the production level and consumer level in the country."

123. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the measures to be taken for removing the uncertainty in the budget of common man due to the continuous hike in the travelling expanses."

124. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the time-bound scheme for the implementation of the measures for checking the continuous depletion of the underground water level."

125. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the measures to be taken to avoid the adverse effects on agriculture due to the subsidy given by America for agriculture and agriculture related areas."

126. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about declaration of any policy for giving exemption from all kinds of taxes to the units with an investment of Rs.50,000/- in the cottage industry sector."

127. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the declaration of any policy for not charging any interest on

all kinds of loans for a period of 10 years from the start of production from the units with the investment of upto rupees 1 lakh in the small scale industry sector."

128. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the declaration of any policy to be adopted to fix the consumer prices of the petroleum products in the country on the basis of their cost of production."

129. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the declaration to ban the vulgar telecast by broadcasting media, polluting the culture, traditions and civilization of the country."

130. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about effective steps to be taken to curb religious fanaticism in the country."

131. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the arrangement for effective treatment of increasing number of AIDS patients in the country."

132. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about making the communication policy effective to solve the

disputes arising out of ambiguity in the communication policy in the country."

133. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about a declaration of a concrete policy to solve the Kashmir problem."

134. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about declaration of effective steps to be taken to improve the relations with neighbouring countries."

135. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about a declaration of any formula acceptable to all to solve the issue of disputed structure in Ayodhya."

BY SHRI RAMACHANDRA KHUNTIA (Orissa) : Madam, I move:-

136. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about amending the Bonus Act to waive out the ceiling and quantum Bonus."

137. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about ratification of ILO Convention 1987 and 1998 for giving

freedom of Association and Protection of Right to organise and Collective bargaining Convention."

138. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about ratification of ILO Convention No. 138 regarding Minimum Age Convention (1973) and Worst form of Child Labour Convention No. 182 of 1999."

139. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about ratification of ILO Safety and Health in construction Convention No. 167,162 and recommendation 172 of 1988 including the convention on ban on Asbestos."

140. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about realisation of Non Performing Assets of Nationalised Banks."

141. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about need for an action plan for sustainable forest development, environment protection and protection of Wildlife."

142. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about any specific action plan for interlinking of major rivers of the country."

143. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about an action plan for upgradation of skilled unorganised workers which constitute 90% of the Workforce."

144. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about urgent need for employment generation and employment protection and new employment opportunities for unemployed youths."

145. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about approval of the revised Long Term Action Plan for KBK districts submitted by the Orissa Government."

146. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about early allotment of houses to the flood/super cyclone affected people of Orissa under Indira Avas Scheme."

147. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about upgradation of the Crew/ Training Institute at Chandbali in Orissa and to declare it as a Regional Training Institute."

148. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about establishment of Regional Office of Inland Waterways Authority of India at Bhubanes War."

149. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about increase of Union Government share in the share capital of Orissa State Road Transport Corporation."

150. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about declaring Orissa as a Special Category State."

151. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about mandatory implementation of the Building and other construction workers Act, 1996 in all the States/Union Territories."

152. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about taking up afforestation work immediately in Super Cyclone and flood affected areas of Orissa."

153. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about increasing the quantity of foodgrains allocated to Orissa under targeted Public distribution System."

154. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about early completion" of work on Paradeep Oil Refinery."

155. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about accelerating the release of balance funds to Orissa under Accelerated Power Development Programme."

156. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about substantial release of funds to Orissa under PMGY Scheme in order to complete the electrification of remaining villages in the State."

157. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about declaration of road from Puri to Satapada as National Highway."

158. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about upgradation of Berhampur-Koraput road in Orissa to National Highway."

159. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about upgradation of Khurda-Bolangir *via* Nayagarh-Daspalla-Boudh-Sonepur road in Orissa to National Highway."

160. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about upgradation of Jeypore-Motu-Baipariguda-Mathili-Malkangiri-Kalimela Road in Orissa to National Highway."

161. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about upgradation of Jaleswar-Chandaneswar Inter-State road connecting Orissa with West Bengal to National Highway."

162. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about declaration of Utkal University as Centre of Excellence."

163. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about release of more funds to Orissa for Computerisation of Land Records Project."

164. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about conversion/regularisation of pre-1980 Forest Villages/ encroached human settlements in the forest areas as Revenue Villages in Orissa."

165. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about early grant of autonomous status to the colleges recommended by the State Government of Orissa."

166. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about early sanction of the proposals for opening of 12 new National Child Labour Project Schools in Orissa."

167. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about merger of M/s. Hindustan Cables Limited with Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited."

168. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about steps taken by the Government to check the large scale killing of Ridley Turtles by foreign fishing trawlers on Orissa Coast."

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Amendment Nos. 169 to 232, Dr. Dasari Narayana Rao, not here.

BY SHRI J. CHITHARANJAN (Kerala): Madam, I move:-

233. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not express its concern about the growing unemployment in the country leading the frustrated young people to join various militant and insurgent organisations."

234. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not express its concern over the steep fall in prices of agricultural produce including cash crops like rubber, tea, coffee, cotton, etc. resulting in severe losses and indebtedness to millions of farmers all over the country and urges upon the Government to take immediate and necessary steps to relieve the farmers from their miserable plight."

235. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not express its concern over the pathetic socio-economic status of women in the country-side and urges upon the Government to take immediate steps for formulating special schemes aimed at improving the socio-economic conditions of rural women particularly those engaged in agriculture sector."

236. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need for enacting a central legislation providing for minimum wages and welfare for the agricultural workers through out the country."

237. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need to take effective steps to combat the growing atrocities against women and girl children in the country."

238. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not express its concern over the serious crisis in the availability of safe drinking water in rural areas in the country."

239. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need for ensuring remunerative prices to the farmers for the agricultural produce in consonance with the rising cost of inputs."

240. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the recent drift in the established foreign policy of the Government in favour of United States."

241 That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not express its concern over the inadequate medical facilities in the rural areas of the country and need to provide specialised medical facilities by setting up well equipped public hospitals in rural areas."

242 That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the unresolved long pending inter-state river disputes in the country and need to evolve an effective mechanism and procedure to resolve such disputes."

243 That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the dwindling budget allocation for social security measures in the successive budgets."

244 That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need to attain economic self-reliance and to review the adverse impact of the policy of globalisation-liberalisation and privatisation on the Indian economy."

245. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the increased atrocities on women, Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and other Backward Class people in the country and need to take effective administrative and legislative measures to prevent such atrocities."

246. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need for evolving a rehabilitation programme for the workers coming out of public sector undertakings as a result of closures."

247. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need for making Right to Employment a Fundamental Right in the Constitution."

248. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to take steps against communalisation of education and culture of the country and distortion of history."

249. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to take measures to ensure regular payment of wages to the workers in various public sector undertakings."

250. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to take steps for empowerment of rural women."

251. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the drawbacks in the planning resulting in the regional imbalances in the country in respect of per capita national product and income, illiteracy, poverty, unemployment, health and sanitary condition, etc."

252. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the fact that it is the Government's failure to generate productive wage employment in rural areas that lead to large scale migration to urban areas resulting in an urban population explosion, coming up of slums, deteriorating health and sanitary conditions, etc."

253. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not categorically state that the Constitution (85th Amendment) Bill, 1999 seeking reservation of not less than one third of the seats for women in the Lok Sabha and in the Legislative Assemblies of States will be considered and passed in the current budget session itself."

254. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the fact that the proposed Labour Laws reforms will go against the interests of workers and curtail their statutory rights."

255. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not express its serious concern over the reckless entry of multinational companies into the Indian economy and their strategic takes overs and acquisitions of Indian companies."

256. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the fact that workers in a number of public sector undertakings are not being paid their wages and other statutory dues regularly."

257. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the inordinate delay in the implementation of revival package for a number of sick industrial units."

258. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the fact that Government's policy of downsizing the workforce in the public sector undertakings including banks through VRS/VSS, etc. will only fatten the army of unemployed in the country."

259. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of moves of the Government to gradually eliminate the public distribution system in the country."

260. That at the end of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention the need to amend the payment of Bonus Act removing the eligibility ceiling, and enhancing the payment ceiling."

261. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not express its serious concern over the Government's move to commercialise the education making higher education costly and closing the door of education to the vast multitude of poor people."

262. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not express its serious concern over the situation arising out of the unilateral US threatening of a war against Iraq and its impact on the global economy."

263. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the fact that the economic reforms process has neglected agriculture and as a result growth rate of agricultural production has been declining during the nineties."

264. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the fact that the decline in agriculture and rural economy has resulted in decline in purchasing capacity of almost two third population of the country."

265. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the fact that the per capita income growth rate is slated to fall to 2.4 per cent in 2002-03 against 4.3 per cent in the previous year."

266. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the fact that the projected GDP growth for the current financial year, which is also the first year of the Tenth Plan, is only 4.4 per cent against the targeted 8 per cent yearly growth for the Tenth Plan period."

267. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need to take effective steps to abolish child labour in the country."

268. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need to take effective measures to abolish bonded labour."

BY SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE (West Bengal) : Madam, I move:-

269. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the fiscal demands of the State Government and the improvement in centre-state relations."

270. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the serious problem of erosion on the banks of River Ganges, etc., and the plight of people residing on them."

271. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the large scale preparation of war to attack Iraq by USA and Britain with an ill motive to interfere in the internal affairs of other countries."

272. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of the Government in checking the price hike of all the essential commodities including medicines."

273. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the impact of liberalisation and large scale privatisation resulting in further unemployment and hardships to the middle class and the poor."

274. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the atrocities on minorities in Gujarat."

275. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the report of the Minority Commission and Human Rights Commission about the large scale mishap in Gujarat."

276. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the communal tension and caste confrontations in the country properly."

277. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the growing Railway accidents and loss of lives."

278. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the starvation deaths in different parts of the country while huge amount of foodgrains is rotting in the godowns."

279. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the large scale corruption during the scale of Public Undertakings to private parties."

280. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the addition of economic empowerment with political empowerment *i.e.*. 33 per cent reservation of women in Parliament and State Assembly."

श्री बालकवि बैरागी : मैडम मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूँ कि :

281. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि इस भाषण के माध्यम से भारत सरकार ने राष्ट्रपति द्वारा एन.डी.ए. के आगामी चुनाव घोषणा पत्र का वाचन करवा दिया है ।"

282. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि गुजरात विधान सभा के विगत चुनावों का उल्लेख इस तरह किया गया है कि भारत में साम्प्रदायिक सौहार्द, अलगाव और कटुता की आग में झुलसता रहे ।"

283. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अयोध्या प्रसंग को इस तरह उठाया गया है मानो महामहिम राष्ट्रपति महोदय सुप्रीम कोर्ट पर न्याय प्रक्रिया में दबाव डाल रहे हों । यह सुप्रीम कोर्ट के दायरे पर सीधा प्रहार है ।"

284. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि सीमापार के आतंकवाद का उल्लेख करते समय इस भाषण में देश के भीतर बढ़ती आतंकवादी गतिविधियों का कोई जिक्र नहीं किया गया है जबकि देश में विगत वर्ष ऐसी गतिविधियां बढ़ी हैं ।"

285. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि इस अभिभाषण में आई.एस.आई. की गतिविधियों पर कोई चिंता व्यक्त नहीं की गई है ।"

286. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि महिला आरक्षण बिल के बारे में एक भी शब्द नहीं बोला गया है ।"

287. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि इराक के बारे में भारत सरकार की नीति का कोई खुलासा नहीं किया गया है ।"

288. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि विगत वर्ष भारतीय रेलों में दुर्घटनाओं की बढ़ती संख्या पर कुछ भी नहीं कहा गया है ।"

289. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि एक करोड़ लोगो को प्रति वर्ष रोजगार देने वाले वचन का पालन नही होने पर भी रोजगार के क्षेत्र में सरकार के बड़बोलेपन का परिचय दिया है ।"

290. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि किसानो द्वारा की जाने वाली आत्महत्याओ के कारणो पर कोई प्रकाश नही डाला गया है ।"

291. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि नदियों को जोड़ने वाली महत्वपूर्ण योजना को पीछे धकेल दिया गया है ।"

292. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि सार्क देशो मे आज भारत का कोई भी देश मित्र नही रहा है और विदेश नीति की यह विफलता है ।"

293. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि दक्षिण अफ्रीका मे विश्व कप क्रिकेट खेलने वाली भारतीय टीम को कटाक्ष की भाषा मे शुभ कामनाएं देकर टीम के मनोबल को तोड़ा गया है । हमारे खिलाड़ियों को प्रच्छन्न तौर से हतोत्साहित ही किया जाना चिंता का विषय है ।

294. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि भारत के किसानों द्वारा विपुल मात्रा मे पैदा किये जाने वाले उत्पादन को नही सम्हाल पाने पर भारतीय खाद्य निगम को क्षमा कर दिया गया है ।"

295. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि दूरसंचार के क्षेत्र मे अपने गाल बजने वाली सरकार ने दूरसंचार क्रांति की नींव भरने वाले क्रांति-पुरूष स्व.राजीव गांधी का नाम लेना भी ठीक नही समझा है । यह कृतघ्नता निन्दनीय है ।"

296. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि सार्वजनिक वितरण प्रणाली की असफलता का कोई उल्लेख इस पूरे अभिभाषण मे नहीं किया गया है ।"

297. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि पाकिस्तान के खिलाफ पहले देश में युद्धोन्माद का ज्वार उठाने के बाद सीमा पर सशस्त्र सेना को तैनात करने के बाद जिस तरह सेनाओं को वापस बुलाया गया उससे हमारी सेनाओं का मनोबल टूटा है । इस निर्णय के औचित्य पर सरकार बिलकुल चुप रही है ।"

298. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि पूरे अभिभाषण में भारत के हृदय क्षेत्र मध्य प्रदेश के मंदसौर नगर में उद्यानिकी (बागवानी) विश्वविद्यालय की स्थापना का कोई उल्लेख नही है जबकि भारत के समूचे मध्य क्षेत्र में उद्यानिकी की एक भी युनिवर्सिटी नही है । मंदसौर का डॉ0 कैलाशनाथ काटजू उद्यानिकी महाविद्यालय इस विश्वविद्यालय के लिए सारी कसौटियों पर खरा उतरता है ।"

299. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि भारत के द्वीपीय क्षेत्रों के विकास पर कोई उल्लेखनीय योजना प्रस्तावित नहीं है ।"

300. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि सरकार 'मुख्यधारा' का जिक्र जिस तरह करती है उसका हर शब्द गुजरात में हुए 2002 के अमानवीय दंगों की याद दिलाता है । अल्पसंख्यकों को 'मुख्यधारा' से जोड़ने वाला अभियान इस सरकार की मानसिक कुटिलता का परिचायक है ।"

301. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों में पेयजल की सारी स्थितियों को इस सरकार ने वर्षा और बादलों तथा मानसून के भरोसे छोड़ दिया गया है । यह इस सरकार की शुतुर्मुर्ग-प्रवृत्ति का प्रमाण है ।"

302. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि इस सरकार के कार्यकाल में संसदीय प्रणाली और लोकतंत्र मे नैतिक मूल्यों की गिरावट पर राष्ट्रपतिजी का मुंह बंद रखा गया है ।"

303. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में कश्मीर समस्या' पर देश किस मोड़ या मुकाम पर खड़ा है इसका कोई जिक्र नहीं है ।"

304. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि सरकार की विनिवेश नीति पर बहुत ही चतुराई से पर्दा डाल दिया गया है ।"

305. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि कृषि के क्षेत्र में मज़दूरों की निरन्तर घटती संख्या पर कोई चिंता व्यक्त नहीं की गई है । पांच वर्ष पहले इस क्षेत्र में 40 प्रतिशत योगदान देने जैसा प्रतिशत विगत तीन वर्षों में 17 प्रतिशत रह गया है ।"

306. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि ग्रामीण डाक कर्मचारियों की समस्या पर एक शब्द भी इस अभिभाषण में नहीं है । आज करीब डेढ़ लाख ऐसे कर्मचारी भविष्य विहीन होकर अपना जीवन यापन कर रहे हैं ।"

307. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि राजभाषा हिन्दी के प्रगामी प्रयोग की स्थिति पर समूचे अभिभाषण में एक शब्द भी नहीं लिखा, कहा या बोला गया है ।"

308. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि सारे देश में राजभाषा हिन्दी के लिए काम करने वाले लोगों के सैकड़ों पद विभिन्न स्तरों पर खाली पड़े हैं और संसद द्वारा निर्धारित राजभाषा नीति पंगु कर दी गई है इस पर इस भाषण में 'हिन्दी' को कोई स्थान नहीं दिया गया है । इन पदों को भरने में जो बाधाएं हैं वे कैसे दूर होंगी ।"

309. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि रासायनिक उर्वरकों ने हमारी कृषि भूमि की उर्वरकता को शनैःशनैः नष्ट कर दिया है, तब फिर जैविक उर्वरक के लिए सरकार प्रशिक्षण का कौन सा उपक्रम कर रही है, यह इस दस्तावेज़ में स्पष्ट नहीं है ।"

310. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि पूरे भाषण 'स्वदेशी' भावना यह कार्यक्रम का कोई विवरण नहीं है । यह इस सरकार को 'स्वदेशी विरोधी' मन का स्पष्टीकरण है । इसकी निन्दा इस भाषण में अनुपस्थित है ।"

311. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि सरकार की 'खेल नीति' शब्दों के जंगल में भटक गई है। भारत का युवा वर्ग इससे निराश होगा ।"

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Amendment Nos. 312 to 315, Shri Rama Shanker Kaushik, not here. Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav may move these amendments.

PROF. RAM GOPAL YADAV : Madam, I move:-

312. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any announcement regarding protection of democratic values by checking the atrocious action being taken by State Government against the workers of opposition parties in Uttar Pradesh."

313. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not give any assurance for elimination of injustice and exploitation of farmers of the country in general and of Uttar Pradesh in particular."

314. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about uprooting the conspiracy being hatched by some fundamentalist organisation to harm the communal harmony in the country."

315. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about efforts to check the terrorist activities in the country and streamline the law and order situation in the country."

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : मैडम, मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूं कि :

316. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में भोपाल में प्राथमिकता आधार पर मध्य प्रदेश के उच्च न्यायालय की स्थायी पीठ को स्थापित करने संबंधी सरकार के संकल्प के बारे मे उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

317. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में इस तथ्य का कोई उल्लेख नही है कि जब कभी भी चुनाव होने होते हैं तो रा0ज0ग0 का मुख्य साझेदार राजनैतिक कारणों से एक या दूसरे रूप में अयोध्या मामले को ताज़ा कर देता है ।

318. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में इस आश्वासन का उल्लेख नही है कि सरकार राजनैतिक लाभ, और राष्ट्र की एकता और अखंडता को नष्ट करने हेतु देश मे साम्प्रदायिक विद्वेश फैलाने वाले कट्टरपंथी संगठनों पर प्रतिबन्ध लगायेगी ।"

319. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश मे बढ़ती अराजकता के बारे मे उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

320. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश मे बढ़ती गरीबी के संबंध मे उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

321. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में असामाजिक और देश विरोधी तत्वों द्वारा घृणास्पद गतिविधियो के लिए राष्ट्र के बेरोजगार युवाओ को लुभाने और एक समयबद्ध रूप मे सभी बेरोजगार युवाओं को रोजगार मुहैया कराने की सरकार की प्रतिबद्धता के संबंध मे कोई उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

322. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे संविधान मे संशोधन करते हुए कार्य के अधिकार को मौलिक अधिकार बनाये जाने के संबंध में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

323. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे देश के बेरोजगार युवको को बेरोजगारी भत्ते का भुगतान किये जाने के संबंध में कोई उल्लेख नही है ।"

324. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे वरिष्ठ नागरिको, विधवाओ और असहायो की समस्याओ और दुखो तथा उनकी समस्याओ को प्राथमिकता के आधार पर हल किये जाने के सरकार के संकल्प के संबंध में कोई उल्लेख नही है ।"

325. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे देश मे विकलांग व्यक्तियो की समस्याओ तथा बेरोजगारी और उनकी समस्याओ को प्राथमिकता के आधार पर हल किये जाने के सरकार के संकल्प के संबंध मे कोई उल्लेख नही है ।"

326. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे देश मे मानसिक रूप से विक्षिप्त व्यक्तियो की दुर्दशा और उनके पुनर्वास संबंधी सरकार के संकल्प के बारे मे कोई उल्लेख नही है ।"

327. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे देश मे बाल श्रमिको जो अपने बचपन का आनन्द उठाने के बजाय जीवन यापन के लिए काम कर रहे है, के दुखों और समस्या को प्राथमिकता के आधार पर विचार करने के सरकार के संकल्प के संबंध मे कोई उल्लेख नही है ।"

328. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे देश की महिला जनसंख्या के मध्य विद्यमान निरक्षरता के संबंध मे कोई उल्लेख नही है ।"

329. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे मजदूरी और अन्य मामलो के संबंध मे कृषि, बागान और निर्माण कर्मकारो के शोषण और इस शोषण को रोकने के सरकार के संकल्प के संबंध मे कोई उल्लेख नही है ।"

330. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे मध्य प्रदेश मे पेयजल की भारी कमी जोकि राज्य मे लगातार सूखे के कारण बढ़ गयी है और इस समस्या से उबरने

के लिए पर्याप्त केन्द्रीय निधि जारी किये जाने के सरकार के संकल्प के संबंध में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

331. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में भोपाल में राजाभोज विमानपत्तन को अन्तर्राष्ट्रीय विमानपत्तन के रूप में विकसित किये जाने के सरकार के संकल्प के संबंध में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

332. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में मध्य प्रदेश और छत्तीसगढ़ में निरन्तर सूखे की स्थिति के कारण छिन्न-भिन्न अर्थव्यवस्था और इन दो राज्यों की अर्थव्यवस्था का प्राथमिकता के आधार पर पुनरूद्धार करने के सरकार के संकल्प के संबंध में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

333. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में मध्य प्रदेश और छत्तीसगढ़ की जनजातीयों के बीच पिछड़ेपन, निरक्षरता तथा ऋणग्रस्तता और उनके लिए प्रभावी कल्याणकारी उपाय आरम्भ करने के सरकार के संकल्प के संबंध में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

334. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में मध्य प्रदेश के त्वरित औद्योगिकीकरण के सरकार के निश्चय का उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

335. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में मध्य प्रदेश में बीना रिफाइनरी परियोजना को प्राथमिकता के आधार पर पूरा किए जाने के सरकार के संकल्प का उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

336. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में मध्य प्रदेश के सोयाबीन और अन्य तेल बीज उत्पादकों की दुर्दशा और उनकी समस्याओं को हल करने के लिए सरकार के संकल्प का उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

337. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश में गंभीर विद्युत कमी और इस निरंतर चल रही समस्या को हल करने के सरकार के प्रयासों के बारे में उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

339. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे मध्य प्रदेश में कपास और अन्य वस्त्र मिलों के बन्द होने, जिससे लाखो कर्मकार नौकरी विहीन हो गए तथा इन मिलों को प्राथमिकता के आधार पर पुनरूज्जीवित करने के सरकार के संकल्प का उल्लेख नही है ।

340. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे मध्य प्रदेश की प्रदूषित नदियो और उनको साफ करने के सरकार के संकल्प का उल्लेख् नहीं है ।"

341. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे देश का उत्तम गुणवत्ता वाला गेहूं उगाने वाले मध्य प्रदेश के किसानों की दुर्दशा और उनकी समस्याओं पर ध्यान देने के सरकार के संकल्प का उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

342. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में मध्य प्रदेश में खादी क्षेत्र को प्रोत्साहित करने के सरकार के प्रयासों के बारे मे उल्लेख नही है ।"

343. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में मध्य प्रदेश में बड़े रूप मे हस्तशिल्पों और अन्य ग्रामोद्योगों को बढ़ावा देने के सरकार के संकल्प के बारे में उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

344. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे मध्य प्रदेश और देश के अन्य भागों में बीड़ी कर्मकारो की दुर्दशा और उनकी समस्याओं को हल करने के सरकार के संकल्प का उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

345. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे देश मे संचालित किए जा रहे समानान्तर नकली दवा बाजार और इस संकट से प्रभावी रूप से निपटने के सरकार के संकल्प का उल्लेख नही है ।"

346. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे आवास के अधिकार को एक मौलिक अधिकार बनाने के बारे मे उल्लेख नही है ।"

347. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में राष्ट्रीय राजधानी के भूमि घोटाले और सरकारी तथ्यों के रहस्योद्घाटन के लिये एक न्यायिक जांच का संकल्प लेने के बारे में उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

348. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में रक्षा सौदों के संबंध में तहलका टेपों में जांच पूरी करने के लिये सरकार की प्राथमिकता का उल्लेख नही है ।"

349. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में दूरदर्शन चैनलों में अश्लीलता पर प्रतिबंध लगाने के लिए सरकार के संकल्प का उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

350. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में एन0सी0ई0आर0टी0, आई0सी0एच0आर0, सी0बी0आई0 इत्यादि जैसे सरकारी अभिकरणों का राजनीतिक उद्देश्यों के लिये दुरूपयोग न करने देने के सरकार के संकल्प का उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

351. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में बैंकों और वित्तीय संस्थानों में असंख्य एन0पी0ए0 और इस संकट को हल करने के लिए सरकार के संकल्प का उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

352. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में आई0एफ0सी0आई0 और अन्य रूग्ण वित्तीय संस्थानों को पुनरूज्जीवित करने के सरकार के संकल्प का उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

353. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में विशेष रूप से मध्य प्रदेश में पेयजल परियोजनाओं के लिये विदेशी वित्तीय सहायता मांगे जाने के बारे में उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

354. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे महिलाओं की अधिकारिता के लिये सरकार के संकल्प का उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

355. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश में ऐतिहासिक स्मारकों की घोर उपेक्षा के बारे में उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Amendment Nos. 356 to 374, Shri Vijay Singh Yadav, not here.

श्रीमती सरोज दुबे (बिहार): मैडम, मैं प्रस्ताव करती हूँ कि :-

375. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में 10वीं पंचवर्षीय योजना के दौरान सकल घरेलु उत्पाद में 8 प्रतिशत का उच्च वार्षिक वृद्धि दर का लक्ष्य रखा गया है । लेकिन लक्ष्य प्राप्ति हेतु संसाधनों के बढ़ाने हेतु किसी भी खास रणनीति का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है ।"

376. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में विश्व आई0टी0 बाजार में भारतीय कंपनियों की भागीदारी सिर्फ 1.6 फीसदी है । इस भागीदारी को बढ़ाने संबंधी कोई उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

377. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में शिक्षा की गुणवत्ता बढ़ाने एवं इसे आधुनिकतम करने हेतु सरकारी शिक्षकों को नई तकनीकों का प्रशिक्षण दिलाने तथा स्कूलों में उचित प्रशासनिक प्रबंध किए जाने से संबंधित कोई उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

378. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में वैश्वीकरण के बढ़ते प्रभाव से महिलाओं के रोजगार और कार्य के क्षेत्र सिमटते जा रहे हैं। उन्हें विशेष तकनीकी प्रशिक्षण द्वारा रोजगार मुहैया कराने संबंधी कोई ठोस उपाय का उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

379. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में लोक सभा/विधानसभाओं में 33 प्रतिशत आरक्षण देते समय अल्पसंख्यक और अति पिछड़े वर्ग की महिलाओं के लिए आरक्षण के विशेष प्रावधान का उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

380. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में सांप्रदायिक सद्भाव बढ़ाने तथा जाति विद्वेष के अपशमन हेतु कोई भी ठोस उपाय निर्देशित नहीं किए गए है ।"

381. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में बिहार के विभाजन के समय बिहार के विकास हेतु केन्द्र सरकार द्वारा घोषित "आर्थिक पैकेज" की घोषणा की गई थी उसके लिए किसी भी समयबद्ध कार्यक्रम का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है ।"

383. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में अनाज के विपुल भंडार के होते हुए भी देश के विभिन्न भागों में भुखमरी का प्रकोप तथा उससे होने वाली मौतों को रोकने का कोई उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

384. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में जनता की क्रय शक्ति में वृद्धि करने हेतु किसी भी ठोस योजना का उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

385. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश में बालिकाओं की शिक्षा हेतु किसी विशेष प्रकल्प के अपनाये जाने का उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

386. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में ग्रामीण महिलाओं को बुनियादी सुविधायें (पानी, शौचालय, स्नानगृह, प्रसूति गृह) मुहैया कराने के संबंध में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

387. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में अपसंस्कृति की मार से बच्चों को बचाने के लिए दूरदर्शन तथा आकाशवाणी द्वारा खास तरह के मनोरंजक तथा शिक्षाप्रद बाल कॉर्यक्रम के संबंध में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

388. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में भिक्षाटन से गुजारा करने वाले बच्चों के लिए रात्रि आवास तथा नैश विद्यालयों की व्यवस्था संबंधी कोई उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

389. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश में निरंतर बढ़े हुए वायु प्रदूषण, जल तथा ध्वनि प्रदूषण से उत्पन्न होने वाले दुष्प्रभावों को रोकने के उपायों का कोई उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

390. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में पिछले दशक मे वायुसेना विमान की निरंतर बढ़ती हुई दुर्घटनाओं को रोकने के लिए ढांचागत सुविधाओं के पुनर्विन्यास का कोई उल्लेख नही है ।"

391. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश में गन्ना किसानो की फसल के मूल्यो के त्वरित लाभप्रद भुगतान तथा उनकी समस्याओ के निराकरण हेतु कोई भी कार्यक्रम का उल्लेख नही किया गया है ।"

श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी (पश्चिम बंगाल): मैडम, मैं प्रस्ताव करती हूँ कि :

392. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में इस बात का उल्लेख नहीं है कि आजादी के 55 वर्षों बाद भी महिलाओं ने जो सपने देखे थे वे सपने पूरे नही हुए है ।"

393. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे इस बात का उल्लेख नही है कि संविधान में उल्लेखित स्त्री-पुरूष समानाधिकारो की बात आज भी यथार्थ मे परिणत नही हो पायी है ।"

394. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में इस बात का उल्लेख नही है कि महिलाओ के सशक्तिकरण हेतु उनके आर्थिक, राजनैतिक तथा सामाजिक, सांस्कृतिक अधिकारो के प्रति सरकार गंभीर नही । विधान सभाओं तथा लोकसभा मे महिलाओ के लिए 33 प्रतिशत सीटे आरक्षित करवाने हेतु विधेयक को पारित करवाने के प्रति भी सरकार ईमानदार नही है ।"

395. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे इस बात का उल्लेख नहीं है कि नई आर्थिक नीतियो के चलते आम जनता का जीवन दूभर होता जा रहा है । रोजगार के अवसर लगातार खत्म होते जा रहे है ।"

396. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में इस बात का उल्लेख नहीं है कि नयी आर्थिक नीतियो का परिणाम महिलाओ की गरीबीकरण के रूप मे सामने आ रहा है ।"

397 प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में राज्यों के बढ़ते हुये वित्तिय संकट के बारे में कोई चर्चा नहीं की गयी है ।

398 प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे पश्चिम बंगाल में गंगा-पद्मा नदी के कटाव के कारण उत्पन्न संकट के बारे में कोई चर्चा नहीं की गई है ।"

399. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में कोलकाता नेताजी सुभाषचन्द्र बोस अन्तर्राष्ट्रीय विमानपत्तन पर अन्तर्राष्ट्रीय हवाई उड़ानों को बढ़ाकर इसे एक उच्च स्तर का हवाई पत्तन बनाने के बारे में कोई चर्चा नहीं की गयी है ।"

400. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में कृषि-क्षेत्र में उत्पादन में लगातार हो रही गिरावट तथा भयावह आर्थिक संकट से जूझ रहे किसानों की समस्याओं का कोई उल्लेख नहीं है ।"

401. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण मे औद्योगिक उत्पादन में हो रही गिरावट तथा लघु और मध्यम क्षेत्र की औद्योगिक इकाइयों के भारी संख्या में रूग्ण होने तथा बंद होने की कोई चर्चा नहीं है ।"

402. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में खेतीहर मजदूरों के लिये एक सर्वांगीण कानून बनाने की कोई चर्चा नही है ।"

403. प्रस्ताव के अंत मे निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में इस बात का उल्लेख नहीं है कि कार्य-क्षेत्रों पर महिलाओं के शारीरिक उत्पीड़न को रोकने हेतु कोई दंडात्मक प्रावधान नहीं है ।"

404. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"अभिभाषण में अमरीका और ब्रिटेन द्वारा इराक के खिलाफ विश्व जनमत की उपेक्षा करके युद्ध थोपने की साजिशों का कोई उल्लेख नही है ।"

405. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात् :-

"अभिभाषण में इस बात का उल्लेख नहीं है कि अयोध्या के मुददे को विश्व हिन्दू परिषद और संघ परिवार के अन्य संगठन समाज में फिर से साम्प्रदायिक उत्तेजना भड़काने के लिये कर रहे हैं ।"

BY SHRI S. RAMACHANDRAN PILLAI (Kerala): Madam, I move-

406. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over the adverse impact of the strategy of development based on the richer sections pursued by the Government on the economy and life of the common people."

407. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over the failure of the Government to show courage to oppose US threatening to attack Iraq."

408. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over the continuous attack on the democratic rights of the people by the Government."

409. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over the Government move to handing over the land acquired by the Government at Ayodhya to VHP."

410. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over the sad plight of the agriculture workers and people due to wrong Agriculture Policy."

411. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over the fall of agricultural prices."

412. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over the continuing attack on the parliamentary institutions by the Government."

413. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over the growing attack on workers in organised and unorganised sectors."

414. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to mention right to organise and collective bargain of workers."

415. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over the series of railway accidents."

416. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over the deteriorating law and order situation in the country."

417. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over the increasing attacks on women and SC/ST."

BY SHRI C.O. POULOSE (Kerala): Madam, I move :-

418. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over reported case of suicides by the farmers due to fall of prices of agricultural produces."

419. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern about the serious situation arising out of the Government's failure to streamline the public distribution system in the country."

420. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but there is no mention in the address that the Commission for reviewing the Constitution was constituted by-passing Parliament and violating all democratic norms."

421. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the address that the lifting of quantitative restrictions on imports endangered the indigenous industries."

BY SHRI RISHANG KEISHING(Manipur): Madam, I move:-

422. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to spell out Government's policy to deal with those insurgent outfits who have been continuously indulging in anti-social and unlawful activities in massive scale causing untold hardship to innocent and law abiding citizens."

423. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to point out that undue delay to accord sanction and to affect timely release of the required fund for schemes/projects for N.E. are the main causes leading to cost escalation, and delayed implementation resulting in continued backwardness of the Region."

424. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to clearly specify that Hindu Community which constitutes 90% of the country's population have to adhere to and practice the principle of secularism, in spirit and letter and thereby secure the unqualified support and confidence of the religious minority communities to solidify the national integration and unity."

425. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has not suggested the ways and norms to remove the causes which are obviating smooth implementation of the PMGSY and other development programmes specially in N.E. States."

426. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to mention the deplorable conditions of the National Highways in N.E. Region and suggest ways to bring the same at *par* with National Highways in the rest of the country."

427. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has not given even a hint for exploitation of the abundant hydro power potentiality available in N.E. Region as the national wealth of great value and importance."

428. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has not suggested a clear way out for the financially starving/deficit states to secure Central Sponsored Schemes and implement the same."

429. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has not indicated any clear policy or schemes to speed up the development of the remotest and inaccessible strategic border areas which remain as the main cause of discontentment among the people."

430. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has omitted grant of autonomous District Council under Schedule VI of the Constitution to hill people of Manipur."

431. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has made no mention to discourage or to restrain some sections of people or some

states from spearheading or enacting anti-minority religious Acts."

BY SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA (Rajasthan) : Madam, I move:-

432. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely: -

"but regret that the Address does not mention the Communal tension being created by the VHP and its allies."

433. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

but regret that the Address does not condemn the actions of VHP where theyare .going on donating arms in the name of Trishuls."

434. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not condemn the actions of VHP where time and again it has tried to take the Central Government as well as many State Governments on ransom."

435. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does the condemn the actions of VHP and its allies making derogatory statements against some minority communities in public and in front of the Media."

436. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention that the Govemment should begin a fresh round of talks with Kashmir Governrnent and the separatists."

437. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not in any way mentions the development of Trade and Industry in Jammu and Kashmir."

438. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the recent controversy of Pesticides found in bottled Mineral Water and the seriousness in this respect."

439. That at the *end of* the Motion, the following be *added* namely:"

"but regret that the Address does not mention the use of Plastic Bags having poisonous effect of long term packing of wheat, rice and sugar."

440. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention that all agencies in India have been incapable in the past to properly tests the effects of long term packing of food in Plastic Bags."

441. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention that a ban will be imposed on the use of Plastic Bags for packing food items due to its poisonous effects before concrete tests are done by National and International scientists."

442. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention the need to find new forms of fuels."

443. That at the *end* of the Motion. the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention the need to explore our deep seas for newer oil reserves."

444. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention opening Ayurveda as a subject to attract International Students to our universities to study it."

445. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention the failure of the Government's Primary Education System with respect to poor attendance of children, poor premises and shortage of teachers."

446. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention the failure of the Adult Education Programme."

447. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention the failure of the Government's Midday meals schemes in primary schools."

448. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention any plan or proposal to revive our prized exports of tea, jute, mangoes, etc."

449. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention the introduction of new and economically, viable cash crops for our farmers."

450. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention the Central Government's retarded effort to provide adequate help to Rajasthan in its worst ever drought."

451. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention of degradation of Law and Order of our country."

452. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the safety of Women of this country."

453. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention the speedy handling of all cases pending in all courts."

SHRI TARINI KANTA ROY (WEST BENGAL) : Madam, I move :-

454. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over the failure of the Government to put pressure on UN to end war game on Iraq."

455. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express serious concern about the country's falling into debt trap."

456. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be added namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express serious concern about the dangerous increase in per capita (foreign and internal) debt."

457. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express serious concern about the dangerous move of the Government to sell our public assets for a song."

458. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express serious concern about the Government's abandoning long established foreign policy of the country."

459. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express serious concern over the on going exploitation of workers and employees particularly the workers in unorganised sector."

460. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express serious concern over the reported cases of suicides by the farmers due to fall of prices of agricultural produces."

461. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express serious concern over the reported cases of starvation deaths in various parts of the country."

462. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express serious concern over the failure of the Government to prevent fundamentalist organisations openly defying the laws of the land especially in the case of Ayodhya issue."

463. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express serious concern over sharp declination of forest cover in the country."

464. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over the Government's attempt to privatise the Indian Railways by bifurcating Zonal Railways".

465. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has-failed to express concern over the Government's failure to contain the insurgency in the North-Eastern region."

466. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern over the growing unemployment in the country."

467. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern about the growing poverty in the country and the Government's failure to evolve a time bound action plan to eradicate it."

468. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern about the serious situation arising out of the Government's failure to streamline the public distribution system in the country."

469. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern about the "right to work" to be included in the constitution as a fundamental right."

470. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern about the Government's failure to formulate a new labour

policy to provide employment opportunities round the year to all sections of labourers."

471. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern about the Government's failure to initiate proper measures for the elimination of child labour in the country."

472. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express deep concern about the continuing incidents of atrocities on Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and the failure of the Government to take appropriate steps to stop such incidents."

473. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern about the growing incidents of attacks on the places of worship of the minority communities and the failure of the Government to stop such incidents."

474. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern about the Government's failure to formulate a comprehensive scheme for the educational and economic development of SC/ST and other backward classes."

475. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the eradication of illiteracy from the country."

476. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has failed to express concern about the need to control wide-spread land erosion which is taking place in Murshidabad, Nadia, Hooghly, Cooch Behar, Jalpaiguri and Bardhaman districts of West Bengal."

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (West Bengal) : Madam, I move :

477. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the inability of the Union Government to contain the growing fundamentalism amongst various sections in the society leading to social tensions.

478. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the inability of the Union Government to prevent rising communal conflicts and specially the communal holocaust in Gujarat.

479. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about inability of the Union Government to contain the cross border terrorism in the State of Jammu & Kashmir aided and abated by Pakistan."

480. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the inability of the Union Government to initiate the dialogue with the elected representatives of the people of Jammu & Kashmir along with other organisations in spite of the assurances given by the Prime Minister in his Red Fort Address on 15th August, 2002."

481. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the gross misuse of POTA in number of cases including detaining a person who is a minor (12 years old) despite the solemn assurances given to both Houses of Parliament by Union Home Minister that POTA will not be misused."

482. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the inability of the Union Government to detect and deport a large number of illegal migrants entering through porous borders of Indo-Bangladesh and taking shelters in different parts of the country."

483. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about Union Government to provide proper identity cards to genuine Indian citizens so that they are not mistaken as illegal migrants from Bangladesh."

484. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Government to achieve the targeted rate of GDP growth at eight per cent per year in the 1st year of Five Year Plan."

485. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Union Government to provide adequate budgetary support to augment the developmental outlay both at the Centre and at the State Plans for the year 2002-2003."

486. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Union Government to utilize huge foreign exchange reserve and substantial buffer stock of food-grains to inject the growth stimulant to Indian economy."

487. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Union Government to provide adequate financial assistance to the State Governments like Rajasthan, Madhya Pradesh, Chhattisgarh, Karnataka, etc. which have been seriously affected by centuries worst drought."

488. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the reckless disinvestment of profit making Central Public Sector Enterprises even in core sectors and thus diluting the accountability of the Executive to Parliament as most of these Central Public Sector Enterprises were established out of the resources from the Consolidated Fund of India approved by the Parliament."

489. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the inability of the Union Government to build up sufficient international pressure upon Pakistan to dissuade that State from aiding and abating the cross border terrorism."

490. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Union Government to involve other SAARC members to prevail upon Pakistan for creating conducive atmosphere for holding the SAARC summit meeting."

491. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Union Government to mobilize strong public opinion amongst non-aligned countries to prevent the proposed unilateral action against Iraq by USA."

492. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Union Government to prevent misuse of POTA by some State Governments to farther the partisan interests of the ruling parties in those States."

493. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address fails to mention about the failure of the Union Government to effectively combat the W wing extremists who are attempting to establish a compact revolutionary zone encompassing parts of Nepal, Bihar, Jharkhand, West Bengal, Orissa, Chhattisgarh, Andhra Pradesh, Madhya Pradesh and Maharashtra."

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL : Madam, I move:-

494. That at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about recent reports regarding the misuse of POTA requiring that appropriate amendments in POTA be immediately effected to prevent its gross misuse."

The questions were proposed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, the Motion and the amendments moved, are open for discussion.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (DR. MANMOHAN SINGH): Madam Deputy Chairperson, I thank the hon. President for the Address that he has presented to the Parliament. Before I begin with a substantive analysis of the contents of this Address, I would like to join my other

colleagues in paying homage to Smt. Kalpana Chawla and her six fellow astronauts, who died in the tragic break-up of Space Shuttle Columbia minutes before its touchdown on Ist February, 2003. Kalpana Chawla's exemplary courage and determination will continue to inspire our young people for generations to come. Madam, I also share the President's sense of joy that the people of Jammu and Kashmir in the October elections to the State Assembly, replied to the threat of the bullet, with the power of the ballot. I sincerely hope that the Central Government will fully cooperate with the Government of Jammu & Kashmir in sustaining the process of hope and confidence created by the outcome of the free and fair elections, and in meeting the legitimate aspirations of the people of Jammu & Kashmir for a life of dignity and self-respect. Madam, in this context, I welcome the commitment made in para 10 of the President's Address, which says that *the Centre is fully committed to working closely with the newly elected* Government in Jammu & Kashmir in its efforts to bring peace, normalcy and economic development of the State. The Prime Minister has announced projects and schemes worth over Rs. 6000 crores having various aspects of development and security, with a thrust on the generation of new employment opportunities for the youth and relief for migrants affected by militancy and cross-border shelling. It is my sincere hope that these intentions will be translated into concrete action on the ground.

Madam, as I listened to the President delivering his Address, I felt his Address could be divided into three parts. The first one relates to the management of the economy; the second relates to the national security scenario and how we are meeting the challenge to our national security; and the third deals with foreign policy initiatives. In dealing with all these areas, the Address does contain some welcome statements of intentions. But I must confess to you, Madam, that in my view, the Address is pretty weak when it comes to spelling out precise strategies and programmes needed to translate these intentions into hard realities. The Address does not indicate that we have, in the Government, a firm hand for steering our economy and polity in the desired direction. In particular, Madam, the Address indicates a great sense of complacency in the ruling establishment in meeting the grim challenge that certain forces which are seeking to communalise our polity pose for the future of our country.

Madam, I now deal with the President's Address in so far as it has a bearing on the economy. In his Address, the President has referred to the

launching of the Tenth Five Year Plan, which has set the target of eight per cent annual average GDP growth, with a companion target of five crore additional employment and self-employment opportunities, that is, one crore new jobs to be created every year. That our country needs a development strategy with an ambitious growth and employment target is unquestionable, and if the Government does have such a strategy, we will fully cooperate in implementing that strategy. But, Madam, the President's Address does not inspire confidence that the policies and programmes, which will facilitate the realisation of these ambitious targets are truly in place. Why do I say this? This Government has been in office now for nearly five years. And what is its record? In the last five years that the BJP-led Government has been in office at the Centre, there has been a decline in the growth-rate of national income, the growth-rate of industrial production, the growth-rate of agricultural production, as well as the growth-rate of employment, compared with the preceding five years. The rate of growth of GDP in the Ninth Five Year Plan, which ended last year, has been no more than 5 to 5.25 per cent. In the year 2002-2003, which happens to be the first year of the Tenth Five Year Plan, the projected growth rate by the CSO is no more than 4.4 per cent as against the Plan target of eight per cent. Our per capita agricultural output has fallen since 1998. Despite all the claims made in the President's Address for this Government's solicitude for our farmers, the harsh reality is that our per capita agricultural output has fallen since 1998. That happens to be the period over which this ruling dispensation has presided over our country's destiny.

Savings and investment rates in our economy reached a peak in 1995-96, which was the last year of the Congress Government. Since then, there has been a declining tendency. What is more worrisome, and which is crucial for realising the type of intentions that are contained in the President's Address, to which I will refer a little later, is we need a high rate of savings in the public sector. What is the reality? In the year 1995-96, the public sector savings rate was 1.7 per cent of our GDP. The public sector savings rate is, now, negative by 1.7 per cent. There was a deterioration of full 3.5 per cent of our GDP in the last five years. As a result, Madam, both the fiscal and revenue deficits of the Centre and the States have increased sharply in the last five years. These deficits are, now, back to 1990-91 level, i.e., a year before the reform process began.

The public sector expenditure on infrastructure and rural development, as a proportion of GDP, has declined after 1995-96, and this has not been compensated by a rise in private investment. The inconsistent policies pursued by the present Government have given rise to a high degree of uncertainty which has adversely affected the climate for enterprise. The fiscal policy pursued by the BJP Government has changed directions every year. Year after year, there have been reversals and changes in tax policies. There has been no medium term or long-run thinking when it comes to tax policies. Tax revenues have been over-estimated year after year.

Disinvestment policies - and I say this with all respect to my distinguished friend, Shri Arun Shourie, - and the regulatory regimes established in sectors such as telecommunications have lacked transparency, consistency and clarity, and have sought to promote a type of crony capitalism, rather than build a dynamic and competitive economy.

Madam, stock markets have been characterized by destabilizing speculation which we have never seen before. The primary market is, virtually, dead, and it is dead for the last five years. The financial institutions like the UTI, in which over two crores of investors have reposed faith, have been grossly mismanaged, bringing distress to millions of small investors, senior citizens, widows, orphans and pensioners.

Madam, the communalisation of our polity and the freedom given by this Government to the VHP and the Bajrang Dal to spread communal hatred in various parts of the country has further promoted a climate not conducive to the growth of investment. Infrastructure investments, with the possible exception of roads, have languished. The power sector reforms, which the President's Address talks about, as Dr. Singhvi has mentioned, are languishing. They have failed to take off. The losses of the State Electricity Boards are now more than six times what they were in the year 1990-91. Therefore, Madam, it should not be surprising that despite record food and foreign exchange reserves and a low inflation rate, there is, today, an investment famine in our country. Unless savings and investment rates go up to 30-32 per cent of our GDP, as rightly Shri Pranab Mukherjee mentioned this morning, the growth rate of the economy cannot be raised to eight per cent. And yet, I note with regret that the policies being pursued by the Government give us no confidence that we will be able to

raise the medium-term growth rate of the economy much above 5.5 to 6 per cent per annum.

Madam, the President's Address mentions that the Tenth Plan is not merely a Resources Plan but also a Reforms Programme. But judging by its performance in the last five years, this Government does not seem to have a credible programme either for raising resources or for pursuing the reform agenda. Therefore, I do not share the assertion made in paragraph 16 of the President's Address that the Government has a coherent and well-integrated strategy for boosting economic growth.

Madam, the President's Address refers to "Vision - 2020" to which a reference was also made by my esteemed friend and colleague, Dr. Singhvi, when he spoke this morning. "Vision - 2020" seeks to provide, as mentioned in the President's Address, Urban Amenities in Rural Areas. In this context, four critical connectivities are mentioned - Physical Connectivity, Electronic Connectivity, Knowledge Connectivity and Market Connectivity. These are noble goals; we have no quarrel with them. But how will they be the financed? Most State Governments which have the primary responsibility in these areas are starved of resources and, without a major debt restructuring exercise, they will not be able to find resources for investment in rural infrastructure. Investment in rural infrastructure, despite all tall talks, year after year, has languished in the last five years. A situation in which, as I mentioned earlier, per capita agricultural output is declining for the last five years is hardly conducive; it is hardly consistent with the rosy picture sought to be depicted in the President's Address.

The President's Address talks about revitalisation of agricultural credit, and one of our colleagues who spoke before me, Shri Pradhan, mentioned about the experience of the Kisan Cards. Yet, the macro reality is that the target of 18 per cent, which we have set for bank credit for agriculture, remains unfulfilled. The harsh, true thing, today, is the interest rates that banks charge for lending money, for luxuries like motor cars and refrigerators are much lower than the rate that farmers are charged when they want to invest in agriculture. This is an indication of the perversities of the priorities that prevail in our country. And, yet, we say that farmers' interest is uppermost in our mind!

Madam, I have referred to the sad state of the power system in our country and, if the State Electricity Boards continue to lose, year after year, Rs. 25,000 crores, it is merely a wishful thinking to say that by the year 2007, we will be able to electrify all villages in our country. In the same way, the President's Address talks of universalisation of access to education and health. Yet, I submit, Madam, that given the state of public finances in most of our States, this is, in the language of Dr. Johnson, 'the triumph of hope over experience'. Acute resource shortage is leading State after State to opt for a sub-standard, single-teacher, primary school system. The primary health care system, because of severe resource shortages, is largely dysfunctional in most parts of our country. Thus, Madam, unless credible strategies are adopted to raise public expenditure on education, from 3.5 per cent of GDP to 6 per cent of GDP and that on public health from 0.8 per cent of GDP to at least 2 per cent of GDP, the promises made in the President's Address or in the Vision-2020 statement will remain mere paper promises.

Madam, we have discussed in this House several times the issues relating to the drought. It is paradoxical that there should be starvation deaths at a time when the country has bulging and unmanageable food stocks in its reserves. Some of the State Governments have been saying that the Central Government has not come to their rescue, to the degree it had the obligation, as well as resources, to come to their rescue. The Address does mention the setting up of a Committee for management of drought under the Deputy Prime Minister. Madam, in a federal polity, in which the Government at the Centre and the Governments in the States may not belong to the same parties, I believe it is not sufficient to have merely a Cabinet Sub-Committee to monitor the expenditure and management of the drought. I believe, Madam, it is necessary for Parliament to set up a Standing Committee to monitor the management of natural disasters, including both droughts and floods, so that all segments of our population should have sufficient confidence that political differences will not stand in the way of the needy being helped to the utmost extent possible.

Madam, I now deal with some issues of national security. In para 7, page 3 of the Address, it is stated "National security is a matter of highest priority for my Government. After the December 13 attack on our Parliament by Pakistan-based terrorists, we were constrained to deploy our

troops along the international border. This decision achieved its purpose of showing both our firmness and our self-restraint in dealing with our hostile neighbour. In October last year, the Government, after careful deliberation, decided to strategically re-deploy the Armed Forces from their positions. This was done without compromising on their capacity to respond decisively to any emergency, and without lowering their vigil in Jammu and Kashmir." Madam, on the same page, in paragraph 9, it is further stated "Continued incidents of cross-border terrorism in 2002 again demonstrate that the chief threat to our internal security is external." The adversary is unwilling to give up its anti-India stand. "The assurances given by Pakistan, on the issue of cross-border terrorism, have remained unfulfilled; the infrastructure of terrorist groups remains intact in Pakistan. The funding of terrorist groups continues." This is all contained in the President's Address. Madam, I respectfully ask: If this is the end result, if there is no improvement in checking the cross-border terrorism, if there is no change in the evil designs of Pakistan, then what are the gains that the Government is talking about, which have arisen out of the forward mobilisation of our troops along the international borders for such a long period of time and subsequent redeployment ? Was this expenditure worthwhile? What were the objectives? How far have these objectives been realised? Indeed, cynics are bound to say that the basic purpose was to manipulate domestic political processes for partisan purposes. The mobilisation exercise has been criticised even by respected defence analysts including General V.P. Mallik. Therefore, I hope that when the Prime Minister replies to the debate, he will enlighten the House as to what are precisely the gains that the Government thinks we have registered through this act of forward mobilisation.

Madam, if we are worried about external security, why is the Defence Budget being so mismanaged as it has been mismanaged in the last three or four years? The Government has levied a surcharge on taxes to mobilise resources for defence. The people of India have been willing to bear this burden for the sake of the country's defence. But, what is the Government's record in spending that money which this Parliament has allocated for national defence? In the year 2000-01, the Budget allocation for Defence was Rs.58,587 crores. The actual expenditure was Rs.4,000 crores short, that is, Rs.54,460 crores. In the year 2001-02, the Defence allocation was Rs.62,000 crores. The actual expenditure was Rs.57,000 crores. During the current year, as reported in the Business Standard of

yesterday, the Budget allocation is Rs.65,000 crores, and of this Rs.10,000 crores will remain unspent. The truth, Madam, is that despite all this tall talks of being concerned about the national security, there is a total absence of long-term strategic thinking about defence preparedness. *Ad hocism* is the norm, when it comes to defence purchases. The fate of AJT is an indication of the chaos that prevails in the defence management of our country.

Madam, the Tehelka tapes have revealed the sordid deals that have great implications for our national security. In this context, I would like to draw your attention, Madam, to an item which appeared in The Statesman of yesterday, which said, "Special Israeli ground sensors given to the Security Forces in Jammu and Kashmir have failed. As a result, the BSF posted at the international border and the Army at the Line of Control are finding it difficult to check the increase in the cross-border terrorism. The imported sensors have failed, senior BSF and Army officers said, because they cannot function very well in topographical conditions in Jammu and Kashmir. The sensors were tailor-made for Israel, which is situated on a desert, where ground sensors are very useful. But the border areas in Jammu and Kashmir are very different and comprise deep gorges, ravines, forests and streams, the officers said".

Madam, this is one indication of the casualness in selecting the defence equipment and, yet, the Government wants to believe that national security is its top priority. The defence management system is in bad shape. The whole matter was reviewed after the Kargil war. Now, we know that certain parts of that Report, particularly, with regard to the management of the intelligence system, have not been released. They have been withheld. Well, I recognise the reasons. But this House is entitled to an assurance that the country is getting the worth for the expenditure that this Parliament allocates for national security and defence.

Madam, I believe that the time has come when this Parliament should have a Standing Committee dealing specifically with matters relating to national security and assessment of our intelligence. This is essential so that our people should have the satisfaction that we, as Members of Parliament, are doing our very best to ensure that the money, which the Parliament allocates - which the people of this country pay - is serving a worthwhile national purpose.

Madam, dealing with the national security in paragraph 12 on page 4, the address talks of increased allocations for the modernisation of the police forces. I welcome that. But allocations and the progress of spending can be appraised only in the framework of a medium-term plan for the modernization of the police forces in the country as a whole. And, therefore, I suggest that the Government should come forward with a medium-term plan for modernizing the police forces so that Parliament can appraise and assess as to where we are moving with regard to the objectives of modernizing the police forces in our country.

Madam, in the context of national security, the Deputy Prime Minister has recently been ringing alarm bells about the massive inflow of illegal migrants from Bangladesh. We are not a party, which wants, in any way, to encourage the flow of illegal migrants. But, I hope that what the Deputy Prime Minister says is not merely a part of propaganda for partisan political purposes. The Government should tell us about the progress made in the last five years in strengthening the border management system. In particular, I would like to know from the Government about the progress of border fencing project. What has happened? The pace of progress would be a very concrete indicator of this Government's willingness to stop this inflow of migrants from Bangladesh.

In the same way, Madam, in paragraph 14 on page 5, the Address says, "We must resolve to ensure that communal violence is never repeated in any part of our country. The Government remains committed to secularism." Madam, can we expect these statements as valid statements of Government's true intentions. I wish it were so.

In particular, the way the VHP, the Bajrang Dal in U.P., Rajasthan and Madhya Pradesh are now fanning communal hatred and discord does not suggest that the ruling establishment is serious about promoting communal harmony. The way that the Government and the BJP have been cynically exploiting the Ayodhya dispute year after year for partisan political purposes suggests that this Government's commitment to the promotion communal harmony is not even skin deep.

Madam, while dealing with national security, we must take note of the growing unrest in the entire tribal belt of India. The President's Address talks of separating the National Commission for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and having a separate Commission for Scheduled Tribes.

3.00 p.m.

But this is tokenism. The problem is deep-rooted, and it is growing in intensity. And if not checked, this growing tribal unrest can be a major source of destabilising our polity and our economy in years to come because tribal areas happen to be those where the bulk of India's mineral wealth is located. It is, therefore, not enough to set up a separate Commission for Scheduled Tribes. It is necessary to go deep into the causes of growing unrest in tribal areas and identify factors responsible for it. As we all know, a great deal of unrest arises out of the forest management relations. This is a matter which has to be gone in depth if this unrest in the Tribal areas of our country is not to become a major problem in years to come.

The Government had enacted POTA with great fanfare. By now, we all know how POTA is being misused by the Uttar Pradesh Government to settle political scores. Today a newspaper carried a news item-which says children of the age of 12 years are also being arrested under POTA. Madam, the Central Government cannot wish away its responsibility for ensuring that POTA is not misused. We must and this Parliament, in its wisdom, must find effective mechanisms to ensure that the solemn assurances that were given to Parliament by this Government, are indeed honoured in letter and spirit.

Madam, I have already talked about the national intelligence system. The post-Kargil Group of Ministers' report pertaining to intelligence, as I said earlier, remains classified and there is no firm indication that the basic system has been indeed reformed and the weaknesses and deficiencies which came to notice at the time of the Kargil war have been indeed attended to. As I said earlier, I suggest that there should be a Parliamentary Committee to look into the national security as well as the assessment of our intelligence system on a holistic basis.

Madam, I now come to a few issues dealing with our foreign policy. While appraising our policy, nothing in my view is more crucial than our relations with our neighbours. These, I note with great regret, are in, a particularly bad shape, more so in the recent years. This Government has a consistent record of mishandling our relations with Pakistan. *Ad hoc* short-termism has been the guiding principle right from the Lahore bus trip which

landed in Kargil and the ill-planned Agra Summit which gave General Musharraf the international respectability which he lacked until then. We have supported the Government in countering Pakistan-sponsored terrorism. Yet, as I mentioned earlier, there has been no visible gain from forward deployment of our Armed Forces along the border for a prolonged period. The Government must enlighten us about the gains that accrued.

We agree with the Government that we must deal firmly with Pakistan-sponsored terrorism. But if our policy is that we will not talk to Pakistan until it ends all cross-border terrorism, then why did the Prime Minister go to Lahore and why was General Musharraf invited to Agra? It is the inconsistent approach of this Government which in my view has led Pakistan to believe that India can be pressurised on fundamentals. While we must remain firm in our resolve to deal effectively with Pakistan-sponsored terrorism, we believe reducing diplomatic contacts between the two countries is a counter-productive exercise. It is well-known that even at the height of the Cuban Missile crisis, the US and the USSR maintained contacts at the highest level. The fact that India and Pakistan are both now nuclear powers, makes it imperative that diplomatic channels are kept open all the time between the two countries.

We also believe that whatever our differences with the Government of Pakistan are, it is not wise to curtail contacts between the civil societies of the two countries.

With Bangladesh too, Madam, our relations have sunk to an all-time low. We cannot permit illegal migration to flourish. But, the problem has to be resolved in a spirit of mutual goodwill and co-operation. We must not forget that Bangladesh today provides a very lucrative market for a large number of Indian products. We have today a huge trade surplus with Bangladesh and, therefore, maintenance of close and cordial relation with Bangladesh is a matter of high national priority. So, whenever differences arise, they must be resolved in a spirit of mutual goodwill and co-operation.

Madam, I notice that even with Nepal and Sri Lanka, a cold wind seems to be blowing in our relations with these countries. The Maoist insurgency in Nepal poses a threat not only to Nepal but to India as well and, therefore, we must co-operate with the Government of Nepal to find a solution to this grave problem. Dr. Singhvi, this morning, referred to the

SAARC and the President's Address also says, "India's commitment to SAARC as an engine for economic integration and equitable development in the region remains undiluted." Madam, I wish this were indeed the reality. The sad truth is that the SAARC process today stands stalled despite whatever may have been said in the President's Address. The harsh truth is that nothing much is happening to implement the ambitious SAARC agenda outlined in the Kathmandu Summit. I believe, Madam, that India should take a more proactive interest to promote co-operation in the SAARC region. If multilateral co-operation through the mechanism of SAARC gets stalled because of the strained Indo-Pakistan relations, then, at least, let us take adequate bilateral initiative to promote co-operation with our other neighbours. The present stalemate is not something, which is consistent with our long-term interest or in the interest of South Asia as a whole.

Finally, Madam, what is happening in Iraq and the gathering war clouds in West Asia are a matter of deepest concern to our people. It is our fervent hope that war can be avoided, that Iraq sincerely co-operates with the United Nations in peaceful disarmament, that this is followed by the removal of sanctions which have hurt the people of Iraq so much. We sincerely believe that the United Nations must play a decisive role in bringing about a peaceful resolution of all outstanding issues in this region and that unilateral action has to be avoided.

Madam, these are some of the concerns that we feel should be considered by the Government as it deals with the challenges that our economy and our polity face. Madam, as we enter the 21st century, we face enormous challenges as well as opportunities. India has the required human and material resources to emerge as a front-ranking nation in the world. The 21st century indeed can be India's century. As a minimum working together, we can certainly hope to eradicate mass poverty, ignorance and disease which still afflict millions and millions of people in our country. But, Madam, for that vision to be realised, nothing is more important, in my view, than creating an atmosphere for togetherness, which Dr. Singhvi mentioned so eloquently in his speech and to strengthen in every possible way the unity and cohesiveness of the Indian people.

This unity, I regret to note, is now being endangered by attempts to communalise our polity and to use religious identities not to promote a

culture of tolerance but to spread hatred and violence and to mobilise people for partisan political objectives. If these attempts succeed, the country will remain mired in primitive tribal animosities, and the noble vision of India as a major power house of the world economy will become made a mere dream. It is our solemn obligation to realise that a great catastrophe awaits our people if the climate of hatred and mistrust, which is deliberately being fostered for narrow partisan political parties, is allowed to gather momentum. The Congress (I) party is willing to make any sacrifice and pay any price to counter and combat these divisive and disruptive forces. We shall remain steadfast in our commitment to the noble vision and the ideals upheld by the founding fathers of our Republic and to build an India of their dreams, an India of which our children and grand children will be truly proud.

Thank you.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri S. Ramachandran Pillai.

DR. L.M. SINGHVI: Madam, may I seek one clarification from the distinguished Leader of the Opposition? Is the Congress (I) party prepared to condemn the recent dastardly attack in Madhya Pradesh by one of its wings, and whether it could join in enacting a constitutional ban on cow slaughter?

DR. MANMOHAN SINGH: Madam, we will deal with this issue at the appropriate time. This is not an issue covered in the President's Address.

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL: I would also like to seek a clarification from Mr. Singhvi as to whether they would join us in attacking Mr. Tagodia and for what happened in Gujarat. Would you join us in doing that?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, we are not discussing that...*(Interruptions)*... I must remind the hon. Members that it is not a debate. It is only the Motion of Thanks on which we are speaking. We cannot question each other. Then, the discussion will go wayward, and the President will never receive his reply. Now, Shri S. Ramachandran Pillai...*(Interruptions)*... Allow Shri Ramachandran Pillai to speak...*(Interruptions)*... Please co-operate with me. Please have peace in the House.

SHRI S. RAMACHANDRAN PILLAI : Madam, thank you for giving me this opportunity to take part in this great debate. I carefully heard the speech of the Mover of the debate on the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address and the speech of the next speaker. I regret to say that their eloquent advocacy failed to convince me of the correctness of the approaches of the Government.

At the outset of my intervention, I may be allowed to say something about the format of the President's Address. Without showing any disrespect to President, I may be allowed to say this. A major part of the President's Address was a compendium of the performance of the various Departments. Had the Government taken care to explain to us the broad parameters of the policies of the Government with regard to various issues, that would have given us an opportunity to examine them, to appreciate them and to formulate our views concretely on such matters. Madam, I have three basic criticisms about the content of the Presidential Address. First, the Presidential Address failed to tackle certain basic and fundamental issues. My second objection is, it tried to touch certain issues, but in a very cursory manner. My third criticism is, though I agree, the Presidential Address tackles certain issues, but the basic approach is adverse to the interest of the people and to the interest of the country. One of my major criticisms is that the Presidential Address ignored the sad plight of the urban majority of the population in this country. They are affected by poverty and unemployment. They are living in the backward parts of the country and the unevenness in growth is growing. Of course, the debate is going on about the number of people living Below the Poverty Line, whether it is 260 million or not, I am not going into that question at present. But certainly, we will get an opportunity when we discuss about poverty, separately. The Presidential Address itself admits that the people living Below the Poverty Line will come to the tune of 26 crores. Why this is happening? After more than 50 years of Independence, why have we failed to tackle these important issues? Madam, not only this, unemployment is also growing. The Government is not giving us data regarding the number of people who are unemployed in this country. Many studies are there. It is estimated that the number of registered unemployed people is about 4 crores. And as per the sample survey, the number of unemployed people in the rural areas is 8 crores. So, about 12 crores of people are unemployed in this country. There are also a lot of debates going on, but I am not going into that particular aspect of the matter. Why have we failed to solve

this problem of unemployment? There is another issue, I agree that many a people living Below the Poverty Line are coming out of poverty, but it is also a fact that a section of the people who are living Above the Poverty Line are going down to the level of Below the Poverty Line. Why this is happening? Why have they failed to tackle this important issue? It is also a fact that certain parts of our country which are advanced, are becoming more advanced and which are backward are becoming more backward. Why this kind of unevenness is prevailing there? Why sectoral unevenness is growing?

It is also a fact that because of poverty, unemployment and backwardness, a considerable portion of our population, living in different parts of the country, is migrating from one place to another. This also has a lot of economic and social consequences; very serious adverse consequences are there. Why are these things happening in our country? Of course, the President's Address speaks about the rate of growth of the GDP. It says that the Tenth Five Year Plan would be able to achieve 8% growth in GDP. I am not going into the question whether we will be able to achieve it or not. Certainly, we are going to discuss this matter, when we take up the Tenth Plan for discussion. The main issue that we should address is how we should tackle the issue of poverty, how we should tackle the issue of unemployment and backwardness in this country. If we do not address these issues, I feel it is meaningless whether we are able to achieve 8% or 7% or 6% or even 10%. The main aim should be to solve the problems of a considerable section of our population. There is no doubt that we have had achievements in various fields during the post-Independence period. But the wealth that we have created during this period has not solved these major issues. Why have we failed? I feel it is because of certain defects in our development strategy that we have pursued during the post- Independence period. Actually, the development policy that we have pursued, is no doubt a capitalist development policy based on the interests of the richer sections. It is because of that that we have not been able to solve the problems of poverty, unemployment and the problem of backwardness. So, we need a new development strategy and a strategy based on the interests of the overwhelming majority of the population of our country and the poorer sections of this country. Without that, these problems cannot be solved. We have been pursuing a policy since 1991 - the policy of reforms, the policy based on liberalisation, privatisation and globalisation. Actually, these new sets of polices are

aggravating the problems that we are facing in our country. The poorer sections are adversely affected because of these policies. Sir, look at the agrarian situation. The Leader of the Opposition has already explained this situation here. The present set of policies are not helping in increasing the productivity and production in agriculture. If we compare the pre-reforms period with the post-reforms period, it shows that the rate of growth has declined during the post-reforms period. The Planning Commission has made a detailed study, in the Mid-Term Appraisal of the Ninth Five-Year Plan, about the growth trends during the pre-reforms period and the growth trends during the post-reforms period. I may be allowed to read a portion from that Report. "During the 90s - 1989-90 to 1998-99 - the growth rate of production of both foodgrains and non-foodgrains, taken together, has declined to 2.35 per cent per annum from 3.72 per cent per annum. During the 80s - 1979-80 to 1989-90 - the decline in the rate of growth of foodgrains was sharper - from 3.54 per cent to 1.80 per cent per annum".

Even for the milk and egg sector, which had led the growth pattern in the eighties', there was a decline in the nineties', although not as severe as for foodgrains." When the new set of policies were introduced, were initiated, it was explained that the new set of policies is going to help to attract more investments in agriculture, that will increase productivity and production, but the reverse is happening. Sir, the reverse is happening, the rate of growth is declining.

There is also a mention in the President's Address about the credit facilities. The Leader of the Opposition has already explained about that. It is a fact. Our experience is, there is a shrinkage of institutional credit facilities in the rural countryside. In accounts; yes, there is an increase, but in reality, the poorer sections, who constitute the overwhelming majority, are not getting the institutional credit facilities. Now a new set of moneylenders are coming into rural countryside; they are exploiting the poorer sections; they are fleecing the poorer sections. Many of the suicides are taking place in the rural countryside because of the exploitation of the moneylenders. Why is this happening? Despite the tall talk about increasing the amount of credit facilities, it is not really happening. The Leader of the Opposition has already explained the very same, because the President's Address is giving an entirely different picture, from what was explained by the Planning Commission in the Mid-term Appraisal of the Ninth Five Year Plan. There also, I would like to quote a particular paragraph about this particular

aspect. "According to RBI Report on trends and progress in banking, 1998-99, the relative share of agricultural credit in the net bank credit stood at 12.8 per cent in March, 1997 and 11.7 per cent in March, 1998 as well as in March, 1999. As against the target of 40 per cent for priority sector lending by banks, the sub-target for agriculture has been fixed at 18 per cent. The declining share of agriculture in the net bank credit against 18 per cent target, under priority lending, is a matter of concern. More credit needs to flow to agriculture for providing timely and adequate credit under simplified procedures to farmers for increasing agricultural production and productivity."

Sir, there is a mention about the Kisan Credit Cards, here in this President's Address. Yes, a small section has been given that benefit. There also, you can see the voice of the rich section. The poorer sections are not getting the benefits. Only the rich sections are reaping the benefits. So, how to cater to the needs of the poorer sections, that is the most important issue.

There is a mention here that the Government has taken a decision to increase investments in irrigation. Sir, it is because of the new set of policies, the Government is retreating from all economic affairs, the Government is not making more investments in irrigation, not making more investments in power, not making more investments in science and technology, not making more investments in infrastructure facilities. Because of this, the agricultural production is not picking up; because of this, the poorer sections are mostly affected by that. Now, there is a mention in the President's Address that the Government is thinking of increasing more public investments. When the Government introduced this new set of policies, we pointed out that it is the public investments, more and more public investments, that attracted the private investment also. If there is decline in public investments, definitely, there will be decline in private investments also. Now, the Government is thinking. But it should not be confined only to the irrigation and irrigation alone. It should be expanded to expanding power facilities, expanding more investment in science and technology. Of course, because of our laboratories, because of our scientists, the high yielding varieties of seeds helped us in increasing the wheat production, helped us in increasing paddy production, helped us in increasing cane production and helped us in increasing the production of many other crops. If you look at the investment in science and technology,

there is a decline. This is also affecting. So, it should not be confined to irrigation and irrigation alone. It should be expanded to other areas also.

Sir, there is no mention about agricultural workers in the whole Presidential Address. They are the most exploited section in our society. They are suffering. Their workdays are declining. Their real wages are declining. There are various reasons for that. Shift from foodgrains to cash crops is one important aspect. The present trend more capital intensive agriculture is another aspect. The introduction of machinery in agriculture is taking place in a bigger way. All these things and many other reasons are there for the declining trend of the workdays and the real wages of the workers. The Government is not coming forward to protect the interests of the workers. Earlier the Government declared that they would bring forward a new legislation, a comprehensive Central legislation to take care of their interests, fixing the minimum wages and providing them social security measures. The Government is not coming forward. So, the Government is not taking care of the downtrodden sections of our society. There is no approach to address these problems. That is the tragedy of the country in the present situation. If you look at the industrial sector, the industrial sector is also not picking up. The cottage industries are in crisis, the handicraft sector is in crisis and the small and medium industries are in crisis because of the import of commodities from outside and because of the penetration of more and more multinationals and more capital-intensive industries. These sectors are facing difficulties. The privatisation policies are creating problems throwing many thousands unemployed. There is a mention in the Presidential Address in paragraph 42 that the Government is discussing about the Second National Labour Commission on Labour. I would like to quote that particular paragraph from the Presidential Address, "The Second Labour Commission on Labour has given a comprehensive report covering wide range of labour issues. Its specific recommendations are being discussed with various stakeholders." This is not a fact, Sir. This matter was discussed at the Indian Labour Conference in September last year. Then the Government assured the entire labour, the trade union leaders that the Government would discuss the Second Labour Commission Report with the trade unions and after that discussion they would come before the Parliament for enacting certain legislation. They have not discussed this issue so far. An entirely different picture is being portrayed here. That is not the fact. There is also a mention about the Provident Fund. Under the Employees' Provident Fund Scheme which benefits 3.17

crore subscribers, a novel programme to reduce claim settlement time from 30 days to one or two days has been introduced. But what is the reality? Why do you portray an entirely different picture than the reality? What is really happening is that the interest rate on the Provident Fund has been reduced by the Government from 12 to 9.5 per cent. This is some sort of a retirement benefit for the workers. The Government has reduced it! What is the amount of loss sustained by the workers due to reduction of one per cent interest? The reduction is estimated to be to the tune of Rs. 2,500 crores. So, on the one hand, there is a decline in the amount of money that the workers are getting. There is a reduction of money to the tune of Rs. 6,000 crores because of the reduction in the rate of interest introduced by the Government. On the other, the Government is saying, 'Oh, we have reduced from three months to two days.' Explain to the country. The people cannot be confused. These gimmicks in such declarations cannot hoodwink the people. The reality is this. Not only that, the Government is thinking of introducing certain legislations curbing the trade union rights of the workers in this country. The Government is trying to introduce the hire-and-fire policy. The Government is trying to take away the right of the workers to organise themselves and also their right of a collective bargaining. The Government is also not activising the Tripartite Consultation System. There are thirty-five Tripartite Consultative Committees. The Government has not convened any meeting. Sir, only five or six or seven meetings were held during the last one year. So, the Government is determined to make a big attempt on the workers in this country. Of course, they will try to resist such attacks. All the trade unions in this country have taken a decision to organise a demonstration on 26th of this month.

There are certain references on the Foreign Policy position of the Government in this Address. Some aspects have been mentioned by the hon. Leader of the Opposition. But, many other paragraphs have dealt with certain other aspects. But, what is the overall assessment of the Government on the existing world situation? What is the long-term perspective of the Government? How is the Government trying to proceed further? What are the short-term measures that the Government is going to take to tackle the emerging world situation? According to us, the emerging world situation is a very, very dangerous one. According to us, the major threat emerging is the threat of American imperialism. They have attained the military superiority. They have very sophisticated nuclear weapons at

their disposal. They also have a very sophisticated delivery system and are trying to perfect it through their National Missile Defence System. They want to take these arms to the outer space. Sir, such attempts are taking place. And, they have the National Security Strategy Document. Of course, now, it is a public document. In the Document, they have said, "Yes. We have been able to attain the superiority in arms and we will not allow any country to catch up with that. If anybody tries to catch up with us, we try to pre-empt it by using force." Sir, American imperialism is trying to make use of their military superiority to establish their domination on the economic life of other countries and on the political life of other countries. That is the major threat emerging in this world. How is the Government going to react to this emerging threat in this world?

There is a casual reference on Iraq in this document. The present Iraq situation is the reflection of American aggression. America first said, "We need a regime change there." What right has America got to change the regime there? The American President went to the United Nations and threatened it to fall in line with American aggression, and if it did not accept, the USA will go ahead. The United Nations passed a resolution and sent a Team of Inspectors to Iraq. But they did not find anything there. Now, America says, "Whatever be their findings, we will go ahead with our programme." It will have very, very serious repercussions on the economy, on the life of the country. We are facing very serious difficulties. The oil prices will shoot up. Many Indians are working in the Gulf countries. They will have to flee away from there. But these are not the only adverse affects. If America succeeds in its attempt, the emerging world would be a very, very dangerous place to live in. Our sovereignty will be impaired; our hard-won independence will be impaired. They will be the dictators, and will dictate what policies other countries should follow. We are failing in the WTO negotiations. How America is trying to influence the WTO? How America is trying to influence other countries? They try to browbeat others. How is the Government going to react to this emerging dangerous situation? A new approach is required. We have to build bridges with other countries. The entire world is resisting the American aggression. Last week, about 600-700 cities have risen against American imperialism. The demonstrations are taking place. Millions and millions are taking part in those demonstrations. Their own allies are coming to resist America. But our Government is keeping silent. The Government is not coming forward. I am not going into the other details with regard to the Iraq issue. If we

discuss it separately, we will be able to go into all these aspects in detail. So, the Government should explain to us as to what is its attitude.

There is a very casual reference about the 'non-proliferation'. Pakistan is helping People's Democratic Republic of Korea. Many other countries have double standards. The question is, how can our interests be protected? Non-proliferation alone cannot protect our interests. When India made nuclear tests, America and many other countries exploded. We disagree with that. That is a wrong decision. That facilitated our isolation among Non-Aligned countries. Of course, that is entirely a different matter. I am not going into those details. But how can our interests be protected in the present world? We will have to take the issue of disarmament issue. We have to stage; we have to rally other countries behind us. Disarmament of major nuclear powers will help us to protect our national interests, our independence, our polices because in the emerging world, we cannot pursue our policies. America is going to dictate. So, we should take up these issues and should try to rally other countries for disarmament of major nuclear powers.

The Leader of the Opposition has already explained the attitude of the Government with regard to protecting the secular polity of our country. How are they going to deal with this Ayodhya issue? The Government has now taken a more partisan attitude, and the Government is surrendering to communal fanatism more than in the past. I have with me the speech made by the President on 25th February, 2002. I quote, " The Government of India, being the statutory receiver, is duty bound to maintain the *status quo* at the disputed site in Ayodhya. It will also ensure that all necessary measures will be taken to ensure the preservation of law and order." This statement has to be viewed in the background of the Supreme Court's decision taken in 1994. I am reading a relevant portion from the Supreme Court judgement reported in (1994) 6 SCC page 360, Para 49. I quote, "...The justification given for acquisition of the larger area including the property respecting which title is not disputed, is that the same is necessary to ensure that the final outcome of adjudication should not be rendered meaningless by the existence of properties belonging to Hindus in the vicinity of the disputed structure, in case the Muslims are found entitled to the disputed site. This obviously means that in the event of the Muslims succeeding in the adjudication of the dispute requiring the structure to be handed over to the Muslim community, their success should not be

thwarted by denial of proper access to, and enjoyment of rights in the disputed area by exercise of rights of ownership of Hindu owners of the adjacent properties...." So, the Presidential Address of the last year should be viewed in this background of the Supreme Court's decision. What is the present position of the Government? The Government has approached the Supreme Court. The Government has now changed its position from its earlier stand and became a party; it has become a co-petitioner of the VHP and other Hindu fanatics. It is a very dangerous thing.

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI NILOTPAL BASU) In the Chair]

Sir, not only this, there is also another reference in the present Presidential Address about the Government's stand on Ayodhya. I consider that to be an inappropriate reference, by the Government, in the Presidential Address. I may be allowed to read that particular portion from the Presidential Address, para 15, last sentence. I quote: " "While the judiciary should expedite its work and give an early verdict... " Sir, what does it mean? The Government is criticising the decision of the court saying that the court is delaying the matter and that it should expedite it. According to me, this is inappropriate on the part of the Government to put this thing in the Presidential Address. This is a sort of interference in the judicial process of the country ! Sir, why has the Government become a party to it? Let the parties contest their case.

Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the secular polity of our country is under great threat. I am not going into how they are going to change the textbooks, how they are going to change the history. A deliberate infiltration by certain communal groups is taking place in almost all academic institutions of this country. Agressive communal propaganda is being allowed in this country. So, the secular polity of our country is under severe threat. A deliberate attack is being made on the federal policy of our country. If we look at the references of the Twelfth Finance Commission, we will find that the Government is trying to force the States to fall in line with the policies of the Central Government. The Constitutional powers, the Finance Commission and the Planning Commission have become an instrument of pressurising the State Governments to fall in line. An attempt has also been made to bypass the Parliament. Yesterday, when we discussed the Disinvestment Policy of the Government, an attempt was made to bypass our Parliamentary institution. They don't care about the

recommendations made by the Parliamentary Committees. They don't even consider those things. Yes, we may have differences with the Election Commission. We are bound to have differences. But, how should such differences be articulated? Such differences should not be articulated by maligning persons, by pointing out their particular religion. But, that way, attacks are being organised.

If anybody tries to resist, if anybody refuses to fall in line, this sort of malicious propaganda is unleashed, fascist kind of attacks are organised. So, our Parliamentary system is under threat. The Constitutional institutions are under threat. There is also a mention about the internal security of the country. No doubt, cross-border terrorism is a major threat. Other threats also exist in our country. Arms mafias are there, drug trafficking is taking place, forest mafias are there, coal mafias are there, kidnappings are taking place, extortions are taking place. Their number is increasing day-by-day. Crimes against women and children are increasing. Many other terrorist groups are trying to establish their influence in different parts of our country. They are making use of the archaic land laws existing in certain parts of the country. They are making use of caste oppression. We should address all these problems, only then, the internal security will be strengthened. There are also complaints about police atrocities. How is POTA being used? When POTA was passed by Parliament, we from the Opposition opposed it. Because we were afraid that it could be used against the political opponents. There is every possibility for that. The present experience in UP, the present experience in Tamil Nadu, the present experience in Delhi, are all examples of POTA being used against political opponents. This danger is there. How can we save the democratic rights of the people? It can be possible if POTA is scrapped. There is no need for POTA. Sir, the Government is trying to cover up its weaknesses and shortcomings. Our people are very cautious. They are not confused. The Government cannot hush up these matters. As you are observing, many spontaneous struggles are taking place, many organised struggles are taking place. The people are coming forward to resist the anti-people and anti-national policies.

Sir, only by strengthening and forcing the Government to change these policies can we save the country, and also the interests of the people of this country. Two types of broad movements are required in this country.

4.00 p.m.

One, a broad secular unity is required to protect the secular polity of our country, and, two, to take care of the interests of the poorer sections, in order to introduce a new set of development policy, a broad United Front is required in this country.

So, I would request the Government, I would request the Mover of the Motion of Thanks to respond to the points raised by me.

With these words, Sir, I conclude.

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र (उत्तर प्रदेश): उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, सबसे पहले तो प्रस्तावक महोदय को मैं बधाई देना चाहता हूं, इसलिए कि तीन-चार बार से राष्ट्रपति महोदय के अभिभाषण पर मैंने देखा भंडारी साहब, नायडु साहब, चतुर्वेदी साहब, जो कोई धन्यवाद का प्रस्ताव पेश करता है, वह या तो मिनिस्टर हो जाता है या गवर्नर हो जाता है और हम लोगों के बीच में से चला जाता है, अब आपका नम्बर है, हमको दुख भी है कि आप हम लोगों के बीच में नहीं रहेंगे, चले जाएंगे और बधाई इसलिए भी कि आपने बहुत अच्छा भाषण दिया । वह वकील बधाई का पात्र होता है जो अपना केस काबलियत से कहे और आपने अपनी बात, अपने पक्ष की बात ठीक से कही, इसलिए बधाई देना मेरा फर्ज़ बनता है।

आपने एक शब्द का इस्तेमाल किया था कि महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी की यह स्पीच बिल्कुल गुलाबी है और बड़े-बड़े सपने इसमें भरे हैं । हम उसके बाद स्पीच को पढ़ रहे थे, पढ़ने में तो हमको भी थोड़ी-बहुत गुलाबी लग रही थी लेकिन नज़दीक से छूने पर लग रहा था कि ये सब के सब गुलाब कागज़ के हैं, इनमें न गंध है, न रंग है, न कोई ताज़गी है । आपने अपने भाषण से इसमें थोड़ी-बहुत गंध भरने की कोशिश की है, लेकिन कागज़ का फूल कितनी देर तक महकेगा । यह कागज़ी स्पीच थी -- हकीकत से बहुत दूर, जमीन से बहुत दूर, इंसान की तकलीफ से बहुत दूर । हमने जब इस स्पीच के कुछ विषयों को जान-बूझकर टटोलना चाहा कि कोई दम है या नहीं है तो हमने पाया कि राष्ट्रपति महोदय ने एक सपना दिखाया है अपनी स्पीच में कि 2020 तक हिन्दुस्तान को दुनिया का अग्रणी देश बनाने के लिए हमको प्रयास करना है । यह प्रधान मंत्री जी ने लाल किले से भाषण दिया था 2020 वाला, राष्ट्रपति महोदय ने उसकी चर्चा भी की है अपने भाषण में और उसका एक मकसद बताया है कि देश के जितने गांव हैं उनको शहरों जैसी सुविधाएं दे दी जाएं । अब मैं शहरो की सुविधाओं को देखता हूं और याद करता हूं तो पता चलता है कि 24 घंटों में से 17 घंटे बिजली नहीं रहती, पानी नहीं रहता, सड़क नहीं रहती । अगर गांवो को शहरों की सुविधाएं देनी हैं तो बेहतर होता कि शहरो को गांव की सुविधा भी दे दी जाए, खुली हवा तो वह पा लेते । हमने पहली बार जब पढ़ा तो सोचा कि 2020 के बारे में राष्ट्रपति महोदय क्या कह रहे हैं क्योंकि यह सरकार तो साल, डेढ़ साल की है, इतनी दूर का सपना दिखा दिया देश को राष्ट्रपति महोदय ने । एक साल का सैशन होगा, फिर अगली बार भाषण देना है । तो हम जान-बूझकर ढूढ़ने लगे । तो उसमें पहली बात

यह निकली कि गांवों को शहरों की सुविधाएं देने का प्रयास किया जाएगा । शहरों की बहुत दुर्दशा है और गांव तो बहुत ही दुर्दशा वाली हालत में हैं । बेहतर होता कि दोनों एक-दूसरे की दुर्दशा बांट लेते । तब भी शायद यह मुल्क खूबसूरत बन जाता लेकिन वह हम बांट नहीं पा रहे हैं । जब हमने यह बात उनके भाषण में पढ़ी तो लगा कि ये तो कागज़ी फूल हैं, इनमें न गंध है, न कोई ताज़गी है और न कोई रंग है । आपने जब गुलाबी भाषण की चर्चा की तो हमने जान-बूझकर उसको टटोला ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, राष्ट्रपति महोदय ने राष्ट्रीय सुरक्षा की चर्चा की है । संसद भवन पर पिछले वर्ष जो हमला हुआ था, उस हमले के संदर्भ में हमने प्रधानमंत्री जी का भाषण टेलीविजन पर सुना था । उन्होंने यहां भी बोलते हुए यह कहा था कि अब आर-पार की लड़ाई होगी । उसी तरन्नुम में उन्होंने अपनी पलटन पाकिस्तान की सरहद पर भेज दी। हम लोग सोच रहे थे कि वाकई आर-पार जाएंगे पर एक महीना नहीं, दो महीने नहीं, तीन महीने नहीं, चार महीने नहीं, कई महीनों तक पलटन वहां पड़ी रही । राष्ट्रपति महोदय ने अपने भाषण में कहा है कि हमारी पलटन की क्षमता का पता लगा कि कभी दोबारा इस तरह की हरकत होगी तो हम उसका डटकर कैसे मुकाबला कर सकते हैं । क्या खूबसूरत तारीफ है ! छह महीने तक पलटन सरहद पर छोड़ी जाती है । पलटन के उन जवानों से पूछिए, वहां रहने वाले बाशिंदों से पूछिए, गांव वालों से पूछिए कि उनको वहां क्यों भेजा ? क्यों नपुंसक किस्म का ऐलान किया जाता है जिसमें कोई दम नहीं रहता है ? क्यों ऐसा ताल ठोंका जाता है जिससे आवाज़ नहीं निकला करती है ?

महोदय, मैं तो गुलाब के फूल में सुगंध ढूंढ रहा था, उसमें रंग ढूंढ रहा था, उसमें ताज़गी ढूंढ रहा था । आपने अपने भाषण से उसमें थोड़ी गंध भरने की कोशिश की है लेकिन वह गंध कितनी देर के लिए है ? यह निष्कर्ष हम राष्ट्रपति महोदय के अभिभाषण में कही हुई बातों के आधार पर निकाल रहे हैं, अपनी तरफ से नहीं निकाल रहे हैं । माननीय राष्ट्रपति जी के प्रति मेरे मन में अपार श्रद्धा है लेकिन उस महान वैज्ञानिक को इस कुरसी पर बिठाकर उनके मुंह से, उनकी जुबान से इस तरह की बात आपने निकलवा दी, यह बहुत ही अफसोस की बात है । यह अच्छी बात नहीं है ।

महोदय, आज देश बहुत बुरी हालत में है । राष्ट्रपति महोदय ने अपने अभिभाषण के दौरान चीनी मिलों के बारे में चर्चा की है । उन्होंने कहा है कि सरकार को चिंता है कि चीनी मिलों की हालत खराब हो रही है । उन्होंने कहा कि गन्ना किसानों और चीनी मिलों को ज्यादा सहूलियत मिल सके, इसके लिए सरकार रास्ता तज़वीज कर रही है । एक तरफ तो सरकार गन्ना किसानों को सुविधा देने की बात कह रही है लेकिन दूसरी तरफ सरकार ने गन्ना किसानों पर पिछले साल बस्ती जिले के मुंडेरवा गांव में गोली चलवा दी जिसमें तीन किसान मारे गए ।

महोदय, देश में दो ही लोग उत्पादन करते हैं । हम लोग उत्पादन नहीं करते हैं । हम लोग तो उत्पादन का इंतजाम करते हैं । यहां दफ्तर में बैठे हुए लोग उत्पादन नहीं करते हैं बल्कि रजिस्टर पर उत्पादन का इंतजाम करते हैं । ये जो शहरों की दुकानों में लोग बैठे हैं, ये लोग उत्पादन नही करते हैं, ये केवल उत्पादन का वितरण करते हैं । देश में दो ही उत्पादक हैं।

एक तो किसान, जो जमीन पर पसीना बहाता है और दूसरा मजदूर, जो मशीन पर पसीना बहाता है । इन दोनों के पसीने से उत्पादन होता है । ऐसा नही है कि बिड़ला और रिलायेंस की पूंजी लग जाए तो उत्पादन हो जाएगा । केवल पैसे से उत्पादन नहीं हो सकता । पैसों से खरीदी गई मशीन और पसीना, जब ये दोनों मिलते हैं तब उत्पादन हुआ करता है ।

महोदय, मुझे दु:ख के साथ कहना पड़ता है कि किसान आज गोली का शिकार हो रहा है । अपने हक की मांग करने वाले मजदूरो की आज छंटनी की जा रही है । उनका भविष्य अनिश्चित बनाया जा रहा है । अभी माननीय सदस्यो ने विनिवेश और निजीकरण की चर्चा करते हुए मजदूरों की दुर्दशा पर अंगुली उठाई है । मैं चाहूंगा कि सरकार इसके बारे में सोचे कि उसकी नयी नीति के चलते हुए जो मजदूर बेकार हो रहे हैं, ये कैसे काम पर बहाल किए जा सकते हैं, उनकी रोटी का क्या इंतजाम हो सकता है । सरकार सोचे कि जो पसीना बहा करके गन्ना, गेहूं या जो कुछ भी किसान पैदा करता है आज उसको वह अपने पेट भरने लायक नहीं पाता। 5 साल, 4 साल से बकाया रहता है कारखानों का। वह मांगना चाहता है तो उसको गोली मारी जाती है, वह कैसे जिन्दा रह सकता है। दो ही उत्पादक वर्ग हैं देश की अर्थव्यवस्था में - एक किसान और दूसरा मजदूर। क्योंकि राष्ट्रपति महोदय ने किसानों के बारे में गंभीरता से सोचने की बात कही, मैंने उनके भाषण की उसी लाईन को पकड़ करके आपकी खिदमत में और सरकार की खिदमत मे रख दिया। मैं चाहूंगा कि इस पर जरूर चर्चा होनी चाहिए और जवाब भी दिया जाना चाहिए, प्रधान मंत्री जी या नेता सदन या जो कोई भी जवाब दे। यह हो क्या रहा है? तीसरा, जो 100 साल तक आने वाले हिन्दुस्तान के मालिक बनेंगे, स्कूल, कॉलेज में पढने जाते हैं। एक दिन प्रधान मंत्री जी का भाषण हमने अखबार में पढ़ा कि यह जो बच्चों को पढ़ाई दी जाती है, ऊंची पढ़ाई दी जाती है इनसे ज्यादा पैसा लिया जाना चाहिए, अब कम पैसे पर पढ़ाई नहीं होगी। हम किसानों को रियायत देने की बात करते हैं -खाद में, फर्टिलाइजर में, ट्रेक्टर में। कल का आने वाला बच्चा अटल बिहारी बनेगा, गांधी बनेगा, नेहरू बनेगा। अगर उसका दिमाग ही विकसित नही होगा तो वह ठीक से पढ़ ही नहीं सकता क्योंकि वह गरीब का बच्चा है। तो वह गांधी तो बन नहीं सकता, वाजपेयी तो नहीं बन सकता, लोहिया नहीं बन सकता। प्रधान मंत्री जी पांच साल के लिए आए हैं। क्या 100 साल की तकदीर के बारे में आप अपना फार्मूला तय कर देंगे? संविधान के हिसाब से कोई भी सरकार केवल 5 साल के लिए कुर्सी पर बैठती है। लेकिन लोगों के लिए अगले सौ साल के लिए बात की जाती है कि - महंगी शिक्षा नौजवान -आने वाला हिन्दुस्तान। यही दोनों देश के उत्पादक वर्ग हैं। लगता है कि तबाही के आलम में हिन्दुस्तान है। यह काली तस्वीर मैं जान बूझकर खींच रहा हूं न कि सरकार को निराश करने के लिए। यह सच है कि राष्ट्रपति महोदय ने कल्पना चावला को अपनी श्रद्धांजली अर्पित की। एक महान संकल्प की, कुछ नई खोज की तलाश में जान को जोखिम में डालने की हिम्मत रखने वाली महिला की तारीफ हुई है। उसे श्रद्धांजली दी जानी चाहिए। लेकिन उस महान खोज के मामले मे खो गई वह महिला। लड़ाई के मैदान में जो कोई भी अपने मकसद को हासिल करने के लिए मारा जाता है हम उसकी पूजा करते हैं। लेकिन हमको लड़ाई का नतीजा भी तो ढूंढना है कि हम जीतेंगे या नहीं। हम लोग राणा प्रताप की बहुत पूजा करते हैं। उनका संकल्प था कि मेवाड़ वापिस लेंगे और जब तक वापिस नहीं लेते तब तक पत्ते पर खाएंगे। पत्ते पर,खाते रह गए लेकिन मेवाड़ वापिस नही हो सका। हम पूजा करेंगे उनके संकल्प की। लेकिन इस पर बहस नहीं करेंगे कि हम लड़ाई क्यों नहीं जीत पाए, इस पर

बहस नहीं करेंगे कि उस युवती की जान क्यों गई, कहां से खराबी थी। इसके लिए ये कतई तैयार नहीं हैं। हमारा मानस जज्बाती हो जाया करता है जब कोई घटना होती है।

उप सभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मुझे 25 मिनट बोलना है। शाहिद सिद्दीकी साहब हमारे नए मेंबर है, 5-7 मिनट उनके लिए छोड़ेंगे। तो हम चाहेंगे कि जल्दी से जल्दी अपनी बात खत्म करदें। जब 25 मिनट हो जाएं तो आप घंटी बजा दीजिएगा। एक-दो मिनट और खींच सकता हूं, बाकी अपने मित्र के लिए छोड़ दूंगा।

जिस सेंट्रल हॉल में राष्ट्रपति महोदय ने हम लोगों को सम्बोधित किया उसी सेंट्रल हॉल में पोटा कानून पास हुआ था। इस सदन में पास नहीं हो सका था, बगल के सदन में पास हुआ था। सरकार की जिद थी कि पोटा पास करके रहेंगे। तो पोटा कानून पास किया गया। उत्तर प्रदेश में पोटा कानून को लेकर के नंगा नाच हो रहा है। हम किसी सरकार के मंत्री हैं - पहले वाली सरकार के, दूसरी सरकार बनी, तो हमने कहा कि हम इसको गिरायेंगे, इसको चलने नहीं देंगे। इसलिए हम पर पोटा लगा दिया गया है । क्या यह बदले की भावना नहीं कहलाती है ? क्या यह दुर्भावनापूर्ण बात नहीं कहलाती है? उत्तर प्रदेश में जो लोग राज़ चला रहे हैं, उनके बारे में हमको बताया गया कि उन्होंने पांच करोड़ रुपये के हीरों का जेवर पहन लिया है। अपने जन्म दिन पर अफसरों से चंदा उगाहकर के पता नहीं क्या-क्या किया गया ? हम उत्तर प्रदेश में रहते हैं। मुझे आज खबर आई कि कल कुछ लड़के प्रदर्शन करने वाले हैं इसलिए उनकी गिरफ्तारी जिलों में हो रही है। एक जैसी कानून व्यवस्था कहीं नहीं है। यह उत्तर प्रदेश की हालत नहीं है। यह आप लोगों ने गुजरात में भी किया है, अल्पसंख्यकों के साथ किया है। थोड़े से सिरफिरे नौजवान गोधरा मे कोई हरकत कर गए तो उसकी हम सब लोगों ने निंदा की थी। इस सदन मे निंदा प्रस्ताव पास हुआ था। देश को उसने अच्छा नहीं कहा था। लेकिन उसके बदले मे पूरे गुजरात को तबाह कर दिया जाए, यह ठीक नहीं है। आप सत्ता में हैं। सत्ता में बैठे हुए लोग जानते हैं कि इन्सान की सबसे कीमती चीज़ क्या हुआ करती है ? दौलत नहीं, ज्ञान नहीं, वीरता नहीं, कुदरत ने हमको सबसे अलग एक ही चीज़ दी है और वह है हंसी। घोड़ा नही हंसता, हाथी नही हंसता, पेड़-पौधे नहीं हंसते, केवल इन्सान और उसका बच्चा हंसता है। मैंने बिरला के बच्चे को भी हंसते हुए देखा है और झुग्गी-झोंपड़ी में रहने वाले बच्चो को भी मुस्कराते हुए देखा है। हिन्दुस्तान के 20-25 करोड़ लोगों के चेहरे की मुस्कान छीनकर के आप थोड़ी देर के लिए तो गद्दी पर रह सकते हो, लेकिन इस मुल्क को चला नहीं सकते हो। यह मुल्क टूट जायेगा।

मुझे दुख के साथ कहना पड़ता है कि जो लोग आज सत्ता में हैं। हमने राष्ट्रपति महोदय के अभिभाषण को पढ़ा है। उसमें लिखा हुआ है कि पिछड़ो के लिए, कमजोर वर्ग के लोगो के लिए और अल्पसंख्यकों के बच्चों के विकास के लिए सरकार ने कुछ योजनाएं बनाई हैं। मै उसमे आगे पढ़ने लगा तो पिछड़ो के लिए तो था, दलितों के लिए तो था, लेकिन अल्पसंख्यकों के लिए कोई चीज नही थी। हमने कहा कि इसको ऐसे कैसे छोड़ दिया गया। जब शुरू के वाक्य मे लिख दिया गया तो उसमे आगे कहा जाता कि इनकी सुरक्षा के लिए कुछ किया जायेगा, इनकी पढ़ाई के लिए कुछ किया जायेगा। आप उस पैरा को पढ़िएगा, क्योंकि जो बाते मन से नही लिखी जाती हैं, वे छूट जाती हैं। मुझे दुख के साथ कहना पड़ता है कि जो कोई भी दूसरों

के चेहरे की मुस्कान छीनता है, वह इंसान नहीं हो सकता है, वह राक्षस ही होगा। आप इस समय हिन्दुस्तान में आतंकवादियों की चर्चा करते हैं। संसद पर हमले की चर्चा करते हैं। हम अपने संकल्प की चर्चा क्यों नहीं करते हैं। यह कितने दूर का संकल्प है, कितना बड़ा संकल्प है, इस पर अमल करने की हिम्मत क्यों नहीं पड़ रही है । अभी हमारे मित्र नेता विरोधी दल ने, पिल्लई साहब ने ईराक की चर्चा की। हम लोग सदन में फिर चर्चा करेंगे। बुजदिलों के सामने बहादुरी की बात करके, भाषण देकर के या वीर रस की कविता सुनाकर के हम उन्हें बहादुर नहीं बना सकते हैं। आप चर्चा करके क्या करेंगे? चन्द्रवरदाई जब पृथ्वीराज को कोई बहादुरी की कविता सुनाता था तो उसके रोंये खड़े हो जाते थे। यहां पर रोंये खड़े ही नहीं होते हैं, रोंये झड़ गए हैं। क्या करेंगे चर्चा करके ? संसदीय लोकतंत्र का एक तरीका है कि हम बहस किया करें और यदि बहस किया करें तो उससे समाज के लिए कुछ नतीजा निकाला करें। हमको याद है कि स्वेज नहर का राष्ट्रीयकरण हुआ था। उस समय कर्नल नासिर थे। टीटो और नेहरू दोनों ने कहा कि इसने ठीक किया है। लगता था कि वहां पर दुनिया की पलटनें आकर के नासिर को बर्बाद कर देंगी। यह सही है कि दुनिया के कई सौ शहरों में प्रदर्शन हुए हैं। अमरीका युद्ध की तैयारी कर रहा है उसके खिलाफ में । मैं जानबूझकर ढूंढ रहा था कि हिन्दुस्तान में उसके खिलाफ कहीं कोई प्रदर्शन हुआ है। आज अखबार में पढ़ा कि जंतर-मंतर पर और कलकत्ता में थोड़े से लोगों ने प्रदर्शन किया। जैसी सरकार होती है, वैसी ही उसकी जनता भी बन जाती है। पहली मर्तबा जब यह हरकत शुरू हुई, किसी ने कुछ कहा तो प्रधान मंत्री जी ने बयान दिया था कि अमेरिका एक महान शक्ति है । महाशक्ति को महा उदार होना चाहिए, महा संयम बरतना चाहिए । कितना बुज़दिली का बयान है ? हमारे सामने कोई राक्षस तलवार लेकर हमारी गर्दन काटने आ जाए, हम भले ही उससे कमज़ोर हों, हम कहें कि तुम बहुत ताक़तवर हो, तुम्हें दया करनी चाहिए । कितना बढ़िया है ! हमने वह बयान पढ़ा था । हम याद कर रहे थे कि इसी कुर्सी पर जवाहर लाल भी बैठे रहते थे। स्वेज नहर वाला वाक़या हुआ था । उसी तरह की कुर्सी पर टीटो भी बैठे रहते थे । उन सबने ललकार दिया कि तुमने ठीक किया । हम कहां से कहां चले गये ? कभी-कभी यह हिसाब होना चाहिए कि हम कहां से कहां जा रहे हैं । हमें उदार होना चाहिए । अपने मन को टटोलिए कि हिम्मत है । हम यह नहीं कहेंगे कि दुनिया के कितने देश अमेरिका की इस हरकत के खिलाफ आगे आएंगे । पिल्लै साहब ने कहा कि हम हिंदुस्तान में रैली करें। हम रैली करने की बात नहीं करेंगे । संकल्प हो तो हिंदुस्तान इसमें लीड करे और बड़ी से बड़ी ताकत की दादागिरी के खिलाफ सबसे आगे खड़ा हो । संकल्प यह लेना पड़ेगा । एक बार यह लीड आप दे गये तो दुनिया के सारे कमज़ोर आपके पीछे-पीछे चलने लगेंगे कि अगर कभी किसी दादा की आफत आयी तो हिंदुस्तान के लोग हमारी मदद करेंगे । आपने डॉक्टर लोहिया और जय प्रकाश नारायण का नाम लेते हुए पंचायती राज के संदर्भ में कुछ कहा था। राष्ट्रपति महोदय ने भी पंचायती राज के बारे में बात उठायी है । हम लोग लोहिया के ही लोग हैं । शरद जी भी हैं, रामगोपाल जी भी हैं, कौशिक जी भी हैं .....

एक माननीय सदस्य : अटल जी भी हैं ।...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : नहीं । ...**(व्यवधान)**... शरद बुनियादी तौर पर हम लोगों का है और लोहिया का है।

श्री बालकवि बैरागी : आप शरद को निकलवाओगे, मुझे पक्का विश्वास है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : हम निकलवाते नही हैं । लोहिया जी ने केवल पंचायती राज नहीं, चौखम्भा राज की कल्पना की थी । हम चाहेंगे कि राष्ट्रपति महोदय के अभिभाषण में पंचायती राज नही, चौखम्भा राज जोड़ा जाए । चार खम्भे पर जनता की सरकार चलती रहे। दिल्ली - केंद्र, सूबा - लखनऊ जिला वाला इलाहाबाद या जो कोई हो और गांव। गांव, जिला, सूबा और केंद्र, इस तरह का चौखम्भा राज हो । तब जाकर जनता की ताकत उभरा करती है । चौखम्भा में भी कलैक्टर या पटवारी राज वाला रिश्ता नही हो कि दिल्ली कलैक्टरी करे और लखनऊ पटवारीगिरी करे, लेखपाली करे या लखनऊ कलैक्टरी करे और इलाहाबाद लेखपाली करे या इलाहाबाद शहर का कलैक्टर कलैक्टरी करे और गांव का प्रधान लेखपाली करे । सीमाएं बांध देनी पड़ेगी कि किस सीमा तक कौन स्वतंत्रतापूर्वक अपने क्षेत्र का संचालन कर सकता है । उसमें न दिल्ली दखल देगी, न लखनऊ से जिले में कोई दखल देगा और न जिले से कोई गांव मे दखल देगा । सरकारिया आयोग बना था ताकि पटवारीगिरी के रिश्ते, लेखपाली के रिश्ते थोड़ा टूटे । उसका पालन हम नहीं कर पाए । जब यह चर्चा ही होनी है तो खुलकर चर्चा होनी चाहिए कि इन रिश्तो में सुधार आए और बढ़िया किस्म का रिश्ता बने । महोदय, सूखे के संबंध में चर्चा हुई । इस बार सवा सौ साल के बाद इतना भयानक सूखा आया है कि हमारा मौसम विभाग फेल कर गया । फसलें बर्बाद हो गयी, जानवर बिना पानी मरने लगे और आदमी बिना दाना मरने लगे । एक भयानक किस्म की परिस्थिति आयी । आज भी है । आज भी लोग मर रहे हैं लेकिन आज यह तय करना मुश्किल पड़ रहा है कि सूखे की चपेट में जो अभाव आया, उसके कारण भुखमरी से ज्यादा लोग मरे या अब की बार जो सर्दी पड़ गयी, उसके कारण ज्यादा लोग मरे । हम समझ नहीं पा रहे हैं लेकिन आदमी मर रहा है । मरने वाले दोनों ही एक ही बिरादरी के हैं - गरीब - जिनके पास कपड़े नहीं हैं, जिनके खाने का इंतजाम नहीं है । ऐसा नहीं था कि खाना नहीं था, भुखमरी हुई है । जिन दिनों अनाज कम पैदा होता था, उन दिनों भुखमरी हुआ करती थी । अब की बार ज़रूरत से ज्यादा अनाज हुआ तब भी भुखमरी हो रही है । ...**(समय की घंटी)**... पच्चीस मिनट हो गए सर, धन्यवाद ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री नीलोत्पल बसु) : दो-तीन मिनट और बोलिए ।

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : महोदय, इसकी चर्चा कहीं न कही अवश्य होनी चाहिए कि हमारे जखीरे में अनाज पड़ा है। हमारे जखीरे में न भी पड़ा हो, प्राइवेट सैठों के जखीरे में तो पड़ा है और दूसरी तरफ आदमी भूख से मर रहा है । इंसान की ज़िंदगी ज्यादा कीमती है या जखीरे का अनाज ज्यादा कीमती है? इसका फैसला बड़ी आपदा के समय कल्याणकारी सरकार को ज़रूर करना चाहिए और जो सरकार ऐसा नहीं करती, वह सरकार लफ्फाज़ी बात बोल सकती है, कागज़ी गुलाब की खेती राष्ट्रपति जी से करवा सकती है लेकिन आम जनता के बीच में वह दोषी सरकार होगी । धन्यवाद ।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI NILOTPAL BASU): Shri P.C. Alexander. I must tell you before you start that this august category's total

time available is three hours. There are about 12 speakers. So, you get roughly 15 minutes.

DR. P.C. ALEXANDER (Maharashtra): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, thank you very much for inviting me to offer my comments and informing me in advance about the time. I shall certainly conclude my speech within the time allotted to me.

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI RAMA SHANKER KAUSHIK) in the Chair]

This morning, we had the privilege of listening to a very eloquent and learned speech from a senior Member of the House, Dr. Singhvi, moving the Motion of Thanks to the President's Address. The President's Address, in a Parliamentary system of democracy, is not a report card in the sense that the President is reporting to the Parliament about the performance of the Government. It is a self-assessment report where the Government, on its own, makes an assessment of its performance in the last one year, indicates the line on which further action is to be taken on policy issues and on programmes. It is not expected to be a comprehensive report because within the timeframe, that is available, nobody can present a comprehensive report, covering all aspects of Government's policies and programmes. It is intended only to highlight a few areas which should be of interest to the Members of Parliament, and, therefore, to the people as a whole. I thought, in the Address, the President had dealt mainly with the working of the economy and the foreign policy of the country, and had not adequately dealt with a very important segment of our ambitions, aspirations, dreams, and, I would refer to the social sector. There is every reason to be proud of the achievements in the economy taking into account what happens in the world, as a whole, in the last one year, the slow-down of the economy all over the world, the great drought that we experienced in 14 States of the country and the shortfall in agricultural production. In this background, the achievements of the Government, of course, deserves praise and approbation; and that is what the President had done. But, I am of the view that adequate importance should have been given, if not equal, at least adequate importance should have been given to the social sector, particularly, to education and health care. Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, if I am asked to make an appraisal of our achievements during the 52 or 53 years of our Republic and present in a very short form where we went wrong most, I will put my finger on the

social sector. We have immense achievements to our credit in the last half a century of our existence as a Republic. In science and technology, agricultural sector, manufacturing sector, services sector, IT sector, in all these areas we have reason to be reasonably proud of our achievements compared to other developing countries and even compared to certain developed countries. But where we have failed, and failed very miserably, I would say, is in the social sector and because of that failure in the social sector we have not been able to maximise the investments we have made in agriculture, industry, services, etc. I am reminded of the advice which Prof. Strumblin gave to Lenin in 1917. Lenin had drawn up a blue-print of action, big irrigation schemes, dams, heavy industry, etc., and asked for the comments of Prof. Strumblin. He had the courage to reply to Lenin saying, "If you don't match the investment you have proposed in building dams, heavy machinery industry, improving agriculture, etc., with investment in education, all the investment that you have proposed in the economic sector will not yield any benefit to the people". As early as 1917, he warned the founder of the Communist Government in the Soviet Union that investment in education was absolutely necessary, if he wanted to maximise the benefits of investment in industry, agriculture, services and what not. But, unfortunately, in our country, this elementary wisdom has not been translated into practice, in spite of all that we had seen as examples from the Soviet Union itself and Western Europe, which have progressed considerably. Lenin accepted that advice and tremendous improvement was made in their educational system, particularly, in science education. That is why their economy could yield to the maximum extent.

Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, when I speak of the significant omission of education in the President's Speech, I would like to invite your attention to paragraph 49 of the Address. I think about four pages have been spent on Foreign Policy. In fact, it is for the first time in my memory, I find that we have been taken round all the countries of the world just to explain to us what is being done in our relations with Russia, Iran, Gulf countries, United States, Latin America, East Asia and others. While so much importance is being given to the Foreign Policy, which runs into four pages, education is given only half a page. And what do we read there? There is nothing beyond saying that "the nation's commitment to universalisation of elementary education is reflected in our move to make free and compulsory education", etc. It says that University Grants Commission Act will be amended and the UGC will be restructured. I come to the specific point

about our failure in higher education because the UGC has been mentioned here. What is happening today, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, is that the UGC has been reduced to a funding agency for the Central Universities. There are 245 Universities in this country. There are only 17 Central Universities. But, if you look into the money that is being spent and the proportion in which the money is being spent, you will find that the UGC spends about 62 per cent on the non-Plan expenditure of the Central Universities alone. And, another 20 to 22 per cent on the affiliated colleges of the Delhi University. The result is that 16 to 17 Central Universities get the bulk of the funds available with the University Grants Commission. They have an argument. The Ministry of Human Resource Development has an argument that the State Universities are the responsibility of the States. Theoretically, yes, the State Universities have to be funded by the State Governments. But everyone knows today the financial position of the State Governments. To say that they are bankrupt is a minor form of presenting the situation in the States today. Even the States which are considered to be economically at the top, are not able to meet the very basic and elementary demands like paying salaries on the first of the month or giving funds for maintaining roads and buildings or paying the petrol bills for the Government cars. I am not exaggerating as one who has observed things very carefully, I say that the State finances all over India are so much in crisis that to expect them to spend money on the universities is to expect the impossible for the next few years. Unless the new Finance Commission recommends something very radical and throws open new avenues of resources for the States or unless the States themselves change their conventional methods of budgeting and take bold decisions on certain sectors, the States will continue in this sorry plight and who suffers worst, it is education.

If you go to every State and examine the budget, you will find the worst sufferer would be the colleges, the secondary schools, the elementary schools and then, of course, the universities. There are universities which are not able to buy the latest books, which are not able to build up a proper library, which are not able to access information through the modern devices and they are also not able to keep the buildings properly repaired. There is a total ban on filling up vacancies and I am sure this is known to the Members of this hon. House.

No vacancy is allowed to be filled up in most of the universities and they are not allowed even to create the staff for new departments.

Departments are created but there is a total ban on creation of new staff saying that some other posts should be surrendered, if you want to start a new department with new staff. Without exaggerating in any way, this is the position all over India.

The result is that the Delhi University, which is, I am sorry to use the word, pampered compared with some of the best universities in the country, in the State from which I am elected like Mumbai University, Pune University. They were some of the best universities in the whole country. But they are denied funds. And when we represent to the University Grants Commission to change their present policy of funding, introduce a new policy, they say, "we are bound by our charter". When we find out the charter, it permits you to maintain quality education, and quality education cannot be introduced or maintained without financial support, then, they throw up their hands in helplessness.

I have myself written to the hon. Minister saying that the whole system has to be changed otherwise we will have to write off education in this country. We will produce third-rate graduates from second-rate colleges, who will find themselves unemployed because they are also unemployable. There are a few institutions here and there which are able to manage and they are surviving as quality institutions. The point that I am trying to make is, if education is not given the importance that it deserves, we would be failing in the objective which we have placed before us of lifting India to the level of a developed nation in 2020 and that dream may have to be extended further by 20 years more.

Equally sad is the state of health care in the country. Under the Human Development Index criteria we are placed at 134. Many of the Sub-Saharan countries of Africa, are much above us in the HDI. We are a country which produces satellites which go into the stratosphere. We have constituted an Atomic Energy Commission which with the help of other scientists has produced atom bombs. We can do anything that other scientists and technologists are boasting of doing. But, when it comes to health care, our standards are lower than some of the Sub-Saharan countries of Africa. That is why I say that we cannot meet the aspirations or fulfil the expectations of the people unless we give them proper health care and proper educational facilities.

My last point is, no mention has been made in this Address about good governance as an objective. This is a problem which is now looming large like a small speck. I am saying with full sense of responsibility that in many States there is no governance, leave alone good governance. Many States, because of various reasons, are plunged into anarchy. Mafia gangs have taken over and gang wars and caste wars are going on and the administration is just sitting back. In fact, in certain States, particularly in the North-East, I am told that the officers are paying tax to the people to make sure that their houses are not attacked. Good governance even in well administered States, will not qualify for good governance in the correct sense of the term. Good governance means, governance of Governments rooted in values, rooted in ethics and rooted in principles. If the Government does not show an example of being above corruption, or being in control of those who are indulging in corruption, how can we talk of good governance? Corruption in Government continues unabated in a worst form than ever before. We have developed a sort of tolerance to corruption. We have accepted it as inevitable in a system like this. Unless the Government shows its determination to fight corruption in its own house, we will not be able to tell doctors, educationists, businessmen, politicians, etc. that you should not be indulging in corruption. Therefore, I consider this omission about the social sector and about good governance and the determination to fight corruption as a significant omission. I am not saying that I am not joining the Vote of Thanks. With these words of reservation, I join my voice with the Vote of Thanks that is proposed for the President for his Address. Thank you.

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री रमा शंकर कौशिक) : श्री स्वराज कौशल, उपस्थित नहीं हैं । श्री ओबैदुल्लाह खान आज़मी, उपस्थित नहीं हैं । माननीय श्री बालकवि बैरागी ।

श्री बालकवि बैरागी : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैंने आदरणीय डा0 लक्ष्मीमल्ल सिंघवी जी जैसे उद्भट विद्वान वक्ता और विचारक के माध्यम से रखे गए राष्ट्रपति जी के अभिभाषण पर धन्यवाद प्रस्ताव पर जो कुछ बात-चीत चल रही है, जो बहस हो रही है और जो विचार व्यक्त किए जा रहे हैं, उनको गंभीरता से सुना है और मैं कुछ बातों के लिए, विशेष तौर से इस अभिभाषण की विशेषताओं को व्यक्त करते हुए अपनी बात कहूंगा ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, जैसाकि हमारे सदन के विपक्ष के नेता डा0 मनमोहन सिंह जी ने कहा, जनेश्वर मिश्र जी ने कुछ कहा और अलेक्जेंडर साहब अभी-अभी बोल रहे थे, उन बातों से अपनी सहमति व्यक्त करते हुए, उन से अपने को संबद्ध करते हुए मैं कुछ बातों का विशेष रूप से उल्लेख करना चाहूंगा । महोदय, इस पूरे अभिभाषण को आप ने भी वहीं बैठकर सुना है जहां

हम लोगो ने बैठकर सुना है । गए 50 सालो में इस देश में, इस तरह के जितने अभिभाषण हुए, उन में 10 अभिभाषण मैंने स्वयं ने, सामने बैठकर सुने हैं जब मैं उस सदन का सदस्य था तब और जब यहां पर हूं तब भी और मुझे कहने में कोई संकोच नहीं है कि इस अभिभाषण का यदि हम हिसाब लगाएं तो गणित बड़ा स्पष्ट है कि इस में 27 पृष्ठ हैं और आप के प्रयासों की सफलता के लिए शुभ-कामना देता हूं, यह 79वां मुद्दा है। एक और मुद्दा है अंतरिक्ष में शहीद हुई हमारी बहन, हमारी पुत्री कल्पना चावला के बारे में - इन दोनों मुद्दों को निकालकर अगर मैं कहूं तो बहुत विनम्रता और महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी के प्रति पूरी श्रद्धा और सम्मान के साथ कहना चाहूंगा कि यह महज आने वाले चुनाव में एन0डी0ए0 का घोषणा-पत्र है और विशेषकर "भा0ज0पा0" का घोषणा-पत्र है । इस की विशेषता यह है कि यह हमारे देश की संसद के स्वर्ण जयंती वर्ष में दिया गया अभिभाषण है। दूसरी विशेषता यह है कि यह पहली बार इतना लंबा अभिभाषण हुआ, इतना लंबा अभिभाषण हुआ कि तीन व्यक्तियों को मैंने देखा जो कि इसे चुपचाप सुन रहे थे - प्रधान मंत्री महोदय श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी जी, विपक्ष की नेता श्रीमती सोनिया गांधी जी और इस सदन के नेता श्री जसवंत सिंह । ये तीनों लोग चुपचाप सुन रहे थे बाकी सब आपस में बात कर रहे थे । कुछ लोग सो भी रहे थे । इन तीनों ने इस अभिभाषण को जितने मनोयोग से सुना शायद किसी ने नही सुना, लेकिन एक विशेष बात कहना चाहता हूं कि यह पहला अभिभाषण है, मैं नहीं जानता कि इस के पहले ऐसा हुआ या नहीं हुआ ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री राजीव शुक्ल (उत्तर प्रदेश) : आप अपनी बात कहिए ।

श्री बालकवि बैरागी : मैं तो खुद ही बात कर रहा था कि भविष्य क्या है ?

श्री राजीव शुक्ल : डा0 मनमोहन सिंह जी ने भी पूरा भाषण सुना ।

श्री बालकवि बैरागी : हां, सुना, लेकिन लोग इन से बात कर रहे थे, ये किसी से बात नहीं कर रहे थे ।

महोदय, मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूं कि इस अभिभाषण की एक और विशेषता जो दर्ज की जाएगी वह यह है कि इस देश के इतिहास में राष्ट्रपति जी की तरफ से यह पहला अभिभाषण है, जिसे अपनी योग्यता के आधार पर "भारत रत्न" जैसा अलंकरण प्राप्त करने के पश्चात् किसी व्यक्ति ने दिया है । वह व्यक्ति उस भाषण का वाचक बना है। ऐसा पहले कभी नहीं हुआ कि भारत रत्न प्राप्त व्यक्ति ने किसी भाषण का वाचन किया हो, लेकिन जैसा कि हमारे जनेश्वर मिश्र जी ने कहा, वस्तुतः यह कागज पर गुलाब की खेती है । इस में कोई दो राय नहीं हैं । इतना निष्प्राण, इतना निर्जीव और इतना निष्पंद भाषण इस देश के इतिहास में कभी नहीं हुआ । भाई लक्ष्मीमल्ल सिंघवी जी उत्तर देने में बहुत पटु हैं । उन से बहुत सारी बातें सीखी जा सकती हैं और वह कह सकते हैं कि जिन की नाक को जुकाम हो गया हो, उन को खुशबू नहीं आएगी । लेकिन मैं निवेदन करना चाहूंगा कि जिन के नाक ही नहीं है, उन को आप बगीचे में घुमाएंगे तो वह ऐसे ही कागज के फूल पेश करेंगे । इस सरकार की यही स्थिति है ।

महोदय, मुझे कुछ बातें आप से निवेदन करनी हैं । इस अभिभाषण को आप यदि गंभीरतापूर्वक देखें तो जिन मुद्दों को डा0 मनमोहन सिंह जी ने छुआ है, उन मुद्दों को छूते हुए मैं आप से एक बात विशेष रूप से निवेदन करना चाहता हूं कि यह पहला अभिभाषण है जिस में हम उम्मीद करते थे कि महिला आरक्षण के बारे में कुछ बातचीत होगी। इस पर संपूर्णरूपेण महा-महिम राष्ट्रपति जी का मुंह बंद रखा गया है । इस पर या तो वह बोले नहीं हैं या उन को बोलने नहीं दिया गया है । कहीं पर भी इस का जिक्र नहीं है । यदि इस पूरे अभिभाषण को देखें, यह सारा अभिभाषण मेरे सामने है, पृष्ठ 4 पर एक पैराग्राफ में गलती से, प्रसंग की गलती के कारण गांधी नगर में 'गांधी' शब्द आया है वरना इस पूरे अभिभाषण में गांधी शब्द का उल्लेख नहीं है । इसमें आपको कहीं और 'गांधी' शब्द नहीं मिलेगा, जबकि 'गांधी' के देश में राष्ट्रपति महोदय स्वर्ण जयंती के अवसर पर अपना अभिभाषण दे रहे हैं या इस सरकार के द्वारा उनसे बुलवाया जा रहा है । यदि गुजरात के उस शहर का नाम गांधी नगर नही होता तो शायद गांधी शब्द यहां भी नहीं होता ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, इस सरकार के द्वारा जिस बात की बहुत ज्यादा डींग मारी गई, बड़ा ढोल बजाया गया और राष्ट्रपति महोदय से कहलवाया गया, वह यह कि हमने दूर संचार में क्रांति कर दी, लेकिन दूर संचार में क्रांति करते समय यह सरकार भूल गई कि उसकी नींव किसने भरी थी । उन राजीव गांधी के नाम तक का उल्लेख नहीं है, जिसने इसकी नींव भरी थी। आप किस बात के लिए इतरा रहे हैं ? आप अपनी किन ऊंचाइयों पर अकड़ रहे हैं ? उस नींव पुरूष, क्रांति पुरूष के नाम तक का उल्लेख इस अभिभाषण में नहीं कर पाए ? इसके बाद भी आप कहते हैं कि इस अभिभाषण को हम पास कर दें । मैं समझता हूँ कि प्रस्तावक महोदय ने शायद इस बात पर कभी विचार नहीं किया होगा । इस पर आप सौ बार विचार करके सोचें ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, कुछ बातें बहुत स्पष्ट हैं, जो मैंने अपने संशोधनों में भी दी हैं । जैसा यहां अमरीका की दादागीरी के बारे में कहा गया, परसो के दिन यहां पर बात हुई है, आप उसके प्रत्यक्ष गवाह हैं, हम सब चाहते थे कि कल परसो में विदेश जाते समय हमारे प्रधान मंत्री महोदय और हमारे विदेश मंत्री महोदय इस संसद का एक शक्तिमान प्रस्ताव पास करके अपने साथ ले जाएं ताकि वह संपूर्ण देश की बात मानी जाए । लेकिन, बड़ी चतुराई से हमारी संसदीय कार्य मंत्री महोदया ने कह दिया कि हम भावना लेकर के जा सकते हैं, शक्ति लेकर के नहीं जाना चाहते और वे भावना लेकर गए हैं, शक्ति लेकर नहीं गए हैं । आज जब इराक की आंखों में आंखें डालकर यहां बात हो रही है तो हमें किस बात का संकोच है ? क्षमा करेंगे, आप मुझसे उम्र में बड़े हैं, लेकिन मुझे निवेदन यह करना है कि घूंघट में बात करने की क्या आवश्यकता है ? मैं इस देश के प्रधान मंत्री महोदय से पूछना चाहता हूँ । आज तो भारत की मां बहनों ने घूंघट निकालना बंद कर दिया है । इसमें घूंघट में बात करने की क्या बात थी ? स्पष्ट कहना चाहिए कि अमरीका की दादागीरी नहीं चलेगी । शब्दों में दूसरा खेल हो सकता था, लेकिन इराक के मामले में आप किसी भी स्तर पर यह कहने को तैयार नहीं हैं तो मैं समझता हूँ कि जनेश्वर मिश्र जी ने बिल्कुल ठीक कहा है और हमको उनका समर्थन करना चाहिए ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं आपसे कुछ और बातें निवेदन करना चाहूंगा । गत वर्ष जितनी रेल दुर्घटनाएं हुई हैं उतनी कभी नहीं हुई, लेकिन उनका इस अभिभाषण में कोई जिक्र

नहीं है । इसका जिक्र होना चाहिए था । किसानों ने गत वर्ष में जितनी आत्महत्याएं की उतनी आत्महत्याएं इस देश के इतिहास में कभी नहीं हुईं, लेकिन उसका जिक्र भी इस अभिभाषण में नहीं है । राष्ट्रपति महोदय से इस संबंध में कुछ कहलवाया भी नहीं गया । अब या तो हो सकता है कि उनसे कुछ बातें छिपाई गई हों, लेकिन यह तो प्रकट बातें हैं ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं यह भी निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ, आप देख लीजिए पूरे अभिभाषण को, बंगलादेश के संदर्भ में तो आईएसआई का जिक्र किया गया है, लेकिन भारत के संदर्भ में कहीं नहीं किया गया है । कहा गया कि बंगलादेश में आईएसआई घुसपैठ कर रही है, किन्तु भारत में आईएसआई की गतिविधियों के बारे में राष्ट्रपति महोदय को नितांत अंधेरे में रखा गया है । उनसे इस बारे में कुछ भी नहीं कहलवाया गया है । कौन सी ऐसी चीज थी, जिसकी वजह से इसको छिपाया गया है ? इसमें छिपाने की क्या बात थी ? एक कदम आगे बढ़कर मैं कहता हूँ - कब करेगा घोषित इस सरकार वाला देश पाकिस्तान को आतंकवादी देश । आप खुद तो पाकिस्तान को आतंकवादी देश घोषित नहीं करते, लेकिन संसार से कहते हैं कि आप घोषित कर दीजिए, अमरीका घोषित कर दे, दूसरे देश घोषित कर दें । सीमा पार आतंकवाद की बात की जाती है, लेकिन सीमा के भीतर जो आतंकवाद है, उस पर बात करते समय ऐसा लगता है कि इस सरकार को लकवा मार जाता है । यहां पर कहा जाता है, गत वर्ष भी कहा गया था और अभी-अभी मिश्र जी भी बोल रहे थे, प्रधान मंत्री महोदय ने कहा था, तभी खड़े होकर मैंने यहां पर कहा था कि क्या यह आर-पार की लड़ाई है । हंसी आ जाती है, अगर अटल जी कहते हैं कि आर-पार की लड़ाई है । मैंने तब भी कहा था -

आर पार की बातों में भारत को भरमाओ मत ।
आतंकवाद से लड़ना है तो शुरू करो शरमाओ मत ।

क्या शर्म करके आप आतंकवाद से लड़ सकेंगे ? नहीं लड़ सकेंगे । जैसे यह एक बिल्कुल सत्य बात है कि अगर हम एक शूरवीर को एक तलवार दे देंगे तो वह उससे कुछ न कुछ करके दिखा देगा, लेकिन अगर एक कायर को आप वह तलवार दे देंगे तो वह उससे पेन्सिल छीलने बैठ जाएगा या फिर सब्जी काटने के लिए बैठ जाएगा । यही स्थिति इस सरकार की हो रही है कि या तो यह पेन्सिल छीलते हैं या फिर यह सब्जियां काटते हैं। इस देश के प्रति सुरक्षा की बात करने में इस सरकार को पता नहीं कौन-कौन सी दिशाओं को देखकर बात करनी पड़ती है । मैं आपसे निवेदन करूं कि अयोध्या प्रसंग पर बहुत अच्छी बात यहां पर कही गई, विद्वान वक्ता महोदय बोल रहे थे, बहुत ढंग से उन्होंने बात कही । इस तरह से राष्ट्रपति महोदय से कहलवाया गया है जैसे कि मान लो सुप्रीम कोर्ट को वे निर्देशित कर रहे हैं कि जल्दी फैसला कर दीजिए वरना गड़बड़ी हो जाएगी । बस इतना कोष्ठक में और लिख देते तो बात ठीक हो जाती । केवल इतना कहलवाया ही नहीं बल्कि सुप्रीम कोर्ट पर पूरा दबाव डालने की कोशिश की गई और इस कोशिश को समझदार लोग जानते हैं, पहचानते हैं । स्वयं डा0 लक्ष्मीमल्ल सिंघवी इस बात को पहचानते हैं । अभी जब कहा गया कि "सरकार पार्टी क्यों बनी", तब सब दूर एक सन्नाटा था, सब दूर चुप्पियां थीं ।

गुजरात के मामले में गत वर्ष के दंगों का कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया पूरे अभिभाषण में और यह कहा गया कि सब ठीक-ठाक चल रहा है । गुजरात को लेकर क्लीन चिट दे दी गई।

गुजरात मे प्रजातंत्र मजबूत हो गया और प्रतिक्रिया देख रहे हैं, माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, कि भाई लोग गलियो मे खड़े होकर कह रहे हैं कि हम धार को अयोध्या बना देगे । धार को अयोध्या बना देगे, इसका मतलब अयोध्या मे उन्होंने कुकर्म किया था, वैसा वह धार मे भी करना चाहते हैं । हर जगह गुजरात को रिपीट करने की कोशिश होती है और उसके बाद ज्यो ही चुनाव आता है - मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूं, कहना चाहता हूं कि पूरा सदन इस बात को गंभीरता से ले, मैं इल्ज़ाम नहीं लगाना चाहता, मेरा यह विदेचन है कि ज्यो ही कोई चुनाव आएगा ये सरहद पर सेना भेजना की व्यवस्था शुरु कर देगे और ज्यों ही चुनाव निबट जाएगा, सेना वापिस बुला लेगे । जब हमारे सिपाही, हमारी सेना के लोग गत वर्ष सरहद पर गए थे तो भारत माता की जय बोलते हुए गए थे, इन लोगो को धन्यवाद देते हुए गए थे कि हमको ठीक काम के लिए भेजा जा रहा है, लेकिन जब वे वापिस लौटे हैं तो क्या कभी उनसे बात की गई, इनके लोगों ने उनसे बात की ? किस तरह से, किस भाषा मे वे बात कर रहे थे, किसे गालियां दे रहे थे ? वे पाकिस्तान को गालियां नही दे रहे थे, भारत सरकार को गालियां दे रहे थे । इन्होने मनोबल तोड़ा है सेना का और उसके बाद भी कहते हैं कि हमारा ठीक काम चलता है ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूं और बार-बार आपसे कहना चाहता हूं कि ये सारी बाते जो इस सिलसिले में आई हैं, उन बातों पर आप विचार करेंगे तो आप पाएंगे कि यह एक निरर्थक लेकिन एक औपचारिक भाषण है और औपचारिकता के नाते ही यहां पर सारे का सारा यह मामला लिया गया है कि हम इसका समर्थन करें ।

एक करोड़ लोगो को प्रतिवर्ष रोज़गार देने की बात कही गई थी । कहां है यह बात? इस बार के अभिभाषण में उसका उल्लेख कहां है ? कितने करोड़ लोगों को रोज़गार दिया गया है, उसका कोई जिक्र नही है । नदियों को जोड़ने वाली बात की गई थी, लेकिन इन सारे मुद्दों को बड़ी चतुराई के साथ पीछे सरकाया गया है क्योकि इसमें पैसा बहुत ज्यादा चाहिए और आज उस पैसे की व्यवस्था का इस सरकार के पास कोई प्रावधान नही है । इसलिए बड़ी चतुराई से इनको पीछे कर दिया गया है ।

सार्क देशो के बारे में महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी ने बात की है । मैं पूछना चाहता हूं कि एक तो स्वयं हम हैं, फिर पाकिस्तान हमारा दुश्मन और बंगलादेश दुश्मनी की कगार पर खड़ा हुआ है, इस तरह तीन तो हम ही हो गए, बाकी चार देशों के बारे में क्या बात है? सार्क सम्मेलन में हम नही जाएंगे, इतना तक कहना पड़ता है इस सरकार को और उसके बाद भी यदि हम अपनी विदेश नीति पर गाल बजाते फिरें तो फिर आपको सोचना पड़ेगा कि ये किस मुकाम पर देश को ले जाकर खड़ा कर देगे ।...**(समय की घंटी)**... मैं एक मिनट और लेना चाहता हूं ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, इसी कुर्सी पर खड़े होकर, इसी बैंच पर खड़े होकर इस देश के प्रधान मंत्री ने एक अद्भुत बात कही थी जो मुझे आज तक याद है, मेरा मन कसकता है क्योंकि मैं किसानों में काम करता हूं । किसानों ने विपुल पैदावार कर दी तब यहां इस आसंदी पर स्वर्गीय श्री कृष्ण कान्त जी विराजे हुए थे । प्रधान मंत्री जी खड़े होते हैं और कहते हैं "माननीय सभापति महोदय, हमारी सबसे बड़ी समस्या यह है कि किसानों ने बहुत पैदा कर दिया है ।" अब इस देश में बहुत पैदा करना, विपुल पैदा करना भी यदि इस देश की सरकार के लिए

'समस्या' हो जाए तो मैं समझता हूं कि हमें सोचना चाहिए कि आखिर हम किसको सहारा दे रहे हैं । उत्पादन को हम बढ़ाना चाहते हैं या घटाना चाहते हैं ? वितरण की असफलता को क्यों नहीं स्वीकार किया जाता है ? राष्ट्रपति महोदय से वितरण की व्यवस्था पर कोई बात नहीं कहलवाकर इस देश को फिर से अंधेरे में रखने की कोशिश की गई है । लोग भूख से मर रहे हैं, स्वयं इल्जाम लगाते हैं, लेकिन गोदाम भरे पड़े हैं, स्वयं गाल भी बजाते हैं !

मैं एक निवेदन और करना चाहता हूं आपसे । एक प्रदेश है जिसका नाम आप खूब जानते हैं और एक स्थिति है जिसको आप खूब पहचानते हैं । फलोद्यान के मामले में, फल-फूल पैदा करने में हमारे किसानों ने बहुत प्रगति की है, बहुत तरक्की की है और वह भी अपनी खुद की सूझ-बूझ से की है । लेकिन आज भारतवर्ष में फलों के मामले में, उद्यान के मामले में या होर्टिकल्चर के मामले में कुल दो विश्वविद्यालय हैं एक विश्वविद्यालय उत्तर में सोलन, हिमाचल प्रदेश में है और दूसरा विश्वविद्यालय कोयम्बटूर, तमिलनाडु में है । भारत का मध्य क्षेत्र सारा का सारा खाली पड़ा हुआ है, जहां इसका एक भी विश्वविद्यालय नहीं है । आप मुम्बई से लेकर कटक तक चले जाइए, एक भी विश्वविद्यालय होर्टिकल्चर का नहीं है । वहां एक भी हॉर्टिकल्चर का विश्वविद्यालय नही है । मैं इस सरकार से प्रार्थना करता चला आ रहा हूं । मैंने कल भी कहा था और आज भी कहता हूं कि मध्य प्रदेश में मंदसौर में डा. कैलाशनाथ काटजू के नाम पर एक कालेज है, वह अच्छा कालेज है । आप केवल वहां एक कुलपति बैठा दीजिए । वह विश्वविद्यालय की पात्रता रखता है । आप वह विश्वविद्यालय बना दीजिए ताकि बीच के लोगों को न कोयम्बटूर जाना पड़े, न सोलन जाना पड़े । मैं मंदसौर का नाम विशेष रूप से ले रहा हूं। आप देखिए कि इस पूरे अभिभाषण में जो भी हमारे द्वीपीय क्षेत्र हैं, उन द्वीपीय क्षेत्रों के बारे में विशेष रूप से कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है । यदि आप इस अभिभाषण का अध्ययन करेंगे तो पाएंगे कि जितने भी द्वीपीय क्षेत्र हैं, उनके ऊपर सरकार ने कोई विशेष ध्यान नहीं दिया है ।

महोदय, सरकार ने एक चीज राष्ट्रपति जी से कहलवाई है । उसमें सिवाय दिलचस्पी के क्या व्यक्त किया जाए ? राष्ट्रपति महोदय को इस बारे में क्या कहा जाए ? आजकल इस सरकार का फैशन हो गया है कि वह "मुख्य धारा", "मेनस्ट्रीम" की बात करती है । मैं जानना चाहता हूं कि यह "मुख्य धारा" क्या चीज है ? इसका कुछ न कुछ स्पष्टीकरण कर दीजिए ताकि पता चले कि आप इस देश को किधर जोड़ना चाहते हैं ? "मुख्य धारा" से आप क्या कहना चाहते हैं ? किससे जोड़ना चाहते हैं ? नदी के इस किनारे, उस किनारे, किसको जोड़ना चाहते हैं ? बीच में नदी बह रही है और आप कहते हैं कि हम "मुख्य धारा" से जोड़ रहे हैं, किसको जोड़ना चाहते हैं ? "मुख्य धारा" के मामले में इस सरकार की नीति क्या है, नीयत क्या है ? मैं जानना चाहता हूं कि "मुख्य धारा" की इनकी परिभाषा क्या है ? इसको इन्होंने अभिभाषण में स्पष्ट करने की कोशिश नहीं की है । केवल उसका जिक्र करवा दिया है ।

महोदय, मैं आपके एक या दो मिनट और लूंगा । पेयजल के मामले में सरकार ने हम सबको ऊपर वाले की दया के ऊपर छोड़ रखा है । पेयजल के मामले में हम लोग ऊपर वाले की दया पर निर्भर हैं । अगर बादल बरसेंगे तो ठीक है, वरना आप देखते हैं कि हम आज तक पेयजल का मुद्दा यहां उठा रहे हैं । आज सुरेश पचौरी जी ने यह मुद्दा उठाया है । हम कैसे पानी

पिएं ? हम देहातो को बादलों के भरोसे छोड़ देते हैं । यहां पीने के पानी की व्यवस्था हम कैसे करेंगे, यदि इसके बारे में कोई स्पष्ट उल्लेख अभिभाषण में होता तो इसका समर्थन करने में हमे सुविधा होती ।

महोदय, संसदीय प्रणाली में जो गिरावट आने की बात है, जैसा अभी अलैक्जैंडर साहब बोल रहे थे, पार्लियामेंटरी सिस्टम में इस सरकार के ज़माने में कौन सी तरक्की हो गई है? कौन सा बल इनके समय में नहीं चला है? मैं उत्तर प्रदेश को केन्द्र में रखकर बात नहीं करता लेकिन जो कुछ उत्तर प्रदेश में आज हुआ है, उसका परिणाम यह निकल रहा है कि दलितों और सवर्ण राजपूतों के बीच में एक भयंकर गृह युद्ध जैसी स्थिति इस सरकार की नीति के कारण पैदा हो गई है ।

महोदय, ये अयोध्या की बात करते हैं । आपको अयोध्या की बात करना इसलिए शोभा नहीं देता कि एक बहन ने यह कहा कि हमारी सरकार आई तो आप जहां राम मंदिर बनाना चाहते हैं, वहां हम शौचालय बनाएंगे । उन्होंने यह भाषण दिया था । आज उस सरकार से आपका साझा है । मुबारक हो, बधाई हो। आप शौचालय बनाइए, हमें क्या आपत्ति है ? भगवान राम भी उस शौचालय का उपयोग तो करेंगे । इसमें क्या झगड़ा है ? लेकिन उन लोगों के साथ बैठकर जिन मूल्यों पर सरकारें बनाकर चलाई जा रही हैं, उन मूल्यों पर हंसी भी आती है ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, एक इतनी बड़ी गिरावट की बात कर दी गई है । कश्मीर समस्या पर इन्होंने कल एक नयी बात कही कि हमने वोहरा साहब को लगा दिया है । एक चले गए, दो चले गए, तीन चले गए, चार चले गए । अब वोहरा साहब आए हैं, हम उनसे उम्मीद करते हैं । यहां हमारे जितने मंत्री लोग बैठे हैं, इन चार सालों में इस सरकार की सबसे बड़ी देन क्या है, क्या इस पर आपने कभी विचार किया है ? आप जैसा गुणी आदमी विचार करता होगा, सोचता होगा कि इस सरकार की देन क्या है । इन्होंने रूलिंग पार्टी के तीन अध्यक्ष दिए, पांच कृषि मंत्री दिए, दो विदेश मंत्री दिए, दो वित्त मंत्री दिए, तीन नागर-विमानन मंत्री दिए, तीन खनिज मंत्री दिए, चार कोयला मंत्री दिए, एक उप-प्रधानमंत्री दिया । आप देखते होंगे कि ये कैसे नीति बनाएंगे ? ये इस सरकार की स्टेबिलिटी की बात करना तो बंद कर दें । ये इस सरकार के स्थायित्व की बात कैसे कर रहे हैं ? जिस मंत्री से हाथ मिलाओ, लगता है कि वह किसी न किसी विभाग का पूर्व मंत्री है । सबको इन्होंने पूर्व मंत्री बना दिया है । उसके बाद भी श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी कहते हैं कि मेरी सरकार पांच वर्ष तक चलेगी । मैं कहा करता हूं कि आप अपने बेडरूम में बैठकर ताश फेंटकर अकेले खेलते रहे तो बराबर पांच साल तक खेलते रहेंगे, कौन आपको मना करेगा ? लेकिन ये जितने मंत्री यहां बैठे हुए हैं, मेरे पड़ोस में मेरे बड़े भाई राजगोपाल जी हैं, इन्हें खुद आज पता नहीं है कि ये किस डिपार्टमेंट के मंत्री हैं ? कल तक इनके यहां रेल मंत्रालय की गाड़ियां खड़ी रहती थीं, परसों तक कृषि मंत्रालय की खड़ी रहती थी, आजकल डिफेंस मंत्रालय की खड़ी रहती है । भगवान जाने इनका भविष्य क्या है ? मैं रोज सवेरे उठकर हनुमान चालीसा पढता हूं और इनके मंगल भविष्य की कामना करता हूं । उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं एक अंतिम बात कहना चाहता हूं। इस पूरे अभिभाषण में मुझे इस सरकार का कोई प्रतिनिधि, कोई प्रशंसक, कोई प्रस्तावक, कोई समर्थक स्वदेशी शब्द भी बता दे। स्वदेशी से इनका कोई लेना-देना नहीं है। स्वदेशी का इसमें कोई जिक्र तक नहीं है और

इसके बावजूद भी भारत में स्वदेशी की बात की जाती है। माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, किसी भी तौर पर सिवाए कल्पना चावला के अंश और अंतिम अंश जिसमें शुभकामनाएं दी हैं बजट सत्र की, इसके सिवाए इस पूरे अभिभाषण में समर्थन करने लायक कोई स्थिति नहीं है। निष्पंद, निष्प्राण, निर्जीव, निर्गन्ध और नीरस भाषण का मैं विरोध करता हूं और उम्मीद करता हूं कि यह सदन इसको पास नहीं करेगा। बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री रमा शंकर कौशिक) : अब हम कल शुक्रवार दिनांक 21-2-2003 के पूर्वाह्न 11 बजे तक के लिए उठते हैं।

The House then adjourned at one minute past five of the clock till eleven of the clock on Friday, the 21st February, 2003.

MGIPMRND—8357 RS—17-11-2003.